



6 June 2018

Mr Floyd Shivambu
EFF

Dear Mr Shivambu

Reply to your absurd letter

As you well know, I am not a member of the executive and you cannot hold me to account in the way you would a Minister or Deputy Minister. I checked with Adv Frank Jenkins, and I am told I am not obliged to answer your questions; that it's my call really. I am though most certainly accountable to the Committee as a whole, and there is no resolution of the Committee to investigate my relationship (what??) with Mr Momoniat.

But I have nothing to hide! I will in fact answer your absurd questions. The sub-text of your letter and what I hear from others you've said over radio, is to suggest that I'm in some sort of pally-pally, subordination-of-the-parliamentary-committee-sellout-relationship with Mr Momoniat, maybe in cahoots with his (what??) corruption? And the sub-text is that my positions on your behaviour towards him are based on some sort of "Indian South African Brotherhood" (let's leave out the sisters for now!...)...

And the absolute arrogance of requiring me to answer "truthfully"!...

But, first, what do you mean you are writing 'officially'? You mean you, as a member of the Committee, are writing to me? What's "official" about that?? You have no more rights than any other member of the Committee.

What do you mean the "urgency and sensitivity" it "deserves"??? Whose "urgency and sensitivity"?? Yours??

Now to your silly questions:

1. No. I have no personal relationship with Mr Ismail Momoniat! Like many, many others we were involved in the struggle together, but he lives in Johannesburg and I in Pietermaritzburg (now Msunduzi) and our paths hardly crossed except in meetings occasionally. And no, he's not a personal buddy of mine, although I know him overall to be a very decent, nice person. I can't recall ever interacting with him socially, or outside a work relationship, except once.
2. No, I have NEVER EVER travelled on ANY domestic or international flight with Mr Momoniat. Did I meet, let alone plot corruption, with Mr Momoniat while in Washington ever? Actually, I only met him once since attending these meetings since 2015 – while he was chatting with Comrade Charel de Beer, the NCOP Committee Chair this past April in the foyer of a building - and exchanged a few words with him about the Committee's programme (in the presence of Comrade de Beer – yes, I know Mr de Beer is white, but so are Comrades Derek Hanekom and Jeremy Cronin...) Oh, and by the way, I bumped into the Reserve Bank Governor, Lesetja Kganyago, as he came out of the lift in a building and shook his hands – but no, we didn't collude on anything either...

2.1 This question falls away but just in case your imagination gets even wilder:

- No MP can go to any conference or other parliamentary event outside the country without the Speaker's and approval. And in the case of ANC MPs with the approval of the Chief Whip or Deputy Chief Whip.

- Obviously, Parliament paid – usually I’ve been part of a delegation led by Comrade Cedric Frolick representing the Speaker’s Office.
- As you know, I serve on the Board of the Parliamentary Network of the World Bank and IMF (PN). NOT the WB but the parliamentary oversight body! Despite being nominated to stand on the Board for two years running, I refused, and the Board decided to co-opt me. This is with the full knowledge of Comrade Frolick – and I have reported to the Committee on this. And because Board members are put up in the same hotel, the PN paid for my accommodation this past April - but even this had to be approved by the Speaker!
- As you know, I have reported to the Committee on my PN activities and where Comrade Frolick leads the delegation, he takes responsibility for the reports.
- Maybe I’m wrong, but I think it would be a violation of the PFMA for the executive to pay for an MP for an international parliamentary event; certainly, it would conflate the role of parliament and the executive; and I most certainly would not agree to this....
- It would certainly be a crime for Mr Momoniat to pay for my travel – the Treasury is not his personal money-box! What a nonsensical (to use the word you regularly abuse) suggestion!..

Hey, Mr Shivambu, as I once said in the public domain, I’d rather die than be corrupt! So just stop your nonsense!

Now can YOU answer truthfully, just two questions please?:


- Why did you assault that journalist recently?
- Is there any substance to the article in the *Daily Maverick* today by Marianne Thamm and Pauline van Wyk about what partly motivates your aggressive attitude to Mr Momoniat? If not, will you take the matter up in court? If not, why not?

I expect you to consider these questions “given the urgency and sensitivity it (they) deserve”..

I do not feel there is any value in engaging with your letter further; if you do not believe me (and do I care??), you are free to contact Comrades Frolick and Charel de Beer, and also Comrade Jackson Mthembu, to whom I refer our correspondence.

But I’m quite willing to exchange with you, outside my Committee role, in my personal capacity as a Marxist, about non-racialism rooted in African leadership, and the relationship between this and the class, race and gender struggles in South Africa....

Yours sincerely



Yunus Carrim
Chairperson: Standing Committee on Finance

CC: Comrade Jackson Mthembu
Comrade Cedrick Frolick
Comrade Charel de Beer