10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 1 of 175

THURSDAY, 10 MARCH 2016

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:00.

The House Chairperson (Ms A T Didiza) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see col 000.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms M O MATSHOBA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the means geared at finding long-term solutions to the challenges facing funding for postschool education.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 2 of 175

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House debates the spate and high incidence of service delivery protests across the country.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the increasing scourge of corruption particularly in Gauteng, which according to a report released by the Corruption Watch yesterday, has the highest levels of corruption in South Africa.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House debates the exploitation of sexworkers by police officers.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 3 of 175

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the strengthening of support to the struggle for national self-determination and a multilateral approach to the management of global issues.

Dr M J CARDO: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the link between this government's failure to provide economic policy coherence and our country's low growth rate and high unemployment rate.

Mr P G MOTEKA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the misuse and misdirection of 15% of municipal infrastructure grant, MIG, money meant for sports by municipalities.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 4 of 175

Ms N N MAFU: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the human rights in the context of building a national democratic society underpinned by the vision of a nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and a prosperous South Africa.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House deliberates on the challenges faced by thousands of women as a result of errant fathers failing and or refusing to pay maintenance, exploiting the weaknesses in the system.

Ms A MOLEBATSI: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates strengthening the call for the reform of the multilateral institutions, such as the United Nations

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 5 of 175

Security Council, to give greater voice to developing nations and reflect a more, just and equitable world order.

Mr L K B MPUMLWANA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the reduction of provinces from nine to three in order to save money, to redress the evils of racism, tribalism and regionalism as well as to promote social cohesion. Maybe KwaZulu-Natal, Free State and Mpumalanga could merge; Eastern Cape, Western Cape and Northern Cape could merge with the North West and Limpopo merges with Gauteng.

Dr H C VOLMINK: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the Ministerial Task Team's report about the failing state of the Health Professions Council of SA and the devastating impact that this dysfunction has had on health service delivery in our country.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 6 of 175

Mr B M BHANGA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the ANC's failure to spend half a billion rand on much needed new schools in the Eastern Cape.

WESTERN CAPE POLICE ARREST FOUR ON DRUG RELATED CHARGES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chair, on behalf of the NFP I move without notice:

- (1) notes that on Wednesday, 9 March, Western Cape police arrested four suspects two men aged 21 and 39 and two females aged 41 and 48, on charges of dealing in drugs, in Muizenberg;
- (2) further notes that the arrests were made after the

 Western Cape Flying Squad reacted to information from a

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 7 of 175

reliable source about drugs being transported from Johannesburg to Cape Town;

- (3) also notes that tik valued at R8 400 and mandrax worth R1,5 million were confiscated;
- (4) congratulates the Western Cape police for their diligence and swift action in preventing the drugs from reaching the streets; and
- (5) encourages the SA Police nationwide to continue their relentless quest to rid our country of the scourge of drugs.

Agreed to.

SA HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION FINDS SANITATION INADEQUATE IN CITY OF CAPE TOWN

(Draft Resolution)

Ms R M M LESOMA: Hon House Chair, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 8 of 175

That the House -

(1) notes and feels vindicated by the recent findings made by the SA Human Rights Commission that sanitation in the City of Cape Town is inadequate;

- (2) further notes that an investigation by the commission confirms that the City of Cape Town has failed to provide decent sanitation to the people living in an informal settlement;
- (3) also notes that two weeks ago members of the commission in the company of the Social Justice Coalition visited

 Khayelitsha and witnessed how people depend on portable toilets which are not regularly cleaned;
- (4) recognises that the people of Khayelitsha told the commission that they have been subjected to such conditions in the city that is controlled by the DA, which has failed to come up with proper planning to address sanitation issues;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 9 of 175

(5) acknowledges that this is clear evidence of the failure in the Western Cape and the DA administration to deliver decent basic services to poor communities;

- (6) further acknowledges that the DA government has failed to prioritise community development imperatives, instead maintaining white middle class privileges and interests; and
- (7) strongly believes that indeed it is a myth that the

 Western Cape is the best run province in the country and
 that we are determined to unseat them in the City of Cape

 Town.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: We object most vehemently.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You were very late in objecting. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] No, we don't do that.

There being an objection, the motion without notice becomes a notice of motion.

WORLD KIDNEY DAY

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 10 of 175

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: House Chair, on behalf of the IFP I move without notice:

- (1) recognises World Kidney Day on 10 March and that the theme for 2016 is, Kidney disease and children - act early to prevent it;
- (2) acknowledges that the purpose of World Kidney Day is to raise awareness of the importance of our kidneys to our overall health and to reduce the frequency and impact of kidney disease and its associated health problems worldwide;
- (3) further acknowledges that the objectives are to:
 - raise awareness about our kidneys, highlight that diabetes and high blood pressure are key factors of chronic kidney disease, CKD;
 - (b) encourage preventive behaviours;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 11 of 175

(c) educate all medical professionals about their key role in detecting and reducing the risk of CKD, particularly in high risk populations; and

- (d) stress the important role of local and national health authorities in controlling the CKD epidemic; and
- (4) calls on all health authorities nationwide to make certain that they spread awareness of the dangers of silent killers such as these and to take action to invest in further kidney screening.

Agreed to.

SUCCESSFUL VOTER REGISTRATION DRIVE

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Hon House Chair, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 12 of 175

(1) congratulates the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, on the spectacular success of the voter registration drive last weekend;

- (2) notes that according to the IEC there were 693 000 new registrations and of these approximately 79% were of people under the age of 30;
- (3) further notes that according to figures provided approximately three million South Africans visited voter registration stations around the country;
- (4) acknowledges that the overwhelming turnout is evidence that the people of South Africa heeded the call that local government is in their hands and through registering to vote they will advance people's power; and
- (5) also congratulates the IEC on a job well done.

There being an objection, the motion without notice becomes a notice of motion.

FRANZISKA BLÖCHLIGER BRUTALLY MURDERED IN TOKAI FOREST

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 13 of 175

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, on behalf of the IFP I move without notice:

- (1) extends its deepest and heartfelt condolences to the Blöchliger family following the sudden tragic loss of their daughter, Franziska, in Tokai on Monday, 7 March 2016;
- (2) notes that the Constantia Waldorf School learner went jogging with her mother and her younger sister in the Tokai forest on Monday afternoon, where she was attacked and brutally murdered;
- (3) further notes that the young girl whose life was cut short on the afternoon of 7 March 2016 has been remembered by all those who knew her as a kind and loving person who contributed hugely to the social fabric of her school;
- (4) expresses its deepest concern with the ever growing levels of violent crime in South Africa which robs families of

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 14 of 175

their loved ones on a daily basis and which has left many South Africans living in a perpetual state of fear;

- (5) appreciates the efforts made by the SA Police Service, which has already led to the arrest of three people in connection with this heinous murder;
- (6) calls for the harshest sentences possible to be imposed on those found guilty of this crime; and
- (7) thanks all South African citizens who have shown solidarity with the family, knowing that our citizens must unite against crime.

Agreed to.

HAWKERS FROM IDUTYWA PREVENTED FROM TRADING

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T RAWULA: I rise on behalf of the EFF to move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 15 of 175

(1) notes that hawkers from Idutywa were removed from facilities where they were conducting their trade as self-employed small business people;

- (2) further notes that when hawkers were removed, the Mbhashe

 Local Municipality failed to provide alternative

 facilities for them to sell their fruits and vegetables;
- (3) acknowledges that most, if not all hawkers depend entirely on their trade to feed their families, send their children to school and look after their families;
- (4) further acknowledges that without their trade there are children who are going to bed hungry.
- (5) also acknowledges that it is only municipalities under the leadership of the EFF that will build proper, clean and decent infrastructure for hawkers to conduct their trade and feed their families;
- (6) calls on the Mbhashe Local Municipality to treat hawkers from Idutywa with dignity and respect, as they are only trying to put food on the table to feed their own families; and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 16 of 175

(7) also calls on the municipality to provide decent alternative infrastructure where hawkers will be able to conduct their trade.

There being an objection, the motion without notice becomes a notice of motion.

FOUR MOKOENA FAMILY MEMBERS DIE IN SEBOKENG HOUSE FIRE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

- (1) notes with great sadness the death of the four Mokoena family members who died in a house fire in Sebokeng, Zone 14, in the early hours of Saturday morning, 5 March 2016;
- (2) further notes that three family members died inside the burning house, whilst a baby who was rescued from the burning house and rushed to the nearby hospital succumbed to his wounds and passed on the following day;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 17 of 175

(3) believes that it is somewhat incomprehensible to see an entire family with a little baby dying in such horrific circumstances;

- (4) supports the police investigation to ascertain the cause of the fire; and
- (5) expresses its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of the victims of the Sebokeng house fire.

Agreed to.

30TH ANNIVERSARY OF WINTERVELDT MASSACRE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Chairperson, on behalf of the DA I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that this month marks the 30th anniversary of the Winterveldt massacre;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 18 of 175

(2) recalls that the people of Winterveldt suffered endless harassment at the hands of the Bophuthatswana government due to their differing ethnicities;

- (3) remembers that on 26 March 1986 approximately 10 000 unarmed people gathered at the City Rocks soccer field in Winterveldt to express their grievances with the Bophuthatswana government;
- (4) further remembers that the Bophuthatswana police opened fire on the crowd, killing 11 people, injuring 200 and detaining more than 1 000 people who were charged with public violence or attending an illegal gathering;
- (5) also remembers that this tragedy made national and international headlines, shocked and caught the attention of the international community and ultimately helped pave the way for UN sanctions against the apartheid government;
- (6) commemorates the senseless deaths of the 11 members of the community; and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 19 of 175

(7) calls on government to commemorate this tragedy by erecting a fitting memorial in the spirit of reconciliation and redress.

Agreed to.

QUESTIONABLE ACTS BY THE IEC

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N PAULSEN: House Chair, I rise on behalf of the EFF to move without notice:

- (1) notes the questionable acts by the IEC which could potentially undermine its integrity and as a result the integrity of the upcoming local government elections;
- (2) further notes that in the West Rand region, in the Mogale

 City Local Municipality's Munsieville township, ward 27,

 voting district 33250564 with presiding officer Mr

 Tshabalala, an ANC leader had set up a voting registration

 point in his own house;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 20 of 175

(3) acknowledges that many other incidents of irregularities have been reported. In the North West's Bojanala region of ward 16 an ANC leader's home was used as a voter registration venue, while a Northern Cape IEC presiding officer allowed people wearing ANC regalia to bring more than one identity document, ID;

- (4) further acknowledges that in the Eastern Cape's Chris Hani region, registration material was not enough, only later to be found dumped;
- (5) calls on the IEC to conduct itself according to the prescripts of the Electoral Act and advise them that it will not be wise to put the integrity of the IEC in jeopardy simply because they are scared that the ANC will lose votes; and
- (6) also calls on all party agents from all political parties to be vigilant and report the thieving that the ANC plans to do in the upcoming elections.

There being an objection, the motion without notice becomes a notice of motion.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 21 of 175

THREE TEENAGE BOYS DIE IN CAR ACCIDENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that three teenage boys aged between 16 and 18 were killed after a bakkie and a bus collided at the Mlalazi Bridge on the R66 near Eshowe this morning;
- (2) also notes that two other vehicles were also involved in the accident in rainy weather;
- (3) further notes that 11 children have been admitted to a hospital at Eshowe, having sustained injuries during the collision of which one is in a serious condition;
- (4) extends its heartfelt condolences to the family and loved ones of those who died so tragically in this accident; and
- (5) wishes the children who were hurt in the accident a speedy and full recovery from their injuries.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 22 of 175

Agreed to.

NATIONAL WOMEN'S CRICKET TEAM WINS T20 SERIES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M S MALATSI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the South African national women's cricket team won their first ever T20 series against the West Indies this week;
- (2) congratulates the team for its historic victory;
- (3) commends Cricket SA, CSA, and Momentum for their support to the women's cricket team and for setting up a professional structure for domestic women's cricket; and
- (4) wishes the team well for the upcoming T20 World Cup in India.

Agreed to.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 23 of 175

DISCRIMINATION NOT NEW PHENOMENOM

(Draft Resolution)

Nksz S M KHAWULA: Sihlalo weNdlu, ngifaka isiphakamiso ngaphandle kwesaziso:

Sokuthi leNdlu -

- (1) Siyi-EFF ngeke sivume kudlalwe ngegeja kuziliwe, lento inzima kakhulu ayiqali lapha ngikhuluma ngalento yokucwasana ayiqali lapha, iyophela uma sekubuyiswe umhlaba kubanikazi bawo owathathwa ngendluzula ngamabhunu;
- (2) akukho soka ladla kamnandi imbangi ikhala, bayahlupheka abantu abamnyama ngokwezindlu abahlala kuzona, ngokwemfuyo yabo, ngokwamanzi abawaswele baze bayodliwa yizingwenya emifuleni beyokha amanzi, eMtubatuba ngakini njalo, ngilalele kahle Sihlalo;
- (3) [Uhleko.] izingane zabantu abamnyama zihamba amabanga amade ziya ezikoleni zivika izigebengu kanjalo noma beya emtholampilo bahamba amabanga amade, kanjalo beya emaphoyiseni mhlawumbe kwenziwe lento okuthiwa

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 24 of 175

ukudlwengulwa, i-rape ngesiNgisi azikho izinsiza
ezindaweni la kuhlala khona abantu ngisho umuntu ukuthi
ushonelwe imbala kunenkinga enkulu yokuthi umzimba wakhe
uma sekufuneka uye ekhaya awukwazi ukuthi uzothwalwa
kanjani, imigwaqo engenayo esazomsiza egula ayikho;

- (4) okokugcina okufuneka nikuzwe la akulula kumuntu omnyama ngoba kufanele babuyiselwe zonke izinto ezantshontshwa amabhunu kubantu, namakhosi, kukhona amakhosi abulawa elwela okhandampondo nodompasi. Ngicela ningilalele, yebo siya ngakhona ekusongeni ehhe lawa makhosi igazi lawo lisakhala namanje ngoba akukaze kukhulunywe ngawo, lawa athathwa ahanjiswa aboshwa ngozankosi ezandleni, aboshwa ngamaketanga ezinyaweni angcwatshwa ngawo; labo bantu kuyimanje akukaze kukhulunywe ngabo la ukuthi bayoqaqwa nini lawo maketanga kuze kuqaqeke abantu abamnyama; futhi
- (5) icele ukuthi laba ababenza lokho ngobandlululo bahambe bayoguqa esizweni sabantu abamnyama, ngabe abeSuthu, amaKhaladi bonke ababe yizisulu zalolo bandlululo bahambe bayohlawula ngezinkomo. Ngiyabonga.

(Translation of a motion without notice follows.)

[Ms S M KHAWULA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 25 of 175

- (1) notes that as the EFF, we will not allow things to get out of hand, this is a very difficult issue and it did not start here - I am talking about the racism issue - it does not start here, it will end once the land is returned to its rightful owners as it was forcefully taken away by the boers;
- that no one will enjoy someone else's assets whilst they are hurting over them, black people are suffering because of the houses they are living in, their livestock, lack of drinking water to such an extent that they become victims of being eaten by the crocodiles in an effort of getting water from the rivers listen attentively Chairperson, because I am referring to your hometown, Mtubatuba;
- (3) [Laughter] black people's children walk long distances to schools warding off criminals on their way, they also walk long distances even when they are going to the clinics, they also walk long distances even if they go to the police stations and they end up being raped. There are no strong young men where people are staying because even if someone's relative passes away there is a big problem

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 26 of 175

because when the body of a deceased needs to come home, there are difficulties in carrying that body, this starts from the lack of proper roads that would help transport the person while he is sick and still alive;

- (4) The last thing that you must hear is that things are not easy for the black man because they need to get back all what was stolen from them and even from the kings by the boers, there are kings that were killed because they were fighting for taxes like poll tax and passbooks. I am asking you to listen to me, yes I am about to conclude yes these kings' blood is still crying out even now because they have never been spoken about, those who were taken to jail in handcuffs and chains on their feet and buried with them until now, those people have never been spoken about here to say when they are going to be unchained so that black people can also be unchained; and
- (5) asks those who had done that during the apartheid era to go and beg the black nation, may it be the BaSothos, coloureds - all those who were the victims of that apartheid era - to pay a penalty of cattle. Thank you.]

Motion falls away.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 27 of 175

INDIAN TEEN RAPED AND KILLED

(Draft Resolution)

Mrs C N MAJEKE: Hon Chair, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that on 9 March 2016 a 16-year-old Indian girl who was raped and set on fire on the roof of her home has passed away;
- (2) further notes that the teenager sustained more than 90% percent burns on the day of the attack;
- (3) recalls that a similar incident occurred on a bus in New Dehli in 2012 where a student was brutally gang raped;
- (4) appeals that when celebrating Human Right Day on 21 March, may we continue to advocate for the protection of women and children; and
- (5) condemns this human rights violation with the contempt it deserves.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 28 of 175

Motion agreed to.

WORLD TB DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Dr H C VOLMINK: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that 24 March is globally recognized as World Tuberculosis Day;
- (2) further notes that TB is one of the most complex and most devastating public health challenges affecting our continent and our country;
- (3) also notes that all of us have been affected either directly or indirectly by this epidemic;
- (4) calls on government to redouble its fight against this disease; and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 29 of 175

(5) further calls on all South Africans to work towards the achievable goal of eradicating TB in our country once and for all.

Motion agreed to.

FINANCIAL TIMES ZUPTA REPORT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M S MBATHA: House Chair, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that the Financial Times, the most influential and arguably the most trusted financial reporting journal, published an article about the Zuptas and their shenanigans;
- (2) further notes that the article quoted David Lewis, head of Corruption Watch SA saying that the Zuptas businesses are difficult to pin down;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 30 of 175

(3) notes that Lewis continues to say, the Zuptas sole competitive advantage seems to be their closeness to political leadership, notably, President Zuma;

- (4) acknowledges that a former senior state official, former

 Head of Intelligence, during his tenure, ordered the

 investigation and the analysis of how the Guptas operated

 in South Africa of which now we know that within days

 after that request, he was officially fired from his job;
- (5) further acknowledges that the Chief of Intelligence continues to make a string of allegations about a series of activities that were illegal in nature that continue during his tenure;
- (6) recognises that even more recently the Deputy Minister of Finance, hon Jonas, was approached days before the firing of hon Nene by the same family to check if he was willing to take up the position of finance Minister;
- (7) takes the opportunity to warn the ANC to cleanse itself of this demonic tendency of allowing our country to be run by a corrupt family;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 31 of 175

(8) further notes that the ANC seems to have an unlimited manner in which it deals with most of these allegations, most of them are left unattended, uncleared and never resolved which leaves South Africans with a belief that there is something happening between this family and the ANC; and

(9) calls on South Africans to stay awake watching their televisions on the day when the Constitutional Court produces the judgement because on that day South Africans will know that at least in South Africa we still have the law on our side, the law that will vehemently at least explain the activities of the Zuptas and all its corrupt activities.

Motion falls away.

DEATH OF 10 PEOPLE IN MAGOEBASKLOOF

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chairperson, I move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 32 of 175

(1) notes with sadness the death of 10 people, including a baby and injury of at least 60 others when a bus overturned on the R528 in Magoebaskloof, Limpopo, on Sunday 6 March 2016;

- (2) understands that when paramedics arrived on the scene they found that the injuries that were sustained ranged from minor to critical;
- (3) acknowledges that the bus was on its way to Phalaborwa from the holy city of Moria when the accident happened;
- (4) calls on the relevant authorities to investigate the cause of the accident and justice takes its part if any negligence found; and
- (5) conveys its condolences to the families of the deceased and wishesing speedy recovery to all the injured passengers. I thank you.

Agreed to.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 33 of 175

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza Sihlalo, [Thank you, Chairperson]
Chairperson, I hereby move without notice:

- (1) recognises the National Water Week marked on the 17 to- 23

 March 2016;
- (2) further recognises that the World Water Day is marked on the 22 March 2016, which coincides with the National Water Week as stated above;
- (3) acknowledges that these are powerful awareness campaign mechanisms that re-iterate the value of water and the need for sustainable management of this scarce resource;
- (4) further acknowledges that there is a global water demand for manufacturing, and that water and energy are inseparable; and that water is required to generate energy and that energy is required to deliver water;.

 Considering our current energy "challenge" perhaps being

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 34 of 175

mindful of this relationship may prove of to be more useful in the long run;

- (5) calls upon all South Africans to ensure that water is not wasted, and for the department of water affairs to ensure that all members of the public are provided with clean drinkable water, and that there are no delays in service delivery;
- (6) applauds all efforts by the departments in ensuring that, at least, some people have access to water, but urge that more be done in realising this for all South Africans. I so move.

Agreed to.

HARRIET TUBMAN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T RAWULA: I move without notice:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 35 of 175

of Harriet Tubman, a revolutionary woman, an AfricanAmerican slave abolitionist who escaped slavery in 1849
and travelled to the North of the USA using an
underground railroad;

- (2) further notes that this revolutionary woman, born in Araminta Ross in 1822 in Dorchester County, Maryland, on the plantation where her parents were enslaved, took the name "Harriet" at the time she married John Tubman, a free black man, around 1844. Harriet Tubman lived and worked enslaved in this area from her childhood until she escaped to freedom at age 27 in 1849;
- (3) recognises that after her escape, she went back to the plantation 19 times to free family, friends, and other enslaved African Americans, becoming one of the most prominent "conductors" on the Underground Railroad, which rightfully earned her the title 'Moses of her People'.

 Iin 1859, she purchased a farm in Auburn, New York, and established a home for her family and others, which anchored the remaining years of her life;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 36 of 175

(4) acknowledges that in celebrating the life of Harriet

Tubman, we remember her commitment to freedom and

rededicate ourselves to the timeless principles she

struggled to uphold;. Hher story is one of extraordinary

courage and effectiveness in the movement to abolish

slavery and racism not only in America, but as an

inspiration to all oppressed people worldwide;

- (5) further acknowledges that the story of Harriet Tubman is a constant reminder of the indestructibility of the spirit of our people, and of the weaknesses of the philosophy of racism and oppression in America, here is South Africa, and everywhere else in the world;
- (6) call on the House to recognisesze that the freedoms we now enjoy and take for granted are as a result of the sweat, blood and tears of many, who, like Harriet Tubman, gave their lives for the liberation of black people worldwide. I so move.

Agreed to.

COMMUNITY RADIO STATIONS

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 37 of 175

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Ke a leboga Modulasetulo, [Thank you Chairperson,] I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes the struggles our community radio stations faces;
- (2) further notes that community radio stations are there to assist in information dissemination to communities,.

 These community radio stations are launched with much fanfare, but soon run out of funds and are provided with no support from government agencies that should be supporting them;
 - (3) acknowledges that most of these stations rely on private funding which of course dictates to them what to advertise;
 - (4) further acknowledges that the lack of funding disadvantages not only community radio stations, but the communities themselves, who have no other means of getting news that concern themselves, and as a result,

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 38 of 175

get alienated from participating in things that concern them;

- (5) recognises that employees of some community radio stations, such as Kurara FM in Kuruman, and Radio Teemaneng in Kimberly in the Northern Cape province, go for months without receiving their stipends; these are committed radio presenters who continue to give our communities information irrespective of their circumstances;
- (6) we call on government to intervene and advocate for funding for community radio stations not only the mentioned stations but throughout South Africa;
- (7) further calls on government to make sure that when licenses are issued, radio stations are supported and guided to possible funders. I so move.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, are there any objections to the motion?

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Yes!

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 39 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded with. The motion will now become a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

Hon members, may I appeal, when we need to object we need to do so quickly; can we please make sure that we do so in future.

APPOINTMENT OF FEMALE PROVINCIAL COMMISSIONER LIEUTENANT GENERAL DELIWE SUZAN DE LANGE

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C C M PILANE-MAJAKE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates Lieutenant General Deliwe Suzan de Lange for being appointed the female provincial commissioner in Gauteng. She has commenced her duty on the 01 March 2016;
- (2) further notes that De Lange is an experienced police officer who rose through police ranks;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 40 of 175

(3) recalls that she was previously the Cluster Commander of Sebokeng for six years;

- (4) further recalls that she was also the station commander at Tsakane and Kempton Park police stations;
- (5) recognises that De Lange holds various awards, including being crowned Senior Manager of the Year for two consecutive years, and also is a winner of the Provincial Commissioner's Award;
- (6) further recognises that she has a diploma in policing and a certificate in leadership and project management from Unisa;
- (7) trusts that through her dedication and experience she will assist in sweeping the province clean of crime and corruption; and
- (8) wishes her success in her new position of responsibility.

 I so move.

Agreed to.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 41 of 175

AARON PHANGISO

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the South African left-arm spinner Aaron

 Phangiso has been cleared to play at the World Twenty20

 tournament in India after an independent reassessment of
 his bowling action found it to be perfectly legal;
- (2) further notes that the 32-year-old failed tests carried out by the International Cricket Council, on the 01 March, having been reported in domestic 50-over matches last month;
- his action could be re-tested and has now been cleared to resume his career having worked with the South African spin-bowling consultant Claude Henderson over the past week;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 42 of 175

(4) wishes him the best of luck with his future career in cricket. I so move.

Agreed to.

MBUQE CEMETERY

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N P KHOZA: Thank you House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) note that black South Africans continue to be landless people without dignity and land to call their own;
- (2) further notes that even in death we fail to restore just a little dignity out of respect for those who have passed on by providing land to lay their remains;
- (3) recognises that residence of Mthatha, in O R Tambo region are forced to lay the remains of their loved ones on top of other's remains at Mbuge Cemetery;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 43 of 175

(4) acknowledges that it is only under the leadership of the EFF that land will be nationalized for equitable distribution and efficient use;

- (5) further acknowledges that we do not have to wait for people to pass on to restore their dignity;
- (6) we call on all local authorities, not only in Mthatha, but across the country to respect, restore dignity and honour those who have passed on by providing decent cemeteries for their families to bury their remains properly;
- (7) If we have enough land for golf estate, gold courses, racetracks and game parks, we must be decent enough to bury our loved ones with dignity. I so move.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, are there any objections to the motion?

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Yes!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded with.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 44 of 175

The motion will now become a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza) Ngibona lilunga lelihloniphekile uMnu Mncwango atiphephetsa lapha; sengimangele kutsi ngabe, nkhosi yami nine bekunene kusho kutsi sesiyafana nyalo. Lokulingana akusapheleli nje esigabeni lesitsite; sekuyenteka nasekukhuleni kwesive ngalokufananako.

Ngiyacela-ke kusho kumalunga lahloniphekile ngobe ngimubonile
Babe Steenhuisen naye atiphephetsa, lokusho kutsi inkinga
kushisa. Kungatsi siguculamoya asisebenti kodvwa noko
siyalungiswa njengobe ngikhuluma nje. Ngitawucela lilunga le-EFF
likhulume. (Translation of Siswati paragraphs follows.)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza) I can see the hon Member Mr Mncwango is fanning himself; I am wondering as to whether are we not the same now. This equality is not just found in certain areas but even in liberating the nation as well.

I would like therefore to say to these hon Members that because

I have also noticed Mr Steenhuisen fanning himself, this implies

that the problem is the heat. It appears that the air

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 45 of 175

conditioner is no longer working but it is being fixed as I am speaking. I would like to request the EFF member to speak.]

THREE YEARS SINCE THE DEATH OF HUGO CHAVEZ

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N S MATIASE: House chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the 6th of March marked two years since the death of one of the most progressive revolutionaries of our time, the late Venezuelan President, Hugo Chavez;
- (2) further notes that Chavez, born to humble origins and brought up in a mud hut by his grandmother, rose to become a symbol of imperial resistance and emancipatory politics of the left, and together with Cuba led the regional integration of Latin American countries into what is now called the Bolivarian Alliance for the peoples of America;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 46 of 175

(3) acknowledges that through his initiative, PetroCaribe, created in 2005, affords 17 countries in Latin America and the Caribbean with a secure energy supply, and that in 2008, he led the formation of Union of South American Nations, USAN, an intergovernmental union of South American unions, and in 2011, he lead the formation of Community of Latin American and Caribbean States, bringing together, for the first time, all 33 nations of the Western Hemisphere, emancipated from the tutelage of the US and Canada, which have been excluded from the body;

- (4) further acknowledges that it was his actions that led to the rapid development and industrialisation of not only Venezuela, but all of Latin America, a development that earned Chavez the wrath of the US and all those who seek to impose neoliberal state policies on the developing world;
- (5) accepts that it was through Chavez's leadership that in Venezuela, land has been distributed to the landless, poverty rate has been halved and extreme poverty reduced by two-thirds, child malnutrition reduced, access to safe drinking water increased, social expenditures were

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 47 of 175

increased and pensions for the elderly went from less than 400,000 recipients to over to two million, while hundreds of thousands of new homes were built for those in slums;

- (6) regards with disdain the attempts of the neocolonialists to reverse the gains made in Venezuela through their imposition of neoliberal policies, and their attempts on regime change to dislodge Nicolas Maduro, the worthy successor to Chavez;
- (7) acceds that from the Bolivarian Revolution led by Chavez, developing countries learnt and copy emancipatory programmes for the development of their people, and it is for that reason that the EFF is committed to bringing about radical, self-perpetuating development through redistribution of wealth; and
- (8) wishes that the revolutionary soul of our leader, Hugo Chavez, rest in eternal peace; and for all he has done for humanity, we proclaim Yo soy Chávez, we are Chávez.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, if there are not objections I put the motion? Not agreed to. In light of the

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 48 of 175

objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Order, hon members! Are there any further motions without notice? Hon Shandu and hon Paulsen, Order! Hon members, there is a motion that was read in the name Mr J L Mahlangu on the death of ten people in Magoebaskloof. I just want to bring to the House's attention that, that motion was also done yesterday. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Order, hon members! Ake sehlise amazwe. [Let us lower our voices.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

I move the Draft Resolution printed on the Order Paper in the

name of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party as follows:

(1) in terms of section 2(1) of the Remuneration of Public

Office Bearers Act, Act 20 of 1998 (the Act), and having

due regard to the criteria listed in that subsection,

determines that the salary payable to the President of the

Republic of South Africa shall be R2,874,851 with effect

from 1 April 2015; and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 49 of 175

(2) in terms of section 2(2) of the Act, further determines that the amount of R120 000 per annum as that portion of the remuneration of the President to which section 8(1)(d) of the Income Tax Act, Act 58 of 1962, shall apply.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I now put the motion.

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Chair, before you put the motion, we would like to make an amendment to that motion, with your permission.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, let me consult. Thank you hon members, in terms of the procedure I will have to put the first question on the motion that was proposed earlier and if the DA opposes it, they then can raise an issue to amend.

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, hon Matiase.

Mr N S MATIASE: The EFF would like to rise on a question of privilege and to propose an amendment.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 50 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, the DA has just requested the same. Order, Hon member! I have noted hon Steenhuisen I think there was a mistake on the matter. Let's allow the DA to put their amendment and then if the EFF still wants to do so, we will comeback.

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Chair, I hereby move an amendment to the draft resolution on the Order Paper in the name of the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party as follows: The deletion in the first paragraph of everything after the word shall and the insertion of the following: In light of the reckless actions taken by the President in December last year and their devastating effects on the South African economy and the pensions of millions of South Africans shall remain unchanged at the existing level of remuneration. [Applause.]

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair, once again on behalf of the EFF, we rise to propose amendment to the draft resolution of the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party that the House changes subsection 1(1) and remove all together (2) and read as follows: In terms of section 2(1) of the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers Act, Act 20 of 1998, and having due regard to the criteria listed in that subsection, in particular subsection (b), determines that the salary payable to the President of the

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 51 of 175

Republic of South Africa shall be suspended indefinitely since he has admitted that he unduly benefitted from Nkandla upgrades and now he wants to pay back the money. So, he doesn't deserve any salary increment or adjustment.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I have just noted two parties that have made amendments, and I just want to indicate that procedurally there seems to be some questions on how that should be done. I think we will try and discuss with the Whips outside if times allows so that in future such a mishap doesn't happen, with regard to how we manage the amendments if there are. But we will check with the House whether the amendment as proposed by the EFF is the last one? Any other party? Okay, can I now put the amendment of the EFF? [Interjections.] Well, I think there must be some consultation because in terms of the Table Staff, it is the last motion that you put first and you follow with the other one.

[Interjections.] Order, hon members! Can we put the amendment of the EFF to the House? Are there any objections? [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, the ANC objects. [Interjections.]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 52 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): There have been the objections. I now put the questions. Those in favour of the amendment of the EFF will say "Aye". [Interjections.] And those against will say "Noe". [Interjections.] I think the "Ayes" have it [Interjections.]

Mr N S MATIASE: Hello, Madam Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Sorry, the "Noes" have it. Yes, hon Matiase.

Mr N S MATIASE: The EFF wants to make a declaration.

[Interjections.] Yes, we still want to make a declaration.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Matiase, it's your own amendment, so you cannot make a declaration.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 53 of 175

allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the "yes", "no" or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may, thereafter, press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member's vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

The question before the House is that the amendment as moved by hon S N Matiase be agreed to [Interjections.]

Are all members in their allocated seats? [Interjections.]

Voting will now commence. Those in favour of the amendment should press the "yes" button. [Interjection.] Those against should press the "no" button. [Interjections.] Those wishing to abstain should press the "abstain" button. [Interjections.] Have all members voted? [Interjections] Those whose electronic system is not working can submit their names to the table.

[Interjections.] Okay, thank you. The voting session is now closed.

AYES - 81: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim, Y; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Esau,

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 54 of 175

S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Gana, S M; Gqada, T; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Khawula, M S; Khoza, N P; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S; Matiase, N S; Matsepe, C D; Mazzone, N W A; Mbatha, M S; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Moteka, P G; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Rabotapi, M W; Rawula, T; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

NOES - 172: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dudley, C; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 55 of 175

Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, M B; Khoza, T Z M; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mantashe, P T; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Mathale, C C; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Meshoe, K R J; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mncwabe, S C; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga -Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, D; Mnguni, P J; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthethwa, E M; Mthethwa, E N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkomo, S J; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Peters, E D; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A 10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 56 of 175

M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

ABSTAIN - 4: Jafta, S M; Mackay, G; Mahumapelo, J M K; Plouamma, M A.

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negatived.

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Yes!

Mr N S MATIASE: The EFF would like to make a declaration. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members!

Already, we have concluded on the voting. And as I indicated

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 57 of 175

earlier, it was your motion. I now put the amendment of the DA.

Are there any objections to the amendment of the DA?

[Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: The ANC object.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I now put the question.

Those in favour will say ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, before you put the vote, I want to say that the Guide to Procedure is clear about declarations and that is, before the House vote members are given the opportunity at your discretion of course. It is your discretion. [Interjections.] - Let me finish. The reason why you have a declaration is that so members can motivate for the amendment and explain to the House. So, it makes no sense to make a declaration afterwards because the reason for it is to try and convince fellow members of the House. If you have it afterwards it becomes a pointless exercise. Would you be able to grant three minutes to a member of each party who wants to make a declaration in favour or against the question?

[Interjections.] That is in the Guide to Procedure, I am not making it up.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 58 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, I have noted your point. Given that there was no member in your motion that requested to make a declaration I then proceeded. In the case of the EFF they were the ones who wanted to make a declaration when they are the ones who moved for the amendment. So, I exercised my discretion as you have said and I indicated again to hon Matiase that they cannot make a declaration after we have voted. I am just clarifying that at the moment apart from you hon member Steenhuisen advising us on the procedure no other party has made a request. I am noting hon Carter, is that a point of order?

Ms D CARTER: Chair, we would also like to make a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Is there any other party wishing to make a declaration? I have noted Cope, EFF, ANC, IFP, NFP, UDM, DA, ACDP. Hon hon members, declarations having being requested, I would now like to give an opportunity to Cope.

Ms J D KILLIAN: Chairperson, on a point of clarity.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 59 of 175

Ms J D KILLIAN: I thought that the procedure was that the declaration would take place when we vote on the motion on the Order Paper and not on everyone of the proposed amendments. The suggestion is that we proceed with the voting on the amendment and that before we get to the final motion on the Order Paper that is when we will have the opportunity for declarations. Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I have noted the issue of procedure that has been raised and I would like to draw members attention to Rule 81 on the declaration of votes. It says that:

The Presiding Officer may at anytime after a question has been fully put permit one member of each political party to state on behalf of his or her party, in a speech not exceeding three minutes, the reasons why the party is in favour of or against the question.

In terms of Rule 81(1) I had already put the question and members requested to make declarations of which I have granted. That is why I took the list of parties that wish to make declarations. I would appeal to members that we proceed.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 60 of 175

Declaration(s):

Ms D CARTER: I still have energy. The Congress of the People rejects with the contempt it deserves any increase in the salary of and remuneration benefits of a President. Cope submits that the President does not deserve an increase and neither does South African deserve Mr Zuma as its President. President Zuma has brought shame to the office of the Presidency and to the nation. All public representatives salaries must also be ... [Interjections.]

Ms S V KALYAN: I am sorry to interrupt the hon member at the podium but may I address you on a point of order where members are not supposed to make animal sounds ... [Interjections.]

[Laughter.] ... and it is not a laughing matter. It is in the rule book and I ask the Chairperson to rule on that and protect the speaker at the podium.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. Yes, hon Molewa.

The MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS: Hon House Chairperson, it is really on a point of order. The animal sounds must be about animals. We manage animals and we deal with animals, therefore, what animal sound exactly? [Interjections.]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 61 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon members, may I appeal to all of us that we maintain the decorum of the House.

[Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Ms S M KHAWULA: Lalela Sihlalo lapho ngaphambili. [Listen, Chairperson, at the front there.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member.

Nksz S M KHAWULA: Ibuhlungu le nto ngoba phela nguNgqongqoshe loyo. Akumele uNgqongqoshe enze le nto ayenzayo, asihloniphaneni bafowethu. Lo nguNgqongqoshe futhi ngiyamhlonipha kodwa qha angiyithandi into ayenzayo.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nksz A T Didiza): Malungu ahloniphekile ale
Ndlu yesishayamthetho! Malungu ahloniphekile eNdlu
yesishayemthetho! (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Ms S M Khawula: This is very unfortunate because this is a Minister and a Minister is not supposed to do what she is doing, please let's respect one another hon Members. A much as I like this Minister, I don't like what she is doing.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 62 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Members of this august House! Hon Members of this august House!]

Hon members, it does not help ... [Interjections.] Hon members of the DA! Hon members of the DA! I have asked all hon members to please be in order. Can we please respect one another and indeed not continue to make sounds that are unparliamentary in terms of our rules. I would really appeal to all of us to give the member on the podium the opportunity to make her statement so that all of us can proceed and do the business of the House. Hon Ollis, what is your point of order.

Mr I OLLIS: I agree with you entirely, the hon Malema [Laughter]
- I mean, Edna Molewa, I beg your pardon. The hon Molewa over
there is showing a fist to members of the opposition like she is
going to beat us. I think really that such ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon members, can we please behave in an honourable way. Hon Carter, can you proceed.

Ms D CARTER: Chair, I just have to say that President Zuma has brought shame ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] ... to the nation.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 63 of 175

Ms S M KHAWULA: Uxolo lapho Sihlalo ngaphambili. Sihlalo, ngiyacela bakithi. [Excuse me, Chairperson. Chairperson, I'm pleading with you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you take your seat.

Nksz S M KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga. Bengithi la akekucace ukuthi uNkulunkulu akasidalanga ngendlela efanayo, umuntu nomuntu unesici sakhe. Angisiboni isidingo sokuthi umuntu uma ngabe unesici esithile kufanele la kukhulunywe ngaso. Ibuhlungu le nto eyenzeka ku-Carter, ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Ms S M KHAWULA: Thank you. I would like to clarify that God did not create us in the same way, each and every person have their shortcomings. I don't think there is a need to discuss someone else's shortcomings. What is happening to hon Carter is so unfortunate. Thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members, can we please be respectful of one another.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 64 of 175

Umama uKhawula ukusho kahle ngesiZulu, laba abasikhulumayo bayazi ukuthi alikho isoka elingenasici ... [... hon Khawula has put it very well in isiZulu, those who speak the language know precisely that we all have our shortcomings.]

... and I think that we need to accord one another respect even if we differ. Hon Carter.

Ms D CARTER: Chair, President Zuma has brought shame to the Office of the Presidency and to the nation. All public representatives salaries must also be frozen and the increases of between R21 000 and R28 000 that was paid out yesterday should be paid back. Through the President's behaviour and ably supported by the ANC, our political system and constitutional democracy lay broken. Institutions of our state have been corrupted and white-anted and this very Houses' integrity has been rubbished.

President Zuma has through his actions wiped out billions of rands of wealth, devalued our currency, brought us to the precipice of bankruptcy and resulted in our imminent attainment of junk status. The President does not deserve an increase but our country deserves an ethical President who will put the interests of the nation and its people before his own personal

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 65 of 175

interests, those of his cronies including the Gupta's and those of his party. As more and more solid information emerges such as the firing of Minister Nene and the hiring of his uMkhonto WeSizwe comrade, Minister van Rooyen, it would seem appropriate for the President to approach the Gupta's for an increase.

Chairperson, I just want to say that we have to respect nature and you cannot control nature. So, if the cats are on you let them continue meowing

Mr T RAWULA: House Chair, the EFF is not going to legitimise an illegitimate President or dignify the ANC's Draft Resolution with a response. We must be the only country in the world where a man can steal, a man can abuse state resources, a man can collapse integrity of State Security Agencies, a man can allow for a breach of ... [Interjections.]

Mr J L MAHLANGU: On a point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon member! Will you take your seat, please? Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair, the member raises matters in his address which need a substantive motion in terms of the convention of the House.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 66 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member at the podium, you have mentioned that "a man that steals". That requires a substantive motion. Will you withdraw those remarks or will you table a substantive motion?

Mr T RAWULA: Where people withdraw ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon members! Clarify your statement, please.

Mr T RAWULA: A man can steal.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Who are you referring to, hon member?

Mr M S MBATHA: On a point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I am not recognising you. I am dealing with the member at the podium. He must clarify his statement.

Mr M S MBATHA: Point of order.

Mr T RAWULA: Okay, let me clarify my statement, Chair.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 67 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, clarify it, please.

Mr T RAWULA: We must be the only country in the world.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, who are you referring to?

Mr T RAWULA: I am referring to the President, Jacob Zuma.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you withdraw the remark or table a substantive motion to substantiate your remarks that the President has stolen?

Mr T RAWULA: But he has stolen, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, order!

Order, hon members! Will you withdraw the remarks or are you going to deliver a substantiated motion to the House, hon member?

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair, I rise on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I have not recognised you, hon member.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 68 of 175

Mr N S MATIASE: No, I rise on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am dealing with the member at the podium.

Mr N S MATIASE: I rise on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member. The member at the podium must clarify himself, thereafter I will recognise you.

Mr N S MATIASE: Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The member at the podium must withdraw the remarks or he must submit a substantiated motion.

Mr T RAWULA: I withdraw, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): It is withdrawn. Continue hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: We must be the only country in the world where a President can abuse state resources, a President can collapse

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 69 of 175

the integrity of State Security Agencies, a President can allow for a breach of national security, a President can admit to full bench of judges of the highest court in the land that he unduly benefited from taxpayers' money and now he wants to pay back the money. It will be impossible in his life ... [Interjections.]

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon member! Will you take your seat? Hon member at the podium, will you take your seat?

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair, I am rising on the same matter that the member continues to cast aspersions and raise matters here in his statement without following the proper procedure.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I will allow the hon member to continue. Order, hon members!

Mr T RAWULA: A President who is fed by the state with his family of five wives and his more than 15 children including his friends from India, a President who is dressed and sheltered by the state, he must still receive a salary. As far as we are concerned we do not recognise Mr Zuma as the President. We will

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 70 of 175

continue to use constitutional mechanism provided to ensure that we remove Mr Zuma from the office. Only those who work must be remunerated. The ANC must be ashamed for their audacity to request Parliament to approve Mr Zuma's increase.

In our believe anyone that should be paid must be the person who have achieved his key performance areas. The President has broken his own Presidential oath. He has violated the Constitution. He has betrayed the trust of the people of the country. The least he should do is to resign. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

Mrs C DUDLEY: Hon Chair, in view of the economic circumstances facing South Africa and the realities impacting on the South African people, the ACDP supports the proposal that no increase in salary shall apply to the President and that the President's salary shall remain the same. Thank you.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, when we come to this podium here to speak, we must be honest with ourselves. We must not speak from two sides of our mouths. When we talk about the economy we will all realise that we are facing challenging times in our country at the moment as are international countries also facing challenging times. Just yesterday, there were smiles on almost

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 71 of 175

500 Members of Parliament's faces and members of the legislatures throughout the country when we received our 4,5% increase. We should have then had the courage if we are talking about economic times to refuse that 4,5% increase and say that that money should be distributed to the citizens of this country.

What we are talking about here today is a salary payable to the President of the Republic from 1 April 2015, and now one can argue that the incumbent is President Zuma, but we should be looking at the office of the President of the Republic. Next week ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Be careful of the remarks that you pass, hon Hill-Lewis. They may require a substantive motion. Therefore, it is very rich.

Continue, hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: We are looking at the office of the President. Next week we may find the ruling party having a meeting or a conference recalling the incumbent from the office of the President. Then, what do we do? Then we say no increase. We as the IFP will be consistent in what we say. We have accepted the 4,5% increase and I do not care what you say on my left, hon

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 72 of 175

Lewis and anybody else, because we are here in the interest of the people - the majority of this country and not for the minority like it has been for many, many years.

I think those kinds of comments coming from you are just cheap comments which we should not tolerate in this House. [Applause.] I am sorry that I had to do that because usually I am a very calm and collected individual. But, when people are not interested in the affairs of the majority of this country and they use this resolution here to score cheap political points, then it does not augur well for our country.

Further, we get political parties that have come here and that have supported total suspension of the President's salary and then they will support the fact that the salary of the President should not be increased. What are you supporting or not supporting? President, we will support the resolution as tabled. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, the hon member. The NFP. Order, hon members! Continue, hon member.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chairperson, as the NFP we espoused our views with regard to the state of our country that we really

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 73 of 175

find ourselves in perilous times where the economy of the country is ailing and it needs a political will to turnaround that. We also spoke about the state-owned enterprises that we need to turnaround them so that they will be profitable for the sake of this country.

We also spoke about drought that it has pushed about 50 000 of South Africans to live far below the poverty datum line and a lot of farmers are now facing problems as the result of drought. They need about R4 billion that will save them from this drought. If it continues, about R6 billion a year; and if it continues, about R3 billion a year. These are the things that we want our country to do and that need a political will.

Having said that, the NFP will support. Members have received their increased and we support the increase for the President.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, as the NFP we espouse to our views with regard to the state of our country that we really find ourselves in perilous times where the economy of the country is ailing and it needs a political will to turn that around. We also spoke about the state-owned enterprises that we

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 74 of 175

need to turn them around so that they can be profitable for the sake of this country.

We also spoke about drought that it has pushed about 50 000 of South Africans to live far below the poverty datum line. And a lot of farmers are now facing problems as a result of drought. They need about R4 billion that would save them out of this drought, and if it continues, about R6 billion a year or about R3 billion a year. These are the things that we want our country to do and that need a political will.

Chairperson, having said that, the NFP will support - members have received their increase - and we will support the increase for the President. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Thank you House Chairperson, ...

... uyabona luchuku olu siluxoxa apha. Sidlala nje ngexesha.

Ayobhonasi yentsebenzo le okanye uchatha wemali wentsebenzo.

(performance increase.) Unyanisile ohloniphekileyo uSingh, kuba kaloku kuthe kwakungena umyalezo omfutshane weselula sancuma apha, kwamnandi kwasegege. [Kwahlekwa.] Kwalo chatha mnye ubusincumisa, ngoku sithi uMongameli makangawufumani. Hayi, yintsomi kaMlingane leyo. Kodwa ke siyayiqonda ukuba kufuneka

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 75 of 175

silisebenzile eli thuba ngesizathu sokuba sikwipolitiki apha, asikho senkonzweni. Ngoko ke sakubane sibethana kodwa siyanicela, thina siyi-UDM ... (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[... we are just debating about petty things here. We are just wasting our time. This is not a performance bonus or performance increase. Hon Singh is on the right track because when we received smses we smiled, and we were happy. [Laughter.] Even this same increase put smile on our faces, now we say the hon President must not get it. That is a myth. But we understand that we have to use this opportunity because we are in politics not in church. Therefore we will have differences sometimes but we plead you, as UDM ...]

... we did the same thing last year. We did not hesitate or even had a problem supporting the draft resolution because we knew that rejecting it at the time would be very hypocritical of us, and we cannot do that - we will not do that.

Mayingene mhlekazi, Mongameli nawe khawukhe ulinde owakho umyalezo omfutshane weselula, siyabulela. [Kwaqhwatywa.] [We must receive it Sir, hon President, you must wait for your sms, thank you. [Applause.]]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 76 of 175

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, we talk about minorities and majorities. We stand here today to speak about the 8,3 million South Africans, hon Singh, who sit at home unemployed through the policies of President Jacob Zuma.

[Interjections.] We speak on behalf of the millions of South Africans who saved and worked for 30 to 40 years of their lives, to save up for pensions, and that now those pension savings significantly destroyed by the actions of President Zuma in December. [Applause.]

We speak out for the millions of South Africans who don't have work because in December last year, the President of this country took a decision to fire the Minister of Finance and replaced him with back bencher only to change his mind 48 hrs later. Our currency went through the floor; we had R230 billion cutting over our economy. We speak for those South Africans who don't have a voice on this side of the House and clearly running out of allies on this side of the House as well. [Applause.]

I think it is grotesque, absolutely grotesque to compare the work that we as Members of Parliament have done diligently to fight and stand up for the people of South Africa with the complete inaction and irresponsibility of the man who sits

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 77 of 175

behind that coat of arms and should be standing up for the people of the Republic of South Africa. [Applause.]

I think it is grotesque that on the verge of South Africa being downgraded to junk status in South Africa that we want to give this man an increase in his salary. He wants to junk South Africa but he wants increase from the taxpayer. [Interjections.] We speak up for the millions of South Africans who are struggling under an economic growth rate of 0,8%. Who is speaking for them in the House today? Not the ANC but the DA. [Applause.]

The truth of the matter is that with Nkandla, the President of the Republic of South Africa drove over us all with a bus. In December last year, he put the bus in reverse and the reversed over all of us, including his own ANC caucus. [Applause.] He then crushes the bus, and he come cap in hand to the taxpayers of South and says that he has done a great job and must be given a raise. We say no; for so far and no further.

President Zuma does not deserve a cent to his increase. He has failed to perform, and we will continue to say - on behalf of the millions of South Africans - we suffer under the Zuma

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 78 of 175

administration. You want more and we are going to give you the door. [Applause.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Chairperson, I am not going to be long, the hon President must get his salary increase. And not only the hon President but even hon Kohler Barnard must get her increase. [Applause.] We are not children, hon President Zuma is still the President of the country. We can't discriminate him unless you him to join a trade union to fight for his increase. He is a President of this country, nothing personal; it's not about whether we come from different political parties. That is his right and he must get his increase - no doubt about it - finish. [Applause.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, it's a pity that all of us sitting in this House received our salary increase this morning in our bank accounts. And that salary increase was signed by the President without thinking twice. He didn't discriminate against anyone; even the racists received that salary increase in this House. [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: On a point of order, Chair.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 79 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon Chief Whip!

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, we have been chucked out severally in this House ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order that you are rising on?

Mr T RAWULA: She is saying that the racists and casting aspersion that in this House there are racists ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That is a point of debate; take your seat hon member.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, Chairperson, Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take you seat, hon member. Continue, hon Chief Whip.

Mr I OLLIS: Chairperson, Chairperson.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 80 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Chief Whip take your seat. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr I OLLIS: Actually, Chairperson, to call members of the House racists ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am not the acting chairperson; I am the Chairperson of the House. What is your point of order, hon member?

Mr I OLLIS: Chairperson, it is quite clear; to call Members of Parliament racists is not a matter for debate. Will you please respond to my concern? Take your seat. Continue hon acting Chief Whip

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I was sitting there listening to them making their declarations ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon acting Chief Whip; I am taking another point of order. I want to remind hon members of Rule 51 and I will apply it.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 81 of 175

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, I am really sorry, I really don't want to interrupt the member but ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Why are you rising, hon member?

Ms D CARTER: Because using the words of racist like the EFF stood up ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] So, you are saying that it is correct?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Continue acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

I don't know because the very same parties who are raising

matters that are before the courts are the ones who took those

matters to court. And I don't know by their action whether they

think that they will be able ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party, I am recognising this hon member to hear how different his rising is to the other points that I have already ruled upon. Why are you rising, hon member?

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 82 of 175

Mr N P KHOZA: Thank you, Chair. We have a problem because ...
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No! I don't deal with problems here, hon member. Continue hon Chief Whip ...
[Interjections.]

Mr N P KHOZA: Chair, listen to my point of order.
[Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: The very same two parties, the DEF alliance are the ones who took this matter of Nkandla to court. I don't know ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Hon acting Chief Whip let me indicate to other members who are also rising now. I am not going to entertain this point any further.

[Interjections.] I have ruled on the matter ... [Interjections.]

Take your seat! [Interjections.]

Mr N P KHOZA: I am raising a point of order to you, hon Chair. I am raising a point of order you. [Interjections.]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 83 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): If you continue hon member I will apply Rule 51 take your seat! Hon member, take your seat! Hon member if you are not prepared to take your seat I am asking you to leave the House. Continue, acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, they took this matter of Nkandla to court. I don't know if they think their cheap political stance will influence the outcome of the court. Why can't you wait for the court to make its own judgement about this matter? The President will receive his salary increase whether you like it or not. He is still the President of this country, whether he reshuffles his cabinet he doesn't need to consult anyone. It his constitutional right to do so, live with it. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): are there any further declarations? None. No, you don't represent the PAC, hon member. May be you have taken a double membership of another party but I don't think you represent the PAC. They are not here.

Hon members, there has been amendment that has been moved by hon Motau. I now put the amendment. Those in favour will say, eye.

Hon MEMBERS: Eye!

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 84 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Those against will say no.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I think the noes have it.

Division demanded.

House divided.

AYES - 81: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim, Y; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Gana, S M; Gqada, T; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Khawula, M S; Khoza, N P; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S; Matiase, N S; Matsepe, C D; Mazzone, N W A; Mbatha, M S; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 85 of 175

Mokause, M O; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Moteka, P G; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Rabotapi, M W; Rawula, T; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

NOES - 172: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dudley, C; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, M B; Khoza, T Z M; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 86 of 175

Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mantashe, P T; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Mathale, C C; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Meshoe, K R J; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mncwabe, S C; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga -Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, D; Mnguni, P J; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthethwa, E M; Mthethwa, E N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkomo, S J; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Peters, E D; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 87 of 175

ABSTAIN - 4: Jafta, S M; Mackay, G; Mahumapelo, J M K; Plouamma, M A.

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negatived.

The House divided.

AYES - 82: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E;
Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B;
Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim,
Y; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M;
Dudley, C; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Gana, S M; Gqada, T;
Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G;
Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V;
Khawula, M S; Khoza, N P; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C;
Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore,
A T; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Mahumapelo, J M K; Majola, T
R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S; Matiase, N S;
Matsepe, C D; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R;
Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Moteka, P
G; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Plouamma, M A; Rabotapi, M W;
Rawula, T; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 88 of 175

Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R.

NOES - 172: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Gogwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, M B; Khoza, T Z M; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mantashe, P T; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 89 of 175

Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Mathale, C C; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mncwabe, S C; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, D; Mnguni, P J; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthethwa, E M; Mthethwa, E N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkomo, S J; Nkwinti, G E; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Peters, E D; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

ABSTAIN - 2: Filtane, M L W; Majeke, C N.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 90 of 175

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negatived.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 172: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, M B; Khoza, T Z M; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 91 of 175

Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mantashe, P T; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Mathale, C C; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mncwabe, S C; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, D; Mnguni, P J; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthethwa, E M; Mthethwa, E N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkomo, S J; Nkwinti, G E; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Peters, E D; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof,

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 92 of 175

N J J; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 81: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim, Y; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Dudley, C; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Gana, S M; Gqada, T; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Khawula, M S; Khoza, N P; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S; Matiase, N S; Matsepe, C D; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Moteka, P G; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Rabotapi, M W; Rawula, T; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Tsoleli, S P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

ABSTAIN - 2: Mahumapelo, J M K; Plouamma, M A.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 93 of 175

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, before I proceed, I want to recognise in the gallery a member of the Second Parliament of the democratic South Africa, a member who led a minority party at the time and who has joined us in the gallery, the honourable Cassie Aucamp. [Applause.]

Welkom, Cassie. Dis goed om jou te sien. [Welcome, Cassie. It is a pleasure seeing you.]

EXTENSION OF DEADLINE FOR REPORT BY AD HOC JOINT COMMITTEE ON APPOINTMENT OF BOARD MEMBERS TO NATIONAL YOUTH DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

(Draft Resolution)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

I move the draft resolution as printed in the name of the Chief

Whip of the Majority Party on the Order Paper, as follows:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 94 of 175

That the House, subject to the concurrence of the National Council of Provinces, extends the deadline by which the Ad Hoc Joint Committee on Appointment of Board Members to the National Youth Development Agency has to report to 8 April 2016.

Agreed to.

ITEM OF CONSIDERATION OF CANDIDATE NOMINATED FOR APPOINTMENT AS INSPECTOR-GENERAL OF INTELLIGENCE SERVICES REVIVED FOR CONSIDERATION BY NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

(Draft Resolution)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

I move the draft resolution as printed in the name of the Chief

Whip of the Majority Party on the Order Paper, as follows:

That the following item that was on the Order Paper and which, in terms of Rule 316, lapsed at the end of the last sitting day of the 2015 annual session, be revived for consideration by the National Assembly:

(1) Consideration of candidate nominated for appointment as Inspector-General of Intelligence Services. 10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 95 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I now put the motion.

Are there any objections? No objections.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, there is no objection, but we would like to make a declaration, please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am exercising my discretion, since the matter will be before the House, that we at this stage will not allow declarations on this matter.

Agreed to.

REVIVAL OF ITEMS ON ORDER PAPER THAT LAPSED IN TERMS OF RULE 316 AT END OF 2015 ANNUAL SESSION

(Draft Resolution)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

I move the draft resolution as printed in the name of the Chief

Whip of the Majority Party on the Order Paper, as follows:

That the following items that were on the Order Paper and which, in terms of Rule 316, lapsed at the end of the last

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 96 of 175

sitting day of the 2015 annual session, be revived for consideration by the National Assembly:

- (1) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training on oversight visit to Mpumalanga and Gauteng provinces;
- (2) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Higher

 Education and Training on oversight visit to Northern Cape

 province;
- (3) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training on annual report 2013-14 of Safety and Security Sector Education and Training Authority, Sasseta, and Public Service Education and Training Authority, Pseta;
- (4) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Higher

 Education and Training on Strategic Plan 2015-16 to 2019
 20 and annual performance plan 2015-16 of Mining

 Qualifications Authority, MQA, and Transport Education and

 Training Authority, Teta;

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 97 of 175

(5) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training on strategic plan 2015-16 to 2019-20 and annual performance plan 2015-16 of Culture, Arts, Tourism, Hospitality and Sport Sector Education and Training Authority, Cathsseta, and Safety and Security Sector Education and Training Authority, Sasseta;

- (6) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Sport and Recreation on Commission for Gender Equality: Public Hearing Report on Gender Transformation in South African Football;
- (7) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises on oversight visit to port of Saldanha Bay;
- (8) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises on oversight visit to Transnet port of Durban;
 - (9) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Rural

 Development and Land Reform on public hearings on

 implementation of Recapitalisation and Development

 Programme; and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 98 of 175

(10) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on colloquium on relationship and impact of transfer pricing on beneficiation or value addition as set out in Industrial Policy Action Plan and on broadening participation as outlined in Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act.

Agreed to.

OPENING OF NEW POLICE STATION IN DIEPSLOOT

(Member's Statement)

Ms M A MOLEBATSI (ANC): House Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC, I would like to congratulate the SA Police Service on the recent opening of the Diepsloot police station in Gauteng. This will bring vital services closer to the community of Diepsloot and ensure than residents feel safe at home, at school, and at work in the Diepsloot area and enjoy a community life free of fear. Diepsloot residents have been isolated and marginalised for long enough.

We call on the police to increase visible policing patrols to ensure that residents can realise the vision of a safer

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 99 of 175

community. The SA Police Service should now join hands with the community of Diepsloot to combat the problem of unlicensed liquor outlets and drug merchants. This will go a long way in addressing some of the social ills faced by the Diepsloot community.

We wish the service good luck and safety in their new station.

May God watch over you. I thank you. [Applause.]

CONGRATUALTIONS TO SAPS IN THE DA-LED CAPE TOWN

(Member Statement)

Mr Z MBHELE (DA): The Democratic Alliance congratulates the Metro police service of the DA-led City of Cape Town for the successes and achievements of its stabilisation units introduced in July 2015 to tackle gang and drug-related violence on the Cape flats.

By November, this 90-member unit, working with the South African Police service had produced the number of shootings in Manenburg from an average of three shootings a day to just one in four months.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 100 of 175

The effectiveness of the strategy lies in area saturation by keeping officers posted outside every known drug dealer's house, using city by-laws and information from residents to smother the flow of drugs, guns and money coupled with increased visible patrolling and stop and search operations.

This also alleviates the pressure on the SAPS and other enforcement agencies that may not have the resources to maintain high visibility in an area for a long period.

We welcome this tangible demonstration of increased community safety, as the fruits of DA local governance, which can be enjoyed by South Africans in all metros where residents vote to bring the DA to power in the upcoming local government elections. I thank you.

GUPTAS ATTEMPT TO GET DEPUTY MINISTER TO ACCEPT POSITION OF MINISTER

(Member's Statement)

Mr T RAWULA (EFF): The EFF notes media reports about the Guptas' attempt to capture the National Treasury by offering the Deputy Minister of Finance, Mr Jonas, a position of the Minister of

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 101 of 175

Finance, just like what they did to Minister Fike Lembalula. We can now confirm that the meeting indeed took place a few weeks back before Nene was fired.

The EFF warned this House and eh nation when it happened, the Minister of Mineral Resources is employed by the Zuptas, as an executive of their company, not the Minister. Those who still have doubt can see for themselves. Now he is busy travelling with the Guptas to negotiate deals on their behalf. We know that the Guptas have already started to move R2 billion of ill-gotten gains to Dubai and they are in the process of moving more.

Ms M T KUBAYI: Chairperson, on a point of order: The member who is making the statement is casting aspersions of a serving member of this House and therefore, I request him to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Indeed, hon member, you are referring to sitting members of the House and as you know, and I know that it requires a substantive motion. You must withdraw.

Mr T RAWULA (EFF): Chair, I am not sure what you are referring to. I am talking about people employed by the Zuptas. There is no Zupta ...

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 102 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): In fact, hon member, in previous sitting of the House, the word Zuptas has been ruled unparliamentary as well. [Interjections.] You must thus withdraw.

Mr T RAWULA (EFF): I draw, I draw, Chair. This is not **** it is the reality. We wrote to relevant authorities - The Minister of Finance, Govern of the Reserve bank, Director of the Financial Intelligence centre and Sars to investigate why the Guptas did not pay 10% exit levy on capital export. All those who form part of the Zuptas' criminal organisation... [Time expired.] ... It is a matter of time before the will of justice move.

PEOPLE OF GUGULETHU SUFFER UNDER THE DA-LED CAPE TOWN

(Member's Statement)

Ms M O MATSHOBA (ANC): Hon members I wish to bring it to the attention of this House that the people of Gugulethu here in Cape Town continue to suffer under the administration of the DAled City of Cape Town. Since 2007, the people of Cape Town, in general, and Gugulethu, in particular, have been lied to.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 103 of 175

From the first DA mayor, Helen Zille in 2007, her successor, Dan Plato, and the current incumbent, Patricia de Lille, the DA today continues to lie to the people of Gugulethu. Parts of Gugulethu such as Kanana, Barcelona and many others still use portable toilets, which are expected to be tolerated by black people, but not by the likes of De Lille who famously covered her nose and mouth with masks because she is too good to be exposed to the stench.

Other parts of Gugulethu are characterised by backyard-dwellers and informal settlements. Furthermore, Gugulethu is plagued a by high rates of violent crime, gangsterism, alcohol and substance abuse. And the City of Cape Town has no appetite to address this while suburbs such as Newlands and Camps Bay are prioritised.

The ANC is the only organisation that prioritises the needs of the poor in this country. The ANC is the only beacon of hope for communities like Gugulethu, the only caring organisation that put all people of this country first and this they will reflect when we go to elections later this year. [Time expired.] Please, vote for the ANC. I thank you.

THE RECENT VIOLENCE KWAZULU-NATAL

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 104 of 175

(Member's Statement)

Mr N SINGH (IFP): the Inkata Freedom Party condemns, in the strongest possible terms, the recent outbreak of violent protests at Isithebe in the Mandeni district of KwaZulu-Natal. This has resulted in widespread damage to property and led to the shutting down of business premises in the area. Factories have been torched and thousands of workers and their families have had their livelihoods affected, albeit, at a time when the unemployment rate is extraordinary high.

It appears that the primary cause of the violence and unrest is internal fighting and factionalism within the ANC, which then spilt out onto the streets of the Isithebe.

The IFP takes the strongest of exception to the reckless behaviour of those within the ruling party who incite this violence and unrest and urges cool heads to prevail so that the situation can be returned to normality as quickly as possible.

The IFP, who encouraged the development of businesses in Isithebe during the party's term of governance of the province of KwaZulu-Natal, will do everything in its power to assist in this process where possible. In such a contracting economy, we

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 105 of 175

cannot afford to have business razed to the ground, because of such reckless actions. We implore ANC leadership, in particular, and all others like the Police to contribute to restoring normality in the affected area. Thank you.

EDUCATION IS A RIGHT

(Member's Statement)

Ms C N MAJEKE (UDM): Hon Chairperson and hon members, section 29(1)(a) of the Constitution says, everyone has the right to basic education including Adult Basic Education. The most underperforming education department in the country is found in the rural Eastern Cape. It is in bridge if this constitutional right, because National Treasury has reallocated R530 million from the department. The amount of R400 million went to Gauteng, R80 million to Limpopo and R50 million to Western Cape. These provinces consistently perform better than Eastern Cape. This money was allocated for building schools, revamping old ones, providing furniture and maintains existing ones.

The Department has dismally failed to do this, yet in 2014 the same Eastern Cape department confirmed that there were no less than 350 mud schools in the province, leaving thousands of young

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 106 of 175

souls learning under unsafe conditions. Amongst other schools is Esethu Primary School in Mthatha, where teachers are forced to use toilets as staffroom and pupils are taught in tents that were used as offices by a construction company.

The second one is Ngangolwandle Senior Secondary School in Eliottdale, where pupils sit outside in scorching heat, cold and windy conditions; because the department has not build them classrooms. Pupils make use of canvas shelter and trees as ground and classrooms. The third school is ... [Time expired.] Thank you.

EFFECTS OF DROUGHT IN THE NORTHERN KWAZULU-NATAL

(Member's Statement)

Mr E N MTHETHWA (ANC): Hon Chair, the ANC believes that the country will only be able to mitigate the impact of the drought through collective effort. We would like to acknowledge that the effect of the current drought has affected many areas, especially the Northern KwaZulu-Natal known as uMkhanyakude area in KwaZulu-Natal.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 107 of 175

The communities are without water in those areas, are depending on farm communities with strong boreholes who are now selling water to them. However, the intervention of the government in the 94 affected municipalities should be commended. The intervention by the government under the leadership of hon comrade Nomvula Mokonyane has seen emergency and short terms mitigation measures including refurbishing of boreholes, repairing critical infrastructure and providing water tanker to the affected areas.

We call upon municipality in the area to step in and supply water to those communities and stop the white farmers from taking advantage of the drought situation in the area by selling water to those that are in need. We are appealing to the municipality to ensure that they do their best to come on board. I thank you.

POOR SERVICE DELIVERY IN THE DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS

(Member's Statement)

Rev K R J MESHOE (ACDP): Chairperson, today I want to highlight the appalling and very poor service that the Department of Home Affairs continues to give to our people. As members of 10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 108 of 175

Parliament we continually receive complaints and requests for intervention.

On 18 January 2016, I sent an e-mail to Mr Mkhize's office at Home Affairs requesting assistance in the issuing of three marriage certificates that were applied for in July last year. Within hours his office responded requesting further information which was submitted the following day. A month later, I wrote to the same office again enquiring about the progress made and the following day Mr Mkhize's office forwarded my e-mail to four managers who were requested to deal with the matter. Part of the e-mail sent to them reads, and I quote:

Dear managers, can we kindly respond to Reverend Meshoe's e-mail today, please. This matter was forwarded for your urgent attention in January and no one responded.

To date, the recipients of Mr Mkhize's e-mail, namely: Mr Ramudumo, Ramsanda Kungwane and Pillay have not responded or heeded the urgent request by Mr Mkhize to finalise the marriage certificates of the three couples that applied in July last year.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 109 of 175

I find this disgraceful and I am appealing to the Leader of government business, Deputy President Ramaphosa and the Minister of Home Affairs to intervene in this long outstanding matter, so that the three couples who have been greatly inconvenienced can finally receive their certificates and I also appeal to them to ensure that service delivery at Home Affairs is greatly improved. Thank you.

Nksz R M M LESOMA (ANC): Sihlalo ohloniphekile. Sisukuma siwuKhongolose ngokukhulu ukushaqeka nokudumala ngombiko owenziwe ibhodi leKhomishana yamaLungelo aBantu ngezindlu zangasese zase-Cape Town la sikhona. Ukungaphatheki kahle kwenziwa uhlelo lwezindlu zangasese. Umbiko oqhamuke nalento, ikomishana eqhamuke naloku okokuthi uMasipala waseKapa uhlulekile ukuletha izindlu zangasese ezinesithunzi noma ezihloniphekile kumphakathi ohlala ezindlini zokuzakhela. Emasontweni amabili nje adlule, ikhomishana ibambisene nombiko okhishwe inkampani i-Social Justice Coalition ike yavakashela laphaya eKhayelitsha yabona ngokwayo izindlu zangasese ezingomahamba nendlwana ukuthi azithululwa ngendlela efanele, ngezikhawu ezifanele, kuyihlazo nechilo lokho bakwethu.

EKhayelitsha ikhomishana ibone ukuthi abantu eminyakeni emingaka bengaphansi kwe-DA kusenjena namanje? Okusho ukuthi abantu

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 110 of 175

abamnyama nabantu bakithi abahluphekayo abanakho ukuhlonipheka. Kusobala ukuthi i-DA eKhayelitsha, la eKapa, ihlulekile ukuqiniseka ukuthi abantu abampofu bayayithola impilo engcono. Lo hulumeni we-DA olapha eKapa, uhluleke ngalendlela yokuthi nami nginamahloni. Ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Ms R M M LESOMA (ANC): Hon Chairperson. We as ANC rise with shock and disappointment with regard to the report that was presented by the Commission of Human Rights about the toilets in Cape Town, where we are. My sadness is caused by the way the issue of these toilets has been dealt with. The report that was presented by this commission stated that Cape Town municipality failed to provide descent toilets for people who stay in their own houses. Two weeks ago, the commission together with the report from Social Justice Coalition Company visited Khayelitsha and saw themselves portable toilets that are not emptied in a correct way, they are also emptied timeously, which is a shame and a disgrace.

In Khayelitsha, the commission saw that this is still the situation after the people have been led by the DA for such a long time. Which shows that the black people and our people that are poor have no dignity. This will count, that DA in

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 111 of 175

Khayelitsha, here in Cape Town failed to ensure that poor people get a better living. The DA government here in Cape Town failed in a way that I am even ashamed. Thank you.]

ANC HAS NO ANSWER FOR UNEMPLOYMENT

(Member's Statement)

Ms H S BOSHOFF (DA): Chairperson, the ANC has no answer for unemployment. In Mpumalanga, 39,4% of the people are unemployed. The MEC on finances has no idea on how he will get people into work and lift thousands out of a state of desperation. In his recent budget speech the MEC had no game plan changes or proposals for economic growth. He missed the opportunity to create jobs through infrastructure development projects supported by public-private partnerships. The DA believes that not only will public private partnerships improve infrastructure, but they will also greatly assist in improving service delivery in the province.

A DA-led provincial administration would also prioritise funding for education and skills development. It would facilitate job creation in the province and establish an environment that is supportive of the emergence of entrepreneurs by cutting red

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 112 of 175

tape, establishing incentives for job creation, scrapping the useless Mpumalanga Growth Agency, establishing a new agency to support small and medium enterprises and stimulate economic growth specifically in rural communities. The DA will achieve growth by implementing its growth plan which uses ideas that have proved to be successful. Continued ANC administration ... [Time expired.] ...

ANC COMMENDS DEPARTMENT OF BASIC EDUCATION AND DEPARTMENT OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY FOR SUPPORTING ST JOHN'S COLLEGE

(Member's Statement)

Adv L K B MPUMLWANA (ANC): The ANC congratulates both the Department of Basic Education and the Department of Science and Technology for supporting the St John's College which is in my constituency in Mthatha. Through this support, Maths and Science are now compulsory subjects at this school which has more than 2 000 learners enrolled.

Two grade 12 learners from the St Johns College, Kukhokuhle

Tsengwa and Aviwe Blackbeard, have recently received awards from
the Minister, Angie Motshekga, for respectively obtaining
positions two and three in the whole country in maths and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 113 of 175

science category. I further congratulate the staff of the school as led by their principal, Mr Magaqa, for their good work.

However, we call on government to continue assisting this school as it still needs a hall for writing exams and additional 10 classrooms. Thank you. [Applause.]

VIOLENT PROTESTS AT UNIVERSITIES CONDEMNED

(Member's Statement)

Mr J M K MAHUMAPELO (AGANG): Chairperson, this country cannot afford reckless politicking, politics without substance where leaders manipulate and take our people for a ride. We must unite in condemning any violent service delivery protest. We are asking ourselves, how is the burning of libraries and universities going to help the course of students or education? We do share in their frustrations but it is becoming very difficult to separate this good course from hooliganism and political manipulation.

This country is facing serious challenges, exploitation of workers and majority of people are also landless. Furthermore, private sectors are profit driven with their loyalty somewhere else with our Finance Minister going around begging investors.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 114 of 175

This is an indication that our country's sovereignty has been decimated. We are just an economic colony of the West which will even sponsor parties to resist more change, even to ferment civil disobedience by using corrupt leaders. We might differ politically, but we must unite to protect this land, our independence and our freedom to be who we are. Anyone who will betray this principle will be mistaken. I thank you.

SOCIAL MOVEMENT AGAINST DRUGS AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE LAUNCHED IN ELDORADO PARK

(Member's Statement)

Ms B L ABRAHAMS (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC believes that it is significant to create strong families, cohesive communities and a winning prosperous nation that promotes social cohesion and stable communities. The fight against substance abuse is a key aspect in this regard because substance abuse is a scourge that has the potential to destabilise our nation. On Friday 04 March the Premier of Gauteng, hon David Makhura, officially launched the social movement against drugs and other substance abuse in Eldorado Park.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 115 of 175

What the movement seeks to achieve is to bring all the stakeholders in civil society together with government to find a solution in preventing the scourge of substance abuse in the province. The movement is an integrated and well co-ordinated social transformation service delivery machinery that is protective, preventative promotive, transformative, developmental and generative for the delivery of equitable, sustainable, reliable and efficient service to eliminate poverty and unemployment, inequality, sexism, racialism and social exclusion, the burden of disease, and increase safety and provision of modern human settlement in partnership with an active citizenry.

The movement is a collective effort throughout the Gauteng province working with all the local drug action committees.

Government cannot do it alone. It has been seen that when the community work together with government we can make a difference.

The ANC calls on all society's in their various wards to get involved with the local drug action committee in their wards. Standing and viewing from the sideline will not benefit our communities in preventing the scourge of substance abuse in South Africa, Gauteng and all other provinces. I thank you.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 116 of 175

CALL FOR INTERNATIONAL TRADE ADMINISTRATION COMMISSION TO SCRAP SCRAP NEW PROPOSALS ON METAL EXPORTS

(Member's Statements)

Dr M J CARDO (DA): The DA calls upon the International Trade
Administration Commission, ITAC, to scrap its new proposals on
scrap metal exports as they could lead to 400 000 job losses in
the informal sector. On the eve of the December holidays last
year, proposed amendments to the price preference system on the
exportation of ferrous and non-ferrous waste and scrap were
published in the government gazette.

Bizzarely, the proposals include the requirement that all scrap metals will have to be exported through the port of Port Elizabeth. This would result in scrap metal dealers outside of Port Elizabeth raking up extra transport costs of up to R700 per ton. These costs will then be passed on to generators in the form of lower prices paid for scrap metals.

The scrap metal industry contributes R15 billion annually to the South African economy. Industry experts predict that should the amendments be adopted, 400 000 jobs would be lost in the informal sector. At a time when the economy is bleeding jobs, we

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 117 of 175

can ill afford more job crushing regulations. The DA believes that the proposed amendments should be consigned to the scrapheap pit immediately. [Applause.]

ANC CONDEMNS SHOOTING OF WITZENBERG FARM WORKER

(Member's Statement)

Mr A F MADELLA (ANC): The ANC is outraged by the continued spate of random shooting of farm workers by white farmers especially in the Western Cape. We condemn these criminal acts and demand immediate action from the relevant authorities. It is in this context that we condemn the reckless behaviour of a local farmer in Witzenberg and the security officer for shooting at two unarmed suspects farm workers at the local farm. Mr David Adonis, one of the victims, was shot twice, one bullet in the stomach and one on his arm, at close range by the farmer without any warning shots.

The community of Wolseley is outraged by the incident and they have stated that this is not the first time that the same farmer has committed such an act. The farmer and the security officer have been arrested and released on bail in the local magistrate

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 118 of 175

court. The recent shooting shows the backward attitude of some farmers in this country.

We demand that those involved be held accountable, especially the farmer, who forced his officer to partake in this crime. We are also calling on the farmers in this country to stop adopting barbaric attitudes against their employees. They must report all cases of suspected theft to the police and not take the law into their own hands. Thank you. [Applause.]

MINISTERS' IAL RESPONSES

ANC CONCERNED WITH RECENT VIOLENCE IN KWAZULU-NATAL

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Hon Chair, let me thank the member of the IFP hon Singh for the question you asked. The ANC is equally concerned with what has been is happening at Mandeni Local Municipality these past few days. We can assure you that the leadership of the ANC in that province is on the ground interacting with people so that whatever you see happening there, does not happen. What is most particularly worrying is the destruction of property especially the sources where people

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 119 of 175

get employment, the factories around the area. So, the ANC is dealing with the matter and we should see the results soon.

Thank you very much.

LAND CLAIMS SETTLED DURING 2014-15 FINANCIAL YEAR

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORMS: Hon Chair, the comment that was raised by the hon member from the PAC that people that are landless, is true. A lot of people of are landless. There was a question asked of us yesterday of how many land claims, during the 2014-15 financial year, were settled and how many of those had opted for land?

Hon Chair, there were 428 land claims settled. Of that 428 only 39 opted for land and 389 opted for money. Hon members of this House stay with people out there.

Bahlala nabantu kodwa abathethi nabo babacebise ukuba mabafune umhlaba. Ngumbuzo lo ebendiwubuzwe izolo ntonje khange ndifumane thuba lakuwuphendula. La mbuzo uhambisa uthi, bangaphi abantu abangoomama? Ngama-2607 oomama abaxhamleyo. Abantu abawufuni umhlaba kuba bahlala ezidolophini bakhetha imali. Amalungu eNdlu

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 120 of 175

yoWiso-mthetho awabancedisi abantu ekuhlaleni ntonje bakhala apha kule Ndlu. Enkosi. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[They stay with people but they don't advise them to opt for land. This is the question I've asked yesterday but I didn't get an answer. That question asks, how many women? It is 2607 women who benefited. People do not opt for land because they stay in towns they opt for money. Members of the August House do not assist them in the communities but they complain in this House. Thank you.]

SHOOTING OF FARM WORKERS IN WESTERN CAPE

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: To hon Madella on the question of violence and the shooting of farm workers by farmers. This reflects a province that refuses to accept that racism is still a problem and racism should be dealt with by all. We have invited as a department even Afro Forum to sit down with them to discuss the fate of farmers as they get attacked and also equally the fate of farmer workers.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 121 of 175

Ubuxelegu bobuhlanga soze buhlanjwe ngasephu kwaye oko kufuneka kuvunyiwe ngabantu ukuba ngenene ubuhlanga liqhenkqe elingasokuze silinyamezele. Nokuba singafihla iintloko phakathi kwamadolo singafuni ukuvuma, bona ubuhlanga buyagquba eNtshona Koloni. Inyaniso yona zezi zimbo zokuleqwa kwabantu ingathi zizilwanyana zizingelwa. Yibani neentloni madoda, ningqalane kwaye nixelelane ukuba ukukhanyela ubuhlanga esidlangalaleni akuncedi nto kuba buza kuphutshuluka okomsila wembulu.

Siyanicela DA ukuba nisebenzisane eNtshona Koloni, nicenge amagwangqa aneefama ukuba xa umntu emoshile akhona amapolisa, okumleqa ambambe. Ukunikina intloko nkosi yam akuncedi, into efunekayo kukucengana nihlambe ubuhlanga kuba abunasepha, abunakugqunywa kwaye bunevumba elibi. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwatywa.] (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[The scourge of racism will never be washed away by any soap and people need to understand that really racism is a leprosy that we will never tolerate. Whether we hide our heads between our knees and refuse to accept it, but racism is quite rife in the Western Cape. The truth is that there is this habit of chasing people as if they are animals being hunted. Shame on you! You need to confront each other and stop denying the existence of racism in public because doing that will not bear any good

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 122 of 175

results instead will cause more damage. DA, we appeal to you to be more cooperative in the Western Cape, and ask the white farmers to allow the Saps to do their job in cases where someone has done something wrong. To shake your head my chief is of no use, what is needed is to appeal with each other and rid yourselves of racism because there is no soap to use for that, it cannot be concealed and it also has a foul smell. Thank you. [Applause.]]

ANC HAS NO ANSWER TO UNEMPLOYMENT PEOPLE OF GUGULETHU SUFFER UNDER THE DA-LED CAPETOWN

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you to the hon member of the ANC, the Human Rights Commission and also to the Social Justice Coalition for exposing this same and gross violation of the human rights. Yesterday, I made reference to the City of Cape Town, as amongst those with the highest numbers of the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, but when it comes to full time equivalence Cape Town is the lowest, which indicates that they employ people for the shortest period.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 123 of 175

I must say on this toilet-cleaning programme which is part of the EPWP - workers are exposed to the worst working conditions and very unhygienic conditions. Workers are so compromised in terms of no training, no proper chemicals, no cleaning materials and no protective clothing. It shows how cheap the Western Cape City, which is Cape Town, is taking the life of the black workers. This is a serious violation of the workers' rights, undermining the basic conditions of employment. They are not interested in the worker's health, but only interested in their votes.

I would be sharing this with my colleagues, the Minister of Labour and the Minister of Water and Sanitation that we send inspectors to go and look this embarrassing thing which they are doing and inspect those working sites. This is hypocrisy of the worst of the City of Cape Town which parade itself as the best in terms of governance, but look at what they are doing about the rights and the violation of those rights of the black workers. Thank you. [Applause.]

IMPACT OF DROUGHT

(Minister's Response)

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 124 of 175

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Ma'am, on the issue that has been raised by hon member Mthethwa from the ANC regarding uMkhanyakude, we really wish to appreciate the feedback that he has given to us. However, I want to also indicate to the House and the communities in uMkhanyakude that the ANC Provincial government in KwaZulu-Natal having looked at the incapacities and the challenges in uMkhanyakude District Municipality, has taken over the administration of that municipality. Working together with them, we've been able to provide these kinds of interventions that are now making a big difference in uMkhanyakude.

However, in dealing with the issues of access to water, we have already started interacting with the legal communities and various stakeholders in the water sector to say that no South African has the monopoly of the use or distribution of water, particularly to the disadvantaged communities. It is illegal; it is wrong that commercial farmers in that part of South Africa can sell water to our own communities. When you have a water right, you are given the right to use the quantity that is being given to you. You do not have a right to then commercialise the distribution of water in that area. Hence, the application now of "Use it or lose it" with the licence that you have.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 125 of 175

Okokugcina, ngempela isimo saseMkhanyakude bekuyisimo ebesingathokozisi neze. Yingakho-ke naleliya damu laseJozini silibhobozile futhi safaka namapayipi asesiza ukuthi amanzi akwazi ukufinyelela emakhaya. Esikhathini esiningi la manzi ebephelela nje ezimbonini lapho abantu begaya khona ushukela. Manje namanye amakhaya aseduze naleliya damu aseyakwazi ukuthola amanzi - ngikhuluma ngezindawo ezingaphezu kwama-35. Ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Lastly, indeed the situation in uMkhanyakude was not a good one. That is the reason why we opened that dam and connected pipes that help with distributing water to the homes. Most of the time this water would only reach the sugar mills. So the other houses that are near this dam are now able to get water. I am talking about more than 35 areas. Thank you.]

OPENING OF NEW POLICE STATION IN DIEPSLOOT CONGRATULATION TO SAPS IN THE DA-LED CAPE TOWN

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF POLICE: Hon Chair and hon members, we welcome the statements that have been made. We welcome the statement in relation to the building and the launching of the Diepsloot

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 126 of 175

Police Station and assure hon Molebatsi that we remain committed as the SA Police Service in working together with the South African communities in improving the level of policing, but also with a full understanding that we can only bring about peace and stability as and when we work together all of us, as South Africans.

The point made by hon Mbhele of the DA, particularly on the question of the decrease in shootings - I think it's quite a positive statement from Mr Mbhele. We do welcome that and perhaps, what that does, it then attests to the fact that as and when you have a situation where there are collaborative efforts between the police and members of the community on the ground it improves the level of visibility - not only that, but also better levels of policing. So, thank you very much and thank you, ma'am. [Applause.]

CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF DRAFT NOTICE AND SCHEDULE DETERMINING THE RATE AT WHICH SALARIES ARE PAYABLE TO MAGISTRATES ANNUALLY

Mr B T Bongo, as a member of the Committee, introduced the Report.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 127 of 175

There was no debate.

Draft Notice and Schedule determining rate, with effect from 1 April 2015, at which salaries, allowances and benefits are payable to magistrates annually approved.

CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF DRAFT

NOTICE AND SCHEDULE DETERMINING THE RATE AT WHICH SALARIES ARE

PAYABLE TO CONSTITUTIONAL COURT JUDGES AND JUDGES ANNUALLY

Mr B T Bongo as a member of the Committee, introduced the Report.

There was no debate,

Draft Notice and Schedule determining rate, with effect from 1 April 2015, at which salaries, allowances and benefits are payable to Constitutional Court Judges and Judges annually approved.

Declarations of vote:

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon House Chairperson, in the absence of the respect for the rule of law and for the Constitution by the ANC-led government, our last hope is the Judiciary. We have in many

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 128 of 175

judgements witnessed the judiciary restore faith in the rule of law. As the EFF we support the proposed salaries of judges and magistrates as approved by the committee.

We further call on the committee to see this as we look at the Justice and Constitutional Development budget, more resources must be allocated for judges and magistrates to do the work properly. If we are not careful, deliberate attempts to sabotage the work of the judiciary can be done by providing limited financial resources and we must never allow this to happen. Without our courts, we have nothing until such time that the EFF is in government. Thank you.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon House Chair, on 24 February, President Zuma announced a 4,4% increase in the salaries of public office bearers which is 1,6% lower than inflation. This modest increase applies equally to all Constitutional Court justices and judges of the Judiciary.

The NFP would like to have seen an increase on par with that of the magistrate, for our judges and justices are the final arbitrators of justice in our country and the importance of their work can never be fully compensated in monetary terms. We acknowledge that South Africa is in the grip of economic

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 129 of 175

difficulties and that the austerity measures have to be put in place and we are in agreement with the intention behind the decision of the President.

However, the impartiality and the excellence in the Judiciary come at a price. We are of the opinion that cutting down on wasteful and fruitless expenditure in government departments would have been a far more productive austerity measure than limiting the salary increases of justices and judges. In conclusion, having voiced our concern, the NFP accepts the rates of remuneration as contained in the schedules and support the Portfolio Committee of Justice and Correctional Services report tabled before us today. Thank you.

Ms M R P MOTHAPO: Hon House Chairperson, as a committee, we looked at the issue of disparities of salaries of prosecutors, judges and magistrates and we took a resolution that as a committee, we should meet with Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers to come up with a solution to close the existing gap and improvement of magistrates working conditions. The Lower Courts Amendment Act will definitely assist in this regard.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 130 of 175

Ke nyaka go go tsebiša gore ke a makala lehono ge ke bona maloko a EFF ao ka komiting mehla le mehla re hwetšago ba kgopela tshwarelo ba re ba ka se kgone go tla kopanong. Ba swanetše go ba ba emelwa ke mohl Mna Malema efela ba tla fela ge go etla Mošireletši wa Setšhaba ga ba ke ba etla le kopanong ya komiti. (Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)

[I would like to let you know that today I am surprised to see the members of the EFF in this meeting. They always send apologies to the committee for not being able to attend the meeting. They always have hon Mr Malema representing them, but when the Public Protector comes, they show up.]

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Matiase. What are you rising on, hon Matiase?

Mr N S MATIASE: I am rising on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. What is your point of order?

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 131 of 175

Mr N S MATIASE: The hon member is making a frivolous accusation about our commander-in-chief. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member.

Mr N S MATIASE: The commander-in-chief ... [Interjections.] ... assumes an overall responsibility ... [Interjections.] ... over EFF delegation to this Parliament.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, sit down. I think we are not privy to the issues of the committee. So, let's not go there. Continue, hon member.

Ms M R P MOTHAPO: Hon House Chairperson, as a committee — e very progressive committee ... [Interjections.] ... a very progressive one, yes, we deal with very critical issues and I would like to thank all those members who always avail themselves in our committee. Thank you so much for always being present and not only present when the Public Protector is coming to the committee.

Therefore as the ANC, as we support the independence of the judiciary, as you have seen yesterday, we made a very powerful statement whereby the ANC-led government has built a Limpopo

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 132 of 175

Division High Court in promoting access to justice for rural communities. We therefore fully support this report. Thank you.

Question put.

Motion agreed to.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT - CHILDREN'S AMENDMENT BILL

Nks C R CAPA: Sihlalo ohloniphekileyo, iNdlu ngokubanzi kunye namalungu ahlonophekileyo, ndiphakamela ukuthi thaca ingxelo kule Ndlu yoWiso-mthetho malungu nezihlomelo ezithe zafakelwa ezibizwa ngokuba yi-Children's Amendment Bill [B13-2015] Esi sihlomelo besiye saphakanyiswa ngohloniphekileyo uMnumzana uWaters kule Ndlu esithi wenzela into yokuba ukuba ubani uthe wafunyanwa eneziphoso ezigwenxa zokuphatha gadalala abantwana ngazo naziphina iindlela, makathathwe njengomntu onetyala kunokuba kuthiwe ufunyenwe enetyala.

Le nto ithi uthathwa njengomntu onetyala ithetha ukuba kufuneka kuphinde kwenziwe olunye uphando oluza kukufumanisa unetyala.

Kananjalo, xa kusithiwa ufunyenwe unetyala, aluqhutywa uphando kuba ufunyenwe unetyala kwaye ungumoni ongavumelekanga

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 133 of 175

ukusebenza nabantwana. Ikomiti iye yawuqwalasela kakhulu lo mbono yawuphonononga, yacela ilungu elihloniphekileyo ukuba lize kuthi thaca eyalo ingxelo. Lingenile isebe emva koko lachaza ukuba lo mhlathi oguqulweyo nohlonyelweyo lilingu elihloniphekileyo, ngumhlathi ongunombolo we-120 we-Children's Act of 2005. Noko ke kunjalo isebe lithe lona sele liwuphethe lo mba, kodwa yena uMnumzana uWaters usebenza umhlathi ongunombolo we-120, lo gama nalo lisebe lo mhlathi ongunombolo we-120 kunye nemihlathi emithathu.

Siye sacela iSebe lezoBulungisa noPhuhliso loMgaqo-siseko ukuba liphonononge lo mba kwaye nalo libeke elayo imbono ukujonga ukuba ingaba kukhona kusini na ukuchasana kule mithetho. Ikomiti ibibeke phambi kwayo isihlomelo esingu-B12 we-Children's Amendment Bill, iphinde ibe no-B13 executive Bill nebiqhutywa lisebe elikhokelwa nguMama ohloniphekileyo uBathabile Dlamini onguMphathiswa.

Emva kokuba sixoxile ubuyile kwakhona uMnu uWaters, savumelana ngelithi akachaselanga kweli solotya alibona njengelenza ukuba iNkundla yoMgaqo-siseko ingagwebi kakuhle xa igweba abantwana isebenzisa iCandelo 120 lalo Mthetho. Inkundla ide yazifakelela ngokwayo isolotya elithi xa umntwana egwetywa kusithiwa angaze aphinde asebenze nabantwana, ze kwakhona kufakwe igama lakhe

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 134 of 175

kumqulu wabantu abanjalo kweli lizwe, nto leyo eza kwenza ukuba angaze aphinde asebenze nabantwana nasebudaleni bakhe, makanikwe ithuba lokuzithethelela.

Emva kokuba sixoxile savumelana kwingxoxo-mpiswano ebimnandi nebipholile, uMnu uWaters uvumile ukuba ikomiti kulilungelo layo lokuba ingaqhubi nalo Mthetho kuba eli solotya liza kulungiswa kwi executive Bill. Kungoko ke sisithi thaca le ngxelo kwaye sicela ukuba sixhaswe yile komiti. Isebe maliqhube nale Children's Amendment Bill [B13-2015] ukuze singaphinde sithi esi sihlomelo besithunyelwe yile Ndlu singabi saqhubeka naso ngenxa yezi zizathu sele ndizithe thaca. Ndibulela ngentlonipho enkulu ithuba endilifumeyo, ndicela kananjalo ukuba ikomiti niyinike inkxaso. Siyawabulela namalungu indlela awuphethe ngayo lo mba nendlela athe ahloniphana ngayo xa ebexoxa. Enkosi kakhulu. [Kwaqhwatywa.] (Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[Ms C R CAPA: Hon Chairperson, the House at large and hon members, I rise to table before the House a report on amendments to the Children's Amendment Bill [B13-2015]. This amendment was proposed in this House by hon Waters to provide for any person who is found guilty of serious offences of child abuse in any way, to be deemed guilty instead of being declared as having been found guilty.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 135 of 175

The concept of being deemed guilty means that another investigation must be carried out which will find one guilty.

Furthermore, when it is said that you have been found guilty, no investigation is carried out because you have been found guilty and you are an offender who is not allowed to work with children. The committee considered and thoroughly analysed this view, and asked the hon member to present his own report.

Thereafter the department came in on this and explained that the section to be amended and inserted by the hon member is section 120 of the Children's Act of 2005. The department indicated that it was dealing with this matter already, and Mr Waters proposed an amendment to section 120 whereas the department dealt with section 120 and three paragraphs.

We then asked the Department of Justice and Constitutional

Development to analyse this matter and it also gave its opinion
on whether there is contradiction between the two pieces of
legislation. The committee tabled amendment B12 of the

Children's Amendment Bill and also B13 of the executive Bill
proposed by hon Minister Bathabile Dlamini.

After thorough discussions Mr Waters came back and we agreed that he was not against the amendment that provides that, a child that has been convicted and has been found unsuitable to

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 136 of 175

work with children again and has his or her name in the register of offenders in this country, which will make him or her unsuitable to work with children even in adulthood, should be given an opportunity to make representations.

After thorough discussions in a nice and peaceful debate, Mr Waters agreed that the committee has a right not to proceed with this legislation because this amendment will be dealt with in the executive Bill. That is why we are tabling this report and asking for support as the committee. The department should proceed with the Children's Amendment Bill [B13-2015] so that the amendment proposed by this House is not delayed owing to the reasons mentioned above. I am very grateful for the opportunity and would also like to ask you to support the committee. We also thank members for the manner in which they handled this matter and the way they showed respect to one another during the debate. Thank you very much. [Applause.]]

Declarations:

Ms E R WILSON: Chair, the Private Member's Bill submitted by the hon Waters of the DA was indicative of a passionate and caring member wanting to protect our children. When the committee voted against the desirability of the Private Member's Bill, it was

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 137 of 175

not on the grounds that the Bill was undesirable. The committee found the amendments very desirable.

There were two other amendments of the Children's Act before the portfolio committee which were submitted by the department after the Private Member's Bill was tabled. The committee was in agreement that the amendments proposed by the hon Waters should be included in the amendments proposed to the Children's Act.

However, while we are encouraged by the amendments to the Children's Act and the strengthened protection of children, the Act means nothing if there is a lack of infrastructure on the ground to ensure compliance. The Department of Social Development advised that in order to adhere to the Children's Act, we need a minimum of 60 000 social workers by 2030. At present, there were under 20 000 social workers.

Over 2 000 of the 9 000-plus bursary-graduate social workers have still not been employed, despite a contractual obligation of the department. With the increasing crime, gangsterism, drugs, plus the increasing levels of unemployment and poverty, one social worker for 3 500 people, particularly in the rural areas is just not acceptable. How can the department assure an

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 138 of 175

adherence to the Act if nothing is being done to meet the requirements?

The register of people declared unsuitable to work with children is in shambles. We are flooded with complaints of people who continue to apply and get no response from the register.

Accessing information is taking months to the detriment of needy children. There is no co-ordination between the Justice and Correctional Services departments and Social Development to ensure that the register is current.

Every month NGOs, particularly those dealing with statutory referrals from the courts, have to close: Due to late payments; no increase in subsidies for more than five years; or because they were half-hour late with their application. These are foster care, domestic abuse, child abuse and rape cases to name a few. This has resulted in these organisations handing over the court files to officers of the department where they are laying on tables, collecting dust, because there insufficient qualified social workers to deal with them.

The good work on the Children's Act as well as any other Act falling under this department is wasted until such time as the measures are put in place to ensure that the Department is

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 139 of 175

compliant with its own Acts. This does not apply and is indicative that the Minister does not care for the people and particularly the children of South Africa. I thank you!

[Applause.]

Mr N P KHOZA: The EFF is irritated by the useless political gymnastics between the DA and the ANC. All same, South Africans would support any move to ensure that people who are found to be sexually abusive to children are banned from ever working with children again. The Private Member's Bill by Mr Walters of the DA, sought to amend the Children's Act of 2005, to insert these specific provisions whose end goals is to protect our children from unscrupulous individuals.

We now know that the Minister of Social Development has initiated similar amendments to the Act, with just minor differences to the DA's amendments. So, why is it that they cannot work together for the benefit of the common good? The committee report indicates that it will not go forward with the Private Members Bill but will incorporate some unspecified elements of the Private Member's Bill to the amendments initiated by the Minister.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 140 of 175

Our argument therefore is that this committee report is unnecessary, more so in light of the fact that the process started by the Minister is still pending. We are not just subjected to verbal gymnastics with the ANC wanting to shine on the DA's shine, and the DA wanting to prove that it is clever than the blacks of the ANC while our children suffer from demented abusers.

We reject this report and ask the committee to hasten and finish the amendments as initiated by the Minister.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon Chairperson, I think I just need to correct the member of the EFF. In fact, all of us worked together for the common good, and the EFF was not present. So, I am not sure what you would want to say. [Applause.]

[Interjections.]

This is a Bill that will protect the children of South Africa - not party politics! [Interjections.] Hon House Chairperson, with the tabling of this report, we close the chapter on a successful Private Member's Bill. I wish to commend the hon Mike Waters for his initiative, his courage and his foresights. [Laughter.]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 141 of 175

We appreciate the efforts he made to point out the aspects of our legislation which did not serve to ensure that the vulnerable children are adequately protected. This is a victory for our most vulnerable citizens and a victory for Private Member's Bills.

I figured also befitting therefore to take a moment to honour the late member of this House who fought for and won our right to introduce legislation. Let me quote from a statement, what the late the hon IFP Member of Parliament Dr Mario Oriani-Ambrosini expressed on 9 October 2012, when he said:

The Constitutional Court has today handed down its judgement on the challenge of constitutionality which I brought against the Rules of Parliament which prevented a Member of Parliament from introducing a Bill in the National Assembly.

The Constitutional Court found in my favour. This is not my personal victory but it is a victory for a South African democracy. The Constitutional Court has held that Members of Parliament have the constitutional right and obligation to introduce legislation and can to do so without receiving the permission of anyone else.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 142 of 175

This groundbreaking initiative opened a way for the hon Waters to introduce a Private Member's Bill to ensure greater protection for the children of our country. His Children's Amendment Act Private Member's Bill [PMB 2-2015] sought inter alia to ensure that an adult convicted of any offence against a child in terms of the Sexual Offences Act or the Criminal Law Act will be deemed to be found unsuitable to work with children.

After extensive discussion, the Portfolio Committee on Social Development declared the bill of vital importance, but since there was already a process underway, namely the Children's Amendment Bill, it was resolved that the Private Member's Bill will be merged with the processes already underway.

We are confident that all the changes the hon Waters sought are currently being accommodated in the executive Bill. His inputs will therefore live on in the first Children's Amendment Bill which will soon be concluded and brought to this House for finalisation. Let me also align myself with the member of the DA who raised the critical issue of the lack of social workers in our country. We must take not that without social workers, we cannot implement policy and we cannot protect our children.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 143 of 175

Finally, let this report also serve as a reminder to all of us today in this House, that it is our duty, whether we sit on the ruling party's benches or on the opposition benches, to hold the executive to account. It is our duty to ensure that our legislation espouses the values as enshrined in our Constitution. [Time expired.] And, it is our duty to serve the electorate to the best of our abilities. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chair, hon members, safeguarding the interests and wellbeing of our children is the ultimate responsibility of society which must be prioritised above all else. The hon Waters' Private Member's Bill should be viewed in that regard. We want to commend the member for the passion and vision to sponsor a Bill of this nature.

The Bill, in the first instance, aims at amending the Children's Act of 2005 so as to insert certain definitions, to provide that a person convicted of social offence or an offence for a possession of child pornography be deemed unsuitable to work with children, to afford a child orphan an opportunity to make representation as to why a finding of unsuitability to work with children should not be made amongst other things.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 144 of 175

We live in times where children are always exposed to risks of attempted murder, murder itself, assault, rape, all forms of molestation and pornography. This is done mostly by those who should be protecting them: Either a relative; a neighbour; a friend of family; a family member; and worst of all, by their foster parent, guardians or parents.

Most of the legislation on children's rights takes queue from the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of the Child.

Taking into consideration the report of the Portfolio Committee on Social Development tabled here today, the NFP is satisfied with the recommendation not to proceed with the Children's Amendment Bill. However, we encourage members to come with more Private Members' Bills as the hon Waters has done.

The NFP is also satisfied with the undertaking that the content of the Private Member's Bill will be meaningfully incorporated in the executive Bill. On the basis of that, we support the report of the Portfolio Committee on Social Development tabled here today.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon House Chair, the UDM supports the report. Two days ago we moved a motion without notice about a four-year-old

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 145 of 175

girl-child who was brutally raped. The scourge of the abuse of both a boy and a girl-child must, as we mark the human rights month, gain prominence. Child abuse has become so common such that newspaper and television news are so full of reports about children's mistreatments. such that OneYou cannot help but wonder how safe is the future of our children and the society at large.

Over and above adopting Bills, Acts, policies and regulations, members of this House must be daily activists against child abuse and promotion of children's rights. Our starting point should be the adoption and implementation of a consistent civil education programme on the rights of children and strategies against their abuse. In this regard and through our civil education programmes, target children, parents and members of the community, including purported culprits.

We must do more for our girls and boys so that we avoid what was said by Jamie, when she said:

Because I didn't get any help straight away, it was all weighing on me and I didn't know how to deal with it. I was just suppressing it for as long as I could but then it would come rushing out and I would go over and over it in my head.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 146 of 175

The anger was just bubbling up and little things would trigger it. I was scared about what I would do to the boys if I saw them again. I didn't have anyone to talk to about it. My mum was there for me but I didn't find it easy to talk to her, both because I was struggling to find the right words and I felt ashamed; like I'd let it happen to me.

With Tthe adoption of this Bill followed by clear implementable programme of action, led by us as members of this NA, joined by all other social groups, the purpose and the objectives of this Bill will be realised. Indeed, we will be contributing to the building a better tomorrow for our children. Once again, the UDM supports the Bill. I thank you.

Nks R N CAPA: I-ANC sele iyixhasile into yokuba mayivunywe le ngxelo. Ndinamazwi endinqwenela ukuwajolisa phaya kunyana wethu, ilungu le-EFF ebelithetha apha. I-ANC iyayazi apho kuyiwa khona, ayinaxhala. Isantya esi sicothayo ehamba ngaso ilawulwa kuba iyacolisisa ukuze kungabikhonto eshiyekayo. Kuyinyaniso ukuba i-ANC ayisoloko ifuna impi nalapho ingekhoyo. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Ms R N CAPA: The ANC has already supported that the report must be agreed to. I would like to say something to our son, the hon

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 147 of 175

member of the EFF who was speaking here. The ANC knows where to go, it doesn't have any fear. It uses the slow pace because it wants to make things perfect so that it doesn't leave incomplete things behind. It is true that the ANC doesn't like to fight unnecessarily.]

We choose which battles to fight. We just do not want to fight anything that is not fighting with us.

Lo Mthetho osaYilwayo uziswa apha ukuze kwenziwe isihlomelo kuMthetho okhoyo labe isebe lona liwuqhuba uMthetho njengoMthetho osaYilwayo osuka kuMphathiswa, yinto endiye ndayicacisa leyo. Awukwazi ke ngoko ukuba uthi lo Mthetho osaYilwayo xa kusenziwa isihlomelo kuwo, uthi wena besizama njee imvano. Umbutho we-ANC ukhokela ngentlonipho. Ukuba iLungu lePalemente, nokuba liphuma kowuphi na umbutho, ukuba nje liliLungu le Palamente, lifungile, linalo ithuba lokuba lixelele ikomiti ngezalo iimbono. Umbutho we-ANC uyayikhuthaza into yokuba wonke umntu woMzantsi Afrika abeke iimbono zakhe kuba naye lilizwe lakhe eli elikhokelwa ngumbutho we-ANC.

Ndiyabulela kakhulu kwaye ndithi kohloniphekileyo umama uWilson noNksz Van Der Merwe, ezi zinto bazithethayo zoontlalo-ntle

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 148 of 175

ziqulathwe phaya kuMthetho Sihlomelo wesiBini osaYilwayo. Yiloo nto ndingakhange ndiphawule ngazo kuba andifunanga ukuba ndikhawuleze ndikunike inyama yokupheka ungekosi. Bendizama ukosisa nje kulo Mthetho, kodwa inyama ephekiweyo ... (Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[This Bill is brought here to make amendments to the existing Act while the department continues with the Act as a Bill that comes from the Minister. I've clarified that. Therefore you cannot say it is a Bill while amendments are still done in it, and say we were just making an agreement. The ANC leads with dignity. If a Member of Parliament, from any political party, being a Member of Parliament, he has sworn, he has an opportunity to raise his views in the committee. The ANC encourages citizens of South Africa to share their views because this is their country led by the ANC. [Applause.]

Thank you very much and I say to hon mama Wilson and Ms Van Der Merwe, welfare things that they are talking about are included in the Second Amendment Bill. That is why I didn't say anything about them because I didn't want to start with the last things. I was just giving the starters about this Bill, but ...]

... a main meal is coming with the Second Amendment Bill.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 149 of 175

Ndiyabulela ke kodwa ngenkqubo eniqhube ngayo ndikwabulela namalungu ngokukodwa ukuphathana ngendlela ehloniphayo phakathi kwamalungu. Le Ndlu ayoyempi koko yiNdlu yokulungisa ukuba abantu abangaphandle bangaboni sibonana njengeentshaba koko babone abantu abachitha ixesha belungisa; abathetha ngendlela eyenza wamkele nawe njengomntu okhokeleyo. Ndiyayibulela ikomiti neNdlu ngokuxhasa. UMthetho uza kungena kungekudala kwaye amalungu ekomiti ayayazi loo nto. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

Kwavunyelwana. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[Thank you for the good behaviour and I also thank the hon members especially by showing respect among hon members. This House is not for fights but to correct things so that people from outside should not see us as enemies, but see people who spend time doing the right thing; who speak in a manner that makes you get accepted as leader. I thank the committee and the House for support. The Bill will be tabled soon and the members of the committee know that. Thank you. [Applause.]

Agreed to.]

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALTH (OVERSIGHT VISIT TO LIMPOPO PROVINCE)

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 150 of 175

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALTH (OVERSIGHT VISIT TO FREE STATE PROVINCE)

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALT (OVERSIGHT VISIT TO EASTERN CAPE PROVINCE)

Nks L DUNJWA: Sihlalo weNdlu yoWiso-mthetho ohloniphekileyo, aMalungu eNdlu yoWiso-mthetho, aBaphathiswa namaSekela abo abakhoyo, iindwendwe ezikhoyo phakathi kwethu kunye nabantu boMzantsi Afrika, sima apha namhlanje siyikomiti yezempilo size kuthi thaca phambi kwenu izindululo nezinto esizifumene xa besindwendwele amaziko ezempilo kula maphondo omane. Likhona iphondo kula maphondo mane ebesikhe saya kulo ngenjongo yokuya kukhangela ingxaki yamachiza nebiye yangundabamlonyeni kulo lonke eli loMzantsi Afrika, iphondo lase-Free State.

Ndingalibazisana, ... (Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[Ms L DUNJWA: The hon Chairperson of the National Assembly, Members of the National Assembly, Ministers and Deputy Ministers present, visitors who are also present here and South Africans, we are here today as members of the committee on health to table the proposals and report on what we observed while we were

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 151 of 175

visiting the health institutions in four provinces. We visited one of the province from the four, the Free State province, with the aim of checking the challenge it had on rolling out pharmacy drugs, which was news headline.

Without any delay, ...]

... in all provinces that we visited, the institutions had similar challenges that we observed, which are human resource, financial management, infrastructure, procurement, government structures, re-engineering of primary health care, emergency services and mobile clinics. We have then recommended that these challenges must be addressed and the Department of Health must ensure that there is an improvement. We recommended that there must be a clear policy on recruitment and retaining strategy of professionals in all posts in these provinces.

Provinces must prioritise the infrastructure funding to ensure that all infrastructure development challenges are addressed; and they must ensure that health officials conduct proper stocktaking and quality assurance to avoid using expired products - you will remember that we have a problem of expired medicines, not because of anything, but because there is a shortage of staff to ensure that those are monitored. These are

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 152 of 175

what we have observed and recommended in all these three provinces.

The recommendations are as follows: To ensure that we address the issue of insufficient ambulances and improve response time; and to ensure that resources of primary health care programmes improve the roll-out and the privatisation of wall boards as well as school health services.

With these challenges that we have identified, we would like to address the issue of Free State. When there was a stock out that was in print media and radio stations that there are no ARVs in the Free State. To our surprise, when we visited the Free State, in particular the Depo - yes there have a shortage staff, problems in tracking medicines from point A to B where medicines are to be delivered - what was very striking was that ARVs were there in the Depo kept under very strict conditions, and registers that were there. It was very surprising when we were told that there are no ARVs in the Free State.

Therefore, it is important to say, as we were conducting these oversights, we concluded that there were areas that needed to be improved. We therefore made recommendations that the Department of Health nationally must ensure that when these negative issues

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 153 of 175

are being raised, they should quickly respond so that our people do not panic or get confused.

In the Eastern Cape, in Kwazakhele, the Motherwell health centre is one example of an ideal clinic. The positive element is that they have an ideal emergency services system, which we want all provinces, including the Western Cape, to go and take lessons from on how to manage time in terms of the pick-up and waiting time for ambulances.

Therefore, hon Chair, as we said that we don't want to waste time on similar issues, we think that it is going to be important if one addresses the issue of infrastructure and governance. This will ensure that all hospitals and clinics are attended to. We want to thank our people for ensuring that they manage the clinics. We thank you. [Time expired.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: We move.

Mr M Waters: Chair, the DA would like to make a declaration, please.

Declaration(s) of vote:

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 154 of 175

Mr H C VOLMINK: Chairperson, the DA supports all four reports presented to the House today. Well, there were some positive findings largely due to our dedicated health professionals who work on the ground against great odds. The visits highlighted some of the incredible weaknesses in our health system where our system is simply not working.

In the Eastern Cape, we found a moratorium on posts, despite critical staff shortages. Instead of cutting vital jobs, perhaps the ANC-led provincial government in the Eastern Cape should consider cutting wasteful and fruitless expenditure which cost the public R74 million in the last financial year in that province alone.

In the Free State, there were serious challenges in medicine supply. Now, it's important for the House to consider the reports of two organisations, the Treatment Action Campaign, TAC and Section 27, which are organisations that are trusted by the public and are organisations of integrity, who said that:

On 11 June 2014, the provincial depot was out of at least 11 antiretrovirals, paracetamol, surgical gloves and masks, surgical blades, needles, surgical gauze swabs, viral load and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 155 of 175

CD4 test kits and antibiotics. One list found 23 items out of stock and another 182.

When we visited Free State in June 2015, almost a year later, we found: "System Bottlenecks hindering the procurement and supply medicines." How is it that almost one year after the TAC's warnings, we still found that state of affairs? Clearly, this is a failure of leadership and perhaps the biggest system bottleneck in the Free State, is the MEC himself.

In Mpumalanga, the committee did not explore challenges relating to medical waste. Early this year the hon Wilmot James found evidence of gross irregularities in medical waste management in Mpumalanga and several other provinces. He has formally called for the Auditor-General report to do investigation into this. We would therefore ask that the committee do follow up visits to Mpumalanga explore this quite carefully.

Finally, in Limpopo, it was found that there was a shortage of ambulances and poor response of emergency care personnel. This is unfortunately and tragically not surprising, because in the reply from the parliamentary questions that we asked last year, it was revealed that there are 381 ambulances in Limpopo of which only 165 are operational. This poor management of vital

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 156 of 175

emergency resources is being paid for at the cost of precious South African lives and for this there must be consequences.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Chairperson, the EFF does not support this report. What has been presented here by the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Health is just a cover-up. The reality is that the department is in a state of decay nationwide. We may not have attended these oversight visits, where members listened to the ANC deployees speaking from air conditioners office, but without any shadow of doubt, we know the condition of our hospitals.

We are always on the ground, interacting with our constituencies and speaking to our people. We know this because we are with the people all the time. We know that the poor and elderly people in deep rural areas of Mqanduli have to wake up in the wee hours of the morning so that they can get attended to in poor resourced clinics, by poorly trained medical personnel, who are stretched beyond limits, because the department refuses to deploy medical staff.

This report confirms what we have always known that there are buildings that are dilapidated, leaking water pipes, leaking 10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 157 of 175

roofs, floor tiles that are peeling off and the cracking walls in all the provinces. In all the provinces that were visited, there is a same cry about insufficient number of nurses, inadequate pharmacist and the incapacity to handle the demands of medicines from our people.

The reality is that, the shortage of stock that the chairperson has just mentioned is there; the reality is that there is shortage of medicines. The stock was bought for the hospitals because they knew that the ANC will be visiting these hospitals. In all the provinces that were visited, it became as clear as crystal that the hospitals are managed by people who are not qualified as medical practitioners and yet they lead medical practitioners.

These visits further confirmed our views that over the past 20 years, the ANC has completely neglected the public system. It is only those with medical aid that can afford proper and quality health care. The reality in South Africa is that the poor cannot afford proper medical care. The EFF is convinced more than ever before that the only solution to the chronic inefficiencies of our health system, is the complete overhaul of the health system in its entirety.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 158 of 175

Health is a constitutional right and thus, money should never be a mediating factor for quality health care. The government must prioritise revamping of public health system as a whole. We know that there will be nothing happening to address the issues that are raised, hence we reject this report. What was presented here by the ANC is a cover-up of what is happening in the health system. [Time expired.] Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms S J NKOMO: Madam Chairperson, adequate access to public healthcare services for all South Africans and the myriad of challenges that this encapsulates, should not continue to be a problem to the Department of Health. The department must start to get the basics right. The IFP acknowledges the good work by dedicated health care workers.

The challenges that are highlighted by these oversight reports are by and large the problems faced by many of our public hospitals throughout the country. These are: Dilapidated infrastructure, the equipment that is not enough, damaged equipment, lack of consumables such as sanitary agents, not enough staff, poor working staff conditions, not enough staff accommodation, not enough beds for patients, the supply chain corruption, the incompetence of staff, the dispensary shortages

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 159 of 175

of basic medicines such as pain killers, the list goes on and on.

The purpose of what we term the hospital revitalisation grant which was outlined by the government in 2011 sought to do the following: Provide funding to enable provinces to plan, manage, modernise, rationalise and transform the infrastructure health technology, monitoring and evaluation of public hospitals in line with national policy objectives and to transform public hospital management and improve quality of care in line with national policy.

Five years down the line we must now ask ourselves, what actual progress has been made? We see the same, if not steady worsening conditions. This must raise our greatest concern. For instance, last year I attended a workshop in the Free State which was organised by TAC. Amongst the issues highlighted in the workshop was that the ARVs as well as other medicines were not available, as a result, people were expected to go without medicines for weeks. That is unacceptable!

The Minister of Health must ensure that a full target base outcome approach audit and analysis must be conducted in each and every public hospital, shortcomings must be identified and

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 160 of 175

step by step programme of redressing and implementation need to be put in place. Let us all get the basic rights, Minister. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chair. Let me start of by congratulating the ANC, the DA and the NFP for this oversight visit because what we gave here is a true account of what we've identified the challenges. Nobody has come here and lied about anything, so I don't know what the purpose is of actually objecting and opposing this Report that is being tabled because it's the true account of what we have found. The oversight visit dealt within the reports tabled before us today gives us the small glimpse of the shocking state of healthcare in different provinces.

Nksz S M KHAWULA: Sihlalo, nginephuzu lesincomo. Uyabona u-Emam, hon umhlonishwa u-Emam angiyizwa kahle, usho ukuthi ulungile ngoba yena akazi, wazi ukuthi kwakhe kwenzeka akaye e-R K Khan ayobona laphayana kwaMaphumulo hhayi akhulume indaba azoncoma into engekho la. Ayikho lento ayishoyo. Udlala ngesikhathi ngoba une-medical aid ...

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nksz M G Boroto): MamKhawula, asizwisise ukuthi kulesi sikhathi esikuso akusona isikhathi sokuthi kube nenkulumo

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 161 of 175

mpikiswano. Nibe naye umuntu okuphikisile lokhu. Sicela ningabe nisakwenza lokho. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Ms S M KHAWULA: Chairperson, I have a point of order. You see, I don't understand what hon Emam means; does he imply that he is right just because he doesn't know, he only knows that it happened once. He must go to R.K. Khan and to KwaMaphumulo and must not come here and support the Report that is not worth supporting. He is not telling the truth. He is just wasting the time because even the medical aid ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Khawula we must understand that this is not the time for debate. Stop debating because you had someone who was debating.]

Please don't do that. Please continue hon Emam.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Chair. That is why I think we are trying to introduce the National Health Insurance, NHI, to try and give equal quality healthcare to all, the poorest of the poor especially. What became evident when looking at the long list of recommendations which accompany each of the Reports is that ... [Interjections.]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 162 of 175

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon House Chair, I have a point of order. I would just like to ask the de facto party agent of the ANC what he implied with that statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon, what is it?

Mr N M PAULSEN: He said, he mentioned this is why we want healthcare ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are you in need of an explanation

Mr N M PAULSEN: Yes I need an explanation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, that's not a point of order.

Mr N M PAULSEN: He must tell us what he was implying. ... We want to know what this party agent of the ANC is implying.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, hon member please sit down. What is wrong? Don't do that hon member. You know very well what a point of order is. Why do you do that?

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 163 of 175

Mr S C MNCWABE: Madam Chairperson, on a point of order: The member here has just called our member a party agent.

Can he please withdraw that statement because it is incorrect?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Party agent?

Mr S C MNCWABE: Yes, of the ANC

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In the House?

Mr S C MNCWABE Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen, did you say that?

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon Deputy House Chair, we are all party agents so if he is not a party agent in his party then he is a staff rider.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen did you say that?

Mr N M PAULSE: Yes I did.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 164 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can you please withdraw?

Mr N M PAULSE: Ok, he is not a party agent he's a staff rider in his party. They should remove this one.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen, please withdraw.

Mr S C MNCWABE: You can't tell us as a party what to do. Please leave to tell us the NFP what to do.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Please sit, please sit down I am still dealing with hon Paulsen. Hon Paulsen, please withdraw.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Yes, ok I withdraw he's not a party agent he's a volunteer.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, sit down. Continue hon Shaik-Emam

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 165 of 175

Ms S M KHAWULA: Lalelake, i-party agent yigama elihle kabi, i-party agent. Yini engalifuni ele-party agent? [Listen, a party agent is a very nice term. Why doesn't he like it?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, continue hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson. I think the member will do well if he decides to pay his maintenance and support his children man.

Mr N S MATIASE: Order Chair. Order Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: In fact the healthcare personnel are achieving wonderful things considering the circumstances under which they work and the paltry remuneration they are getting for ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I see two people standing, what is going on?

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam Chair, I have a point of order. Because you are allowing hon member here, who is a party agent, and I'm not going to be withdraw. He is a party agent. You're allowing

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 166 of 175

him to continue having made such a derogatory statement about our member. You must compel him to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, Hon member, the mere fact that you're still calling him a party agent even after your party withdrew, I am not going to consider that. Thank you.

USol M M KHUBISA: Sihlalo, nginephuzu lesincomo. Ngicela ukuthi angahlali phansi engahoxisanga. Akahoxise lokho akushoyo ngaphambi kokuthi ahlale phansi. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Prof M M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I have a point of order. Let him withdraw what he said before he takes his seat.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please sit. Hon members, we are here for business. We're not going to waste the nation's time with petty arguments here. Continue hon Shaik and please refrain from calling names.

Mr A M SHAIK -EMAM: Hon Chair. The NFP notes with great concern the recommendation relating to staff shortages and staff employment issues in all four provinces visited. In the Eastern Cape the portfolio committee recommends that the Department of

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 167 of 175

Health address the issues of staff shortages urgently as this was identified in all health facilities visited and prioritise the filling of all critical posts. In the Free State it is recommended that the provincial department as part of the issue of infrastructure and staff shortages at Ikgomotseng Clinic and at the medical depot. Similar recommendations are made for Limpopo and Mpumalanga.

The NFP expresses its wish that the national department will give serious consideration to this recommendation. Hon Speaker, when viewed holistically, all recommendations contained in the full Report point to ineffective management and particularly so to senior management level. We firmly believe that the Minister of Health should have a far bigger input into the appointment of MECs as is currently the case. If something goes wrong in health it is the Minister who is expected to answer. We find it upsetting that the Minister should be held accountable for action of people who are appointed without any regard for their competency and knowledge in the field of healthcare. It is our wish that the appointment of MECs and other senior managers in both the national and provincial Departments of Health should be subject to consultation and approval with the Minister. We believe through ministerial insight the best candidate for the

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 168 of 175

job will be more readily identified than what is currently the case. In conclusion the NFP accepts this report.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members I put the question. Those in favour of the ... [Interjections.] Oh. I thought everybody had spoken. I am sorry ANC. ANC, you can make a declaration.

Mr A MAHLALELA: Chair. I'm not sure whether EFF understands what we are dealing with.

Ms M O MOKAUSE: House Chair, on a point of order: The EFF understands exactly what they are talking about. We are on the ground always with our people. The cover-up Report that has been presented here is just a lie, a lie from the ANC

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is not a point of order. Please sit down. Continue hon

Mr A MAHLALELA: I want to reiterate that you won't understand what the EFF is all about because we are not dealing with the state of health in the country we are dealing with a Report based on the oversight visits.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 169 of 175

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon Deputy House Chair, I have a point of order. This is not the ANC Caucus where they discuss the EFF. We want to hear the state of healthcare. Is he going to tell us about the state health in this country? He's discussing ANC Caucus stuff here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member that is a point of debate. It's not a point of order; don't waste the nation's time. Continue hon Mahlalela.

Mr A MAHLALELA: We are dealing with oversight visits Reports; we are not dealing with the state of health in the whole country. The Reports that we are dealing with only covers not even one third of the health challenges in the country therefore to use that Report, which the EFF was not even part of, they never participated into the whole work, to then come to this House and grandstand and say all the rubbish they are saying.

[Interjections.] Yes it is rubbish what you have been talking here. [Interjections.] You have not been raising any facts of relevance that requires anyone to take you seriously.

[Interjections.]

Ms S M KHAWULA: Uvumelekile u-rubbish la? U-rubbish uvumelekile la? [Is the word rubbish parliamentary?]

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 170 of 175

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon maKhawula, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon, there is nothing unparliamentary about the word rubbish. [Interjections.] So I want to recognise one you. [Interjections.] There are three of you standing I don't know which one to appoint

Mr P G MOTEKA: Chairperson, I have a point of order. Are you going to allow us to use the word rubbish in the future?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, according to the records that we have as long as the context ... [Interjections.] you don't say somebody is rubbish but it is in the context of what you are talking about, that's my understanding.

Mr P G MOTEKA: We all going to use rubbish, its fine. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Not a person, not a member but the content of what you are saying.

Mr A MAHLALELA: Chair, the four provinces that were visited have developed and are moving with speed with the implementation of primary healthcare re-engineering model. They've managed in the NHI pilot sites to create and deploy ward based primary healthcare outreach teams and managed to establish strict

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 171 of 175

clinical specialist teams. They have integrated school health services that are being expanded and managed to contract private health practitioners.

Mr T RAWULA: Hon Chair, I have a point of order. You must release him to the rubbish of Mr Mahlalela here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, No, you don't know how to use that. Mr Mahlalela does not have any rubbish, so that is out of order and unparliamentary and I'm going to leave it because a workshop is needed on this. We will allow the staff to workshop. Continue, I understand but I will pardon you for now so that we will finish. The nation wants to hear what we're doing. Continue hon Mahlalela. Please sit down.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Deputy House Chair, I have a point of order.

Deputy House Chair of the ANC you're so partial and biased. He can say we're talking rubbish ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mahlalela, continue.

Mr A MAHLALELA: One of the most prioritised areas is the availability of basic medicine. During our oversight visits all the clinics and hospitals we visited, medicines were above 75%

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 172 of 175

in all the provinces, in terms of stock. There have been challenges that have been listed by all the other members, we agree with those challenges of infrastructure, human resource. It is a matter that is receiving special attention. It is this context that we want to take this opportunity to urge this House to adopt this report. As the ANC, a people's movement, a movement that cares, [Time expired] we are hereby supporting this with the greatest respect. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

VOTING

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members,

Re fihlile mafelelong a morero wa letšatši. Ntlo ... aowa, ga re a fetša.

Ntlo ke tla e botšiša potšišo. Bao ba emago le pego gore e amogelwe ka mo ntlong, a ba re ee. Ba ba ganang a ba re aowa. Go lokile. Re a leboga. Ba ba rego ee, ba e swere ... [Tšhwahlelo.] ... gomme re fihlile mafelelong a morero wa letšatši. (Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.)

[That concludes the business of the day. The House ...wait, we are not done yet.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 173 of 175

Now I put the question to the House. Those who agree with the report must say yes; those who disagree with it must say no. I thank you. Those who say yes, are correct ... [Interjections.] ... that concludes the business of the day.]

Mr N M PAULSEN: House Chair, register the objection of the EFF to this rubbish.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I don't have any rubbish that was presented

Mr N M PAULSEN: That rubbish Report.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I'm not going to record what you are saying.

Morero o fihlile mafelelong. Ntlo e ka phatlalala. [That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.]

Debate Concluded.

House Adjourned at 17:28.

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 174 of 175

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

ANNOUNCEMENTS
National Assembly and National Council of Provinces
The Speaker and the Chairperson
Draft Bills submitted in terms of Joint Rule 159
(1) Courts of Law Amendment Bill, 2016, submitted by the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Services.
Referred to the Portfolio Committee on Justice and Constitutional Services and
the Select Committee on Security and Justice.
TABLINGS
National Assembly and National Council of Provinces
Please see pages 3-18 of the ATCs.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

10 MARCH 2016 PAGE: 175 of 175

National Assembly

Please see pages 19-35 of the ATCs.

