

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

OF

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 4 DECEMBER 2018

1. The Council met at 09:05.
2. The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.
3. FIRST ORDER [09:06]

Consideration of **Marine Spatial Planning Bill** [B 9D - 2017] (National Assembly – Section 76) and Report of Select Committee on Land and Mineral Resources thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 22 November 2018, p 57).

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Mpumalanga, North West,

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

4. SECOND ORDER [09:10]

Consideration of **Protection, Promotion, Development and Management of Indigenous Knowledge Bill** [B 6D-2016] (National Assembly – sec 76) and Report of Select Committee on Communications and Public Enterprises thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 22 November 2018, p 62).

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Western Cape.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

5. THIRD ORDER [09:17]

Consideration of **Communal Property Association Amendment Bill** [B 12B – 2017] (National Assembly – sec 76) and Report of Select Committee on Land and Mineral Resources thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 68).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Western Cape.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Free State, Gauteng, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, North West.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

6. FOURTH ORDER [09:24]

Consideration of **Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Bill** (B 8D - 2017) (National Assembly – Sec 76) and Report of the Select Committee on Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 203).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Western Cape.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

7. FIFTH ORDER [09:32]

Consideration of Report of Select Committee on Security and Justice (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 148)
Extradition Treaty between the Government of the Republic of South Africa

and the Government of the United Arab Emirates, referred to it in terms of section 231(2) of the Constitution, dated 27 November 2018 with Explanatory Memorandum.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

8. SIXTH ORDER [09:41]

Consideration of Report of Select Committee on Security and Justice (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 148) **Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters between the Government of the Republic of South Africa and the Government of the United Arab Emirates, referred to it in terms of section 231(2) of the Constitution, dated 27 November 2018 with Explanatory Memorandum.**

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

9. SEVENTH ORDER [09:49]

Consideration of Report of Select Committee on Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 159) **Inspection in Loco on Notice of Intervention issued in terms of section 139(1)(b) and (5) of the Constitution, 1996, in Emfuleni Local Municipality.**

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

10. EIGHTH ORDER [10:01]

Consideration of Report of **Ad hoc Joint Committee on PARMED** (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 6).

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

11. NINTH ORDER [10:11]

Consideration of Report of Select Committee on Appropriations (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 22) **Proposed Division of Revenue and Conditional Grant allocations to provincial and local spheres of government as contained in the 2018 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, dated 29 November 2018.**

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Western Cape.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

12. TENTH ORDER [10:23]

Consideration of **Competition Amendment Bill** [B23B - 2018] (National Assembly – sec 75) and Report of Select Committee on Economic and Business Development (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 22 November 2018, p 53).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

13. ELEVENTH ORDER [10:41]

Consideration of **National Research Foundation Amendment Bill** [B 23B – 2017] (National Assembly – sec 75) and Report of Select Committee on Communications

and Public Enterprises thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 22 November 2018, p 58).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

14. TWELFTH ORDER [10:49]

Consideration of **Rates and Monetary Amounts and Amendment of Revenue Laws Bill** [B 37 – 2018] (National Assembly – sec 77) and Report of Select Committee on Finance thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 88).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

15. THIRTEENTH ORDER [10:49]

Consideration of **Taxation Laws Amendment Bill** [B 38 – 2018] (National Assembly – sec 77) and Report of Select Committee on Finance thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 89).

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

16. FOURTEENTH ORDER [10:49]

Consideration of **Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill** [B 39B –2018] (National Assembly – sec 75) and Report of Select Committee on Finance thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 90)

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

17. FIFTEENTH ORDER [11:05]

Consideration of **Critical Infrastructure Protection Bill** [B 22B - 2017] (National Assembly – sec 75) and Report of Select Committee on Security and Justice thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 149).

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill, subject to proposed amendments, be agreed to.

Bill, subject to proposed amendments, accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

18. SIXTEENTH ORDER [11:13]

Consideration of **Films and Publications Amendment Bill** [B 37B – 2015] (National Assembly – sec 75) and Report of Select Committee on Communications and Public Enterprises thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 22 November 2018, p 59).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance.

Question put: That the Bill, subject to proposed amendments, be agreed to.

Bill, subject to proposed amendments, accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

19. SEVENTEENTH ORDER [11:31]

Consideration of Report of Select Committee on Finance (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 27 November 2018, p 168) **2018 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement for the proposed fiscal framework tabled by the Minister of Finance on 24 October 2018.**

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

20. EIGHTEENTH ORDER [11:40]

Consideration of Votes and Schedule – **Adjustments Appropriations Bill** [B 35 - 2018] (National Assembly – sec 77).

Vote No 1 – Presidency – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided.

AYES - 32: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Mhlanga, M T; Mlomo, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Mosala, I; Mthimunye, S G; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, S V; Skhosana, S P D; Wana, T; Stock, D; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 3 – Communications – put

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 4 – Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress, Inkatha Freedom Party

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided.

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomo, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, S V; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 12: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 5 – Home Affairs – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 12: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 6 – International Relations and Cooperation – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 12: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 12:23 AND RESUMED AT 13:39.

Vote No 7 – National Treasury – put and agreed to.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress, Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 14: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 8 – Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress, Inkatha Freedom Party

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 9 – Public Enterprises – put

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress, Economic Freedom Fighters and Inkatha Freedom Party

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Oliphant, G G; Phukuntsi, K; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 14: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 10 – Public Service and Administration – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Prins, E; Phukuntsi, K; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES – 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 11 – Public Works – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress, and Inkatha Freedom Party

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Prins, E; Phukuntsi, K; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES – 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 12 – Statistics South Africa – put and agreed to.

Vote No 13 – Women – put.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress, and Inkatha Freedom Party

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 32: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthimunye, S G; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Prins, E; Phukuntsi, K; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES – 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mathevula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

ABSTAIN – 1: Khawula, M.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 14 – Basic Education – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party and United Democratic Movement.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Mosala, I; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 15 – Higher Education and Training – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress and Economic Freedom Fighters.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 16 – Health – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress, Economic Freedom Fighters, and Inkatha Freedom Party.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Mosala, I; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 17 – Social Development – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, and African National Congress.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 18 – Correctional Services – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, and African National Congress.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 19 – Defence and Military Veterans – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Inkatha Freedom Party.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 20 – Independent Police Investigative Directorate – put

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 21 – Justice and Constitutional Development – put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 22 – Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration – put and agreed to.

Vote No 23 – Police – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Modise, T R; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Mosala, I; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 10: Chabangu, M M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 24 – Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of Democratic Alliance and the African National Congress.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 25 – Economic Development – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 34: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 26 – Energy – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 33: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlomo, F V; Mncube, B; Mohai, S J; Mosala, I; Moshodi, M L; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 9: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 27 – Environmental Affairs – put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 28 – Labour – put

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomo, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 10: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 29 – Mineral Resources – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 37: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 30 – Science and Technology – put

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 31 – Small Business Development – put

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 37: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 11: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B; Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 32 – Telecommunications and Postal Services – put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 33 – Tourism – put and agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 34 – Trade and Industry – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 37: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 12: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Labuschagne, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 35 – Transport – put.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 37: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 12: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Labuschagne, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 36 – Water and Sanitation – put

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

AYES - 36: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makola, A; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Mncube, B; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 37 – Arts and Culture – put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 38 – Human Settlements – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 14: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Koni, N; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B, Terblanche, O S.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 39 – Rural Development and Land Reform – put.

Declarations of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Economic Freedom Fighters.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 40 – Sport and Recreation South Africa – put.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress and the Democratic Alliance.

Division Demanded.

The Council Divided:

AYES - 35: Bayeni, F; De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Mampuru, T K; Manganye, T; Mateme, HE; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Mlomso, F V; Monakedi, M D; Mohai, S J; Moshodi, M L; Motara, T; Motlashuping, T C; Mthethwa, J M; Mthimunye, S G; Ngobeni, P; Nthebe, B; Nzimande, L P M; Oliphant, G G; Parkies, P; Phukuntsi, K; Prins, E; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Sefako, O J; Singh, A S; Sizani, SV; Skhosana, S P D; Stock, D; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 13: Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Labuschagne, C; Magwebu, V; Mathebula, B T; Mokwele, T J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngwenya, D B; Smit, C F B.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Schedule put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

21. NINETEETH ORDER [16;27]

Consideration of **Adjustments Appropriation Bill** [B 35 – 2018] (National Assembly – sec 77) and Report Select Committee on Appropriations thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p 67).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress, Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party and the United Democratic Movement.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

22. TWENTIETH ORDER [16;27]

Consideration of **Special Appropriation Bill** [B 36 - 2018] (National Assembly – sec 77) and Report of Select Committee on Appropriations thereon (Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, 29 November 2018, p52).

Debate concluded.

Declaration of votes made on behalf of the African National Congress, Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party and the United Democratic Movement.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to, in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

23. The Council adjourned at 17:24.

P TYAWA
Acting Secretary to Parliament