HIGH LEVEL PANEL REPORT

ROUNDTABLE REPORT ON STATISTICS ON SOCIAL COHESION AND NATION BUILDING: CAPE TOWN: 25 October 2016

Working Group (WG) 3: Social Cohesion and Nation Building

1. BACKGROUND

The roundtable was convened in Cape Town for Working Group 3 on Social Cohesion and Nation Building on 25 October 2016, and chaired by Judge Navi **Pillay**. The High Level Panel's members, stakeholders and parliamentary research support staff who attended the roundtable meeting were:

- Dr Yvonne **Muthien**;
- Prof Vivienne **Taylor**;
- Dr Ntsiki **Tshayingca-Mashiya**: DDG: Institutional Performance: Monitoring and Evaluation, Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME);
- Dr Stanley **Ntakumba**, Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), Chief Director: Capacity Development and Knowledge Management;
- Dr Pali **Lehohla**: Statistician-General, Statistics South Africa (SSA);
- Mr. Steven Lawrence **Gordon**: Democracy, Governance and Services Delivery (DGSD) Unit, Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC);
- Mr. Jan **Hofmeyr**: Programme Head: Policy and Analysis Programme, Institute of Justice and Reconciliation (IJR);
- Dr Buntu **Siwisa**, ACCORD, Senior Research Fellow;
- Ms Nadia **Dollie**, Parliamentary Research Staff member;
- Mr Teboho **Thebehae**, Parliamentary Research staff member;
- Dr Hlengani **Baloyi**, Parliamentary Research staff member; and
- Ms Anastasia **Slamat**: Parliamentary Research staff member.

Introductory Remarks: Judge Navi Pillay

The mandate of the High Level Panel on the Assessment of Key Legislation and the Acceleration of Fundamental Change is derived from the Legacy Report of the 5th democratic Parliament of the Republic of South Africa (2009 – 2014). Stakeholders responsible for the mandate of the High Level Panel are the South African Speakers' Forum, composed of the speakers of the legislatures of the nine provincial governments, and the Parliament of the Republic of South Africa. The work of the High Level Panel seeks to assess the extent of the impact of laws, legislation and policies on the lives of ordinary South Africans in the following three areas: (i) Poverty, inequality and unemployment (Working Group 1); (2) Land reform, land restitution and redistribution (Working Group 2); and (iii) Social cohesion and nation building (Working Group 3). In that way, the work of the High Level Panel strives to evaluate, measure and monitor the triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality.

The methodology with which the High Level Panel seeks to assess the impact of laws, legislation and policies on these three areas are:

- Call for submissions from the public;
- Public hearings conducted throughout the nine provinces of South Africa;
- Round table / stakeholders' presentations and discussions;
- Commissioned research;
- Desktop research on primary and secondary materials; and
- Government departmental presentations (these form part of the roundtables / stakeholders' fora).

2. OVERVIEW OF ISSUES RAISED

- Trends on race relations;
- Trends on nation building;
- Other trends on social cohesion and nation building;
- Demographic dynamics;
- Migration patterns;
- Poverty reduction;
- Services delivery;
- Housing;
- Immigration patterns;
- Education;

- Unemployment;
- Trends on immigration and xenophobia;
- Trends on racism; and
- Sources of social division.

3. THEMATIC AREAS

STAKEHOLDER PRESENTATIONS

PRESENTATION 1: Dr Ntsiki Tshayingca-Mashiya: Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DDG: Institutional Performance: Monitoring and Evaluation, Department of Planning

- <u>Trends on Race Relations</u>:
- Approximately 28 per cent of South Africans believe that race relations are improving. Among those, about 52 per cent describe themselves as South Africans first (rather than by culture, race etc.).
- About 73 per cent believe that relations between different races in South Africa remained the same since 1994, or have regressed.
- Around 20 per cent of South Africans sampled used indicators of race, language and culture to describe themselves.
- On friendships and associations between different racial groups, in 2013, the levels rated stood positively at 70 per cent, and by 2013 they had declined to 60 per cent.
- Approximately 28 per cent of South Africans sampled in 2013 believe that race relations are improving, compared to 75 per cent in 2000.

Notes: Surprisingly, in almost all the provincial public hearings, with the exception of KwaZulu-Natal, trends and concerns on race relations were barely raised as stand-alone concerns. They were highlighted as contributors or instigators to certain and particular disturbing social and economic concerns. To that effect, they tend to draw attention insofar as they negatively alter people's quality of lives in particular areas within the realm of social

justice. This is perhaps an indication of almost non-existent relations between race groups in South Africa outside work and civic places of interaction.

Trends on Nation Building:

- About 71 per cent agreed on the need for celebrating democracy and freedom after over twenty years of its achievement.
- 53 per cent of South Africans sampled believe that government is performing well.
- In 2013, approximately 58 per cent of South Africans sampled are confident about a happy future for all races, as compared to 85 per cent in 2004.
- In 2015, about 52.8 per cent of South Africans sampled described themselves as South Africans first. However, about 86 per cent of South Africans sampled in 2016 indicated that they were proud of being identified as South African.

Other Trends on Social Cohesion and Nation Building:

- About 42.5 per cent of women are in legislative bodies in 2014.
- In employment equity: Africans accounted for only 41.2 per cent in management, and 21.2 per cent in senior management positions.
- In 2004, about 85 per cent of South Africans sampled were confident about a happy future in South Africa, and in 2013, 58 per cent are optimistic about South Africa's future.
- About 82 per cent of South Africans sampled agree that there is a need to examine the concept of *ubuntu* / community caring. Sense of Ubuntu/community caring - 82% agree but need to delve into what means – and all define differently.

Notes: Compared to challenges on social cohesion, there have been negligible references, direct or implied, to nation building challenges coming through provincial public hearings. Thus far, the threat of foreigners, perceived or real, on access to resources and opportunities seem to loom large as one of the challenges to nation building. Assessing from the provincial public hearings, people seem more concerned with quality of life and social justice concerns. Challenges to national pride and attachment to South African national values, reflected in the Constitution and elsewhere, seem less of a concern. This is perhaps a reflection of the decline in inter-racial interactions, which renders nation building concerns

less apparent. Also, on many occasions, social cohesion and nation building in public hearings seem to be referred to interchangeably.

PRESENTATION 2: Dr Pali Lehohla, Statistician-General, Statistics South Africa (SSA)

The RDP Promise: Conversations on a Better Life: Community Survey 2016

Demographic dynamics:

- The notion that the South African population is growing at an exponential rate is incorrect. Children born per woman is declining. It is not growing at a rate that it is supposed to, and the fertility rate is declining. Thus we do not face a population growth problem, but rather the challenge is in the quality of investment in our population.
- Child mortality rate has declined nationally, as a result of improvements in services delivery on electricity, hygiene, water, etc.
- Life expectancy is rising nationally, to 61 years today, although there are differences provincially, e.g. Limpopo (64 years); Eastern Cape (59 years); Western Cape (70 years).

Migration patterns:

- Gauteng province is growing faster, as in-migration from other provinces and internationally is a big demography-characteristic component of Gauteng.
- Growth in the Messina area is attributable to the immigration of Zimbabweans into South Africa, and many settling in Limpopo.
- Internal migration - urban migration even of children (0-14) into Gauteng- movement of children who are in school- parents who are making these schooling choices.
- Elderly black people migrating back to where they come from particularly back to KwaZulu-Natal and Limpopo.
- Migration of population in provinces is a big challenge and a pattern visible in South Africa.
- Migration: largely to Gauteng.
- There is a huge migration to urban centres.

- Demographic movement patterns of South Africa, as compared to apartheid era, have not changed.
- Reasons for migrating out: new homes; marriage; new job; etc.

Notes: The out-migration pattern, arising out of lack of opportunities and lack of coordination on skills development geared towards landing employment opportunities, is particularly expressed in the Free State province. There, it is an out-migration pattern particularly leading to Gauteng, Western Cape and Eastern Cape provinces. Remedial actions identified here are on improving strategies in skills development and resource mobilisation for youth, arts and culture practitioners in the Free State Province.

Poverty Reduction:

- There is reduction of poverty but inequality has increased. Thus, the headcount of poverty has been reduced, but poverty intensity has increased (e.g. City of Johannesburg).
- Poverty by municipalities: poverty reduction, started at 60 per cent in 1994, and is now standing at 24 per cent in 2016. There is therefore marked poverty reduction. However, inequality has increased. Although poverty by headcount has been reduced significantly, the challenge is on the intensity of poverty. "We can move the poverty headcount but what has not moved is the poverty intensity and this comes from education not from houses, electricity, etc., and the budget needs to reflect this." – Dr Pali Lehohla.

Note: In the assessment from all the provincial public hearings, concerns on poverty are expressed through its main cause: unemployment; lack of employable skills among youth; and lack of coordination between career development and the career choices students undertake post-matric. Poverty is therefore not identified in any lack of service delivery or material provision, provision, but through lack of employment opportunities.

Services Delivery:

- There is a difference between access to municipal services delivery, and the levels of satisfaction of services delivery. So, in certain municipal areas, access to services delivery is high, but satisfaction levels are low, e.g. eMalahleni in Mpumalanga Province.
- Access to electricity in 1996 stood at 58 per cent nationally, and increased to 89 per cent by 2016. However, some places remained where they were, e.g. areas in KwaZulu-Natal, which show low satisfaction levels.
- Some perceived municipal challenges are on:

- o Lack of safe and reliable water supply;
  - o Lack of employment opportunities; and
  - o Cost of electricity
- Sanitation – 6% (decrease).
- Water (reduced to 6% from 7%).
- Sanitation has gone down, from 7in 2001 and 2011, to 6 in 2016.
- Assets have decreased from 7in 2001, to 5 in 2011, and to 3 in 2016.

Notes: Assessments from provincial public hearings indicate discontent, though at a low rate, at the qualitative provision of services delivery on health (staff shortage and inadequate training – Eastern Cape and Northern Cape provinces); education (teacher-training development and misuse of school facilities – Eastern Cape and Northern Cape provinces). Some of the complaints on the misuse of school properties (in the Eastern Cape) are associated with disruptive and delinquent behaviour of youth as a result of drug abuse; alcohol abuse; youth unemployment; and lack of monitoring / supervision after hours of these facilities.

There has been little reference to services delivery backlogs in all the provinces, with the exception of the Eastern Cape, which has a particularly high volume of housing delivery backlogs due to alleged corruption practices. Actions suggested to remedy these backlogs and challenges are identified as institutional gaps in implementation mechanisms, and not in legislation pieces. These statistics, therefore, largely confirm assessments from the provincial public hearings.

Housing:

- Housing: there is ever-increasing demand on urban housing because of unbundling of families. Children move away from their households to start their families in their own homes, and as a result demand their own houses. There should therefore be a determined disaggregation of age limits, in that houses should be provided for adults, while children, through investment in education, will resolve their own resources and material needs and challenges.
- Urban housing densities are less: in urban areas, it is 3.5 urban areas to 3.2 people per house in urban areas, and about 3.4 people per house in rural areas.

- There is no correlation in the provision of housing with the need for housing, because there is no urban planning. Secondly, there are many houses which have been provided, and yet there is little house densification in housing in the urban areas.
- There is no country like South Africa which has provided so many houses, and yet the demand is ever-growing for housing. There is insufficient population growth, and yet the number of houses is increasing, leading to wasteful housing, as there is no adequate and effective urban planning, leading to urban sprawl.

Notes: Housing concerns are mainly expressed in the form of backlogs in the delivery of RDP houses, mainly in the Eastern Cape and Northern Cape provinces. In the Eastern Cape, the major component of the population who expressed concerns over backlogs in the delivery of RDP houses were young women who seemed to head their own households (early twenties to early thirties). These backlogs are due to alleged corrupt practices and patronage systems extended, owned and managed by municipal and ruling party officials. In the Northern Cape, there were some concerns raised on the over-inhabitation of RDP houses, and this linked with unemployment; misuse of social grants; alcohol and drug abuse.

Immigration patterns:

- Statistically, migration from neighbouring countries (e.g. Lesotho, Zimbabwe, Malawi, Mozambique, etc.) into South Africa is low in numbers, as compared to perceptions and anecdotal evidence.. This emigration pattern therefore contributes negligibly to urban densification.
- Discontent concerning foreign settlement in urban areas is a result of foreigners migrating to areas where their kinfolk have settled, and so their visibility creates discontent.
- There is no statistical evidence of foreigners threatening South Africans' access to limited resources and opportunities. This is therefore a perceived threat by foreigners.

Notes: Concerns over the role and space that foreigners allegedly take reverberates in all the provinces, but at a low rate. They all relate to contestations over business, work and tender procurement opportunities. In the Eastern Cape Province, there was a suggestion on the review of legislation and policies on the monitoring of the entrance of foreigners into the country.

<u>Education</u>:

- Lack of educational facilities.
- Acquiring education is only priority number 18 in the country, except in KwaZulu-Natal.
- Proportion of matric graduates who attain a bachelor degree per race: Black / Africans and Coloured, dropped from 15 per cent in 1980 to 5 per cent in 2016; Indian / Asian increased from 13 per cent in 1980, to 18 per cent in 2016; Whites increased from 18 per cent in 1980 to 25 per cent in 2016.
- There is an increasing number of white youth at university, while black youth are increasing also but still proportionally smaller compared to white youth.
- Youth unemployment is increasing, unless we address the dividend of education.
- Graduate unemployment is low, standing at 9.8 per cent for black people, and at 2.1 per cent for white people.
- There is a significantly huge decrease of performance among African university students.

Notes: Challenges on education in all the provinces could be ranked low to medium, measured against the repetition of the mention of the concerns and their severity. Many concerns over education relate to how it should be linked to skills-betterment, and ultimately oriented to employment goals. Policy and legislation suggestions, although broad in outline, point to the need for optimal and effective use of FETs and other artisanal higher education institutions.

<u>Unemployment</u>:

- Unemployment is the key driver of poverty, increasing by 12 per cent from 2011. It is accelerating as a driver of poverty.

PRESENTATION 3: Mr. Steven Lawrence Gordon: Democracy, Governance, Services Delivery (DGSD) Unit, Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC): In Thought and Deed

<u>Trends on Immigration and Xenophobia</u>:

- South Africa hosts more international migrants than any other sub-Saharan African country - 3.3 million, but still this is a small share of the population of the country.

- The first outburst of xenophobic violence, deemed 'Operation *Buyelekhaya*', occurred in December 1994, in Alexandra Township, Johannesburg. Residents of Alexandra Township had marched to their local police station, demanding that Zimbabweans, Mozambicans and Malawians return to their countries of origin.
- Next xenophobic violence broke out in 2008, and left 62 people dead, and more than a hundred displaced.
- Xenophobia is not unique to South Africa. It is an international phenomenon, stretching and affecting Europe and North America.
- Xenophobia in South Africa is linked to economic competition and growing social distrust within South African communities.
- The most recent violent xenophobic outburst occurred in April 2015.
- There is no statistical evidence supporting the belief that foreigners compete for / steal jobs and opportunities naturally reserved for South African nationals.
- Studies and findings show that many local people are exposed to many foreigners, and do not feel threatened by them.
- What are the predictors which drive people to a willingness to engage in violence or past violent engagements?
- Gender and age are not statistically significant predictors (versus media representation that focus on young men)
- Population group was statistically significant.
- Wide range of indicators - education, asset ownership, political orientation etc., but the model only explains 7 per cent of variants. Thus cannot be explained by most standard indicators. This points to factors that the model does not capture.
- Thus attitude and behavioural relationship patterns are important. Attitudes mediate external and internal factors. People could harbour prejudice without it manifesting in violence.
- Concludes that the holding of anti-immigrant sentiment has correlation with behaviour and intention. Thus the best way to prevent an outbreak of violence and ensure social cohesion is to tackle the stereotypes prevalent in certain groups in society.

PRESENTATION 4: **Jan Hofmeyr: Programme Head: Policy and Analysis Programme, Institute of Justice and Reconciliation (IJR)**

Trends on Race and Reconciliation:

- The meaning of reconciliation: no reconciliation without material restitution. A reconciled society remains unachievable for as long as there are material inequalities. Emphasis on inequality remains, and is getting wider.
- Approximately 61.4 per cent of South Africans surveyed feel that race relations since 1994 have either stayed the same, or deteriorated. On the desirability and possibility of racial reconciliation, 73 per cent feel that it is desirable, and 64 per cent believe that it is possible.
- On progress with reconciliation, 59 per cent of the South African sample surveyed feel that progress has been made.
- More than 70 per cent of the South Africans sample surveyed agreed that reconciliation is needed and across racial groups.
- There are generally low levels of trust among different racial groups of people in South African, and between South Africans and foreigners.

Trends on Racism:

- Frequency of experience of racism - a total 60.2 per cent experienced racism at some point during the year in 2013. About 12 per cent experience it all of the time, and more than a one-third had never experienced racism.
- About 38.9 per cent of South Africans surveyed feel that race relations have improved since 1994, while 23.2 per cent believe that it has deteriorated.
- On trust levels, approximately 67 per cent of South Africans surveyed believe that there is little to no trust of other racial groups.

Notes: Strong concerns on disturbing racist behaviour from the provincial public hearings have so far only emerged in KwaZulu-Natal, where they led to physical abuse and deaths. Many racist behavioural patterns coming out of provincial public hearings are associated with institutional discrimination, negatively affecting people's quality of life in the workplace, communities and in public political environments.

Sources of social division:

- Primary source of social divisions is inequality between the rich and poor.
- Reconciliation is impossible if the disadvantaged remain poor. About 61 per cent of South African sample agree on this.
- On perceived change in economic inequality since 1994, 36.5 per cent of the South African sample surveyed think that economic inequality has worsened.
- Access to basic necessities is differentially racially-based.
- On Interaction between different race groups, they are not exposed each other. The least interaction takes place in social spaces like homes, churches etc.
- South Africans who report highest levels of interracial contact or the inverse are those in the highest LSM categories, i.e. rich, working and educated.

4. POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE IMPLICATIONS

- **Integrated Development Plans (IDPs)**: in the delivery of basic municipal services, are IDPs relevant, as it seems that other policies are more relevant?

- **National Development Plan (NDP)**: should be reoriented in the rethinking of policies aimed at poverty reduction.

- **Ingonyama Trust Act**: there are serious concerns raised in KwaZulu-Natal on the role of the Ingonyama Trust Board, tantamount to allegations of corruption practices and lack of consultation with traditional leaders on development issues. This threatens social cohesion in the rural lands the Ingonyama Trust Board administers.

- **Traditional Leaders and Governance Act**: the Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs Department has raised concerns on the leadership mandate, functioning and roles of traditional leaders in enabling social cohesion and nation building.

6. DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Roundtables)

- Establishing constitutional values of non-sexism and non-racism still has a long way to go to entrench themselves.

- A need for initiatives driven by government to drive social cohesion and nation building.

- Public managers / civil servants: change their thinking on the need they need to play in driving social cohesion and nation building.

- Relook at structures of roles of public managers in government to support social cohesion and nation building.

- Great need to change mind-sets of citizens at all levels. There is a need to explore ways to active social cohesion and nation building through changing people's mind-sets.

  There is a need for the participation of the private sector in social cohesion and nation building campaigns. This will make them more effective.

- Civil servants are not motivated to mobilise South Africa to be united; there is therefore a need to work on transforming their thinking/work ethos, as key agents of service delivery.

- There is a need to ensure that graduates chose the right programmes in terms of what is needed.

- Social contracts needed to ensure more harmony (change the mind-set at all levels).

- There is disjuncture in society about what the priorities are and what they should be. Unless we get these priorities right as articulated in the National Development Plan (NDP) we will not get anywhere. Articulations in the NDP and the Reconstruction and Development Plan (RDP), to consolidate on human resources, economy and on social facilities, have been provided to most to move people out of poverty. However, these policies cannot reduce the intensity of poverty.

- Services delivery and students protests: statistics on services delivery show improvement over time. Statistics on water services delivery, sewerage services, are

going down. Measurement challenges is in classification of services delivery from normal labour disputes and students revolts.

- Need to relook on what defines us as South Africans, as there are new terrains of redefining the struggles in post-apartheid South Africa.
- Need to link surveys and results to relevant legislation.

7.   ISSUES TO REFER TO OTHER WORKING GROUPS

- Ingonyama Trust Board / Act: Working Group 2.
- IDP concerns: Working Group 1.

ENDS/