THURSDAY, 26 MAY 2016

____

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

____

The House met at 14:01.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS – see col 000.

Dr C MADLOPHA: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates measures geared at diminishing the high death tolls on South Africa's major roads.

Mr P G ATKINSON: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA that the House debates the significant increase in criminal activity due to drug abuse in the greater Lenasia area and

UNREVISED HANSARD

actions to be taken by the police to combat the scourge in Lenasia and indeed around the country.

Mr S N SWART: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House -

(1) notes that an estimated 15% of South Africa's population are believed to have drug problems, with drug abuse amongst children and youth skyrocketing; and

(2) debates the lack of government funding for nongovernmental organisations and initiatives such as the Recovering Addicts Empowering Lives, Rael, Orange Friday initiative which raises public awareness about substance abuse by encouraging people to wear something orange on Fridays, like this scarf which I'm wearing today on Thursday.

I thank you.

Ms H B KEKANA: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House

UNREVISED HANSARD

debates the building of an extensive support network for small businesses and co-operatives.

Ms D ROBINSON: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA that the House debates the handling of the sexual harassment case against the ANC's Marius Fransman with due process not being followed and the continued support of the ANC Women's League for a man accused of violating a young woman.

This has become a pattern where the women's league protects perpetrators of violence, rather than victims.

Ms A TUCK: Thank you Chairperson. On behalf of the ANC I move that the ANC welcomes the Northern Cape provincial government's commitment to deal with the abuse of drugs and alcohol in that province by creating an inpatient treatment facility. The rise of drug abuse in South Africa is worrying as the World Health Organisation says that 15% of South Africa's population has a drug problem. The statistics are a concern to South Africa and gives the country a bad reputation of being one of the drug capitals of the world. This facility will be used by people suffering from addiction. It will be built at the ...

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, may I ask the Whips just to check. That sounds more like a statement and not a motion for debate. Let's the Whips to check and then we can come back to it. There was another from the DA?

Mr E J MARAIS: Thank you, Chairperson. I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA that the House debates actions to be implemented by the three spheres of government to accelerate the establishment of the industrial development zone in Saldanha to create much-needed jobs and to stimulate economic growth.

Ms D MANANA: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates reviewing the powers of school governing bodies.

Mr T Z HADEBE: Thank you, House Chairperson. I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA that the House debates the firing of KwaZulu-Natal's Premier Senzo Mchunu.

Ms H B KEKANA: Thank you, Chairperson. I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of

UNREVISED HANSARD

the ANC that the House debates implementing more programmes to curb the scourge of teenage pregnancy.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson. I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That the House —

(1) notes that a DA billboard in Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality containing the words, Danny Jordaan proudly brought to you by Jacob Zuma, was removed without any justification by the municipality;

(2) further notes that according to a reply to a parliamentary question — and the copy will be supplied to you — the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Minister Des van Rooyen, stated that, "the municipality has not yet established who gave the instruction for the billboard to be removed and it is still investigating the matter."

(3) recognises that an e-mail dated 14 April 2016 — and I will provide a copy of this too — from Johan Potgieter, a senior fire safety officer at the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality, states that, "an instruction was issued by

UNREVISED HANSARD

the executive Mayor Mr Jordaan that the sign must be removed with immediate effect.";

(4) acknowledges that there was no legal basis for the removal of the sign;

(5) further acknowledges that such an action on the part of the executive mayor was nothing more than a political ploy;

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, is that a statement or a motion that you are reading?

Mr K J MILEHAM: It's a notice of motion, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members, order! Hon members, the idea with motions is that you table a topic for discussion and debate. Can you please wrap up, hon member? You are going way beyond the scope of it now.

Mr K J MILEHAM: It's a substantive motion, Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Then you must submit it to the Table, hon member. You can't read the whole thing here. If you want it for debate, submit it to the Table.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson may I ... [Inaudible.] With all due respect, the members can read a substantive motion out in full. It's been practised throughout all the years. We have never had to submit a ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order!

Mr M WATERS: ... substantive motion to the Table before. I don't know where this rule comes from, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. You may take your seat. At least if there is a substantive motion there must be interaction with the Table beforehand to say that such a motion will be read, so that we can check what the substance of the motion is and the length that will be put aside for the motion to be read. The purpose is to table a motion for debate. Conclude, hon member.

Mr K J MILEHAM:

UNREVISED HANSARD

(6) notes that the Minister's parliamentary reply contradicts the information contained in the e-mail;

(7) also notes that Minster Van Rooyen ... [Interjections.] ... is misleading the House in his parliamentary reply; and

(8) resolves that this issue be referred to the Parliamentary Ethics Committee.

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Chairperson, could you assist us. I thought you had indicated that this period is for notices of motion. There would be a period is which motions would be stated which we could then deal with. Now is there a particular rule by way of a substantive motion that deals with a member of this House being presented as a notice of motion? If you could assist in that regard, thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, hon Minister. That's exactly why I indicated that if there is a substantive motion it must be tabled — we are busy with notices of motion — it should be done and the Table should be informed that it is going to be done because some of these substantive motions can be quite a few pages as well. Then what we usually will do is to

UNREVISED HANSARD

give the member who wants to raise a substantive motion a brief opportunity to state what the motion is on and not to read the entire motion to the House because obviously the House cannot take a decision on it. It must be referred somewhere else. There was a request for a motion from the ANC. The IFP?

UMNTWANA R N CEBEKHULU: Sihlalo weNdlu, egameni lombutho we-IFP ngiphakamisa ukuba esikhathini sokuhlala kwale Ndlu okulandelayo:

INdlu ixoxe kabanzi ngenselelo izwe elibhekene nayo ukubhekela imingcele yethu emanzini olwandle, nokubhekela ukudotshwa ngokungemthetho kwezinhlanzi nemikhumbi ephithizelayo ngaphakathi kwemingcele eNingizimu Afrika.

(Translation of isiZulu notice of motion follows.)

[PRINCE R N CEBEKHULU: Chairperosn, in the next sitting of this House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House debates in detail the challenges facing our country in addressing issues around our maritime boundaries; and also addressing the issue of illegal fishing and the ships moving in and out of our South African boarders.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Mr B T BONGO: Thank you, House Chair. I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates international strategic interventions in the fight against the spread of terrorism in the world.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair with due respect on a point of order, so that we are all on the same wavelength, for our understanding again, I'm rising on the point that hon member Pandor has raised; that the matter from the DA that is purported to be a notice of motion was in fact not a notice of motion. It did not end with a subject for debate in the next sitting or in the next session of Parliament. In fact, more than anything else it sounded to be more of a substantive motion which should have been provided to the House, to you and to the head Table so that it is put on the Order Paper for debate. So Chair I'm therefore saying it will be very difficult for us to leave this unchallenged as a notice of motion. I will really be respectful of your judgement in this regard.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, may I address you?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Let me just deal with this matter first. Hon members, what happens to all these

UNREVISED HANSARD

notices of motion that have been tabled here is that it finds its way through the Table to the office of the Speaker who then looks at the motions and informs the member accordingly that it is either in line with what the intention was or it is not, and the member is then asked to do the necessary corrections. Hon Waters?

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, thank you for that clarity. I was going to bring to your attention that the guidelines to procedure clearly states that draft resolutions and motions of this regard fall under general motions, and therefore the hon member was quite right in standing up and delivering that motion. So thank you for that clarity, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): However, I would like to repeat that when there is an intention to table a substantive motion, that we inform the Table staff so that the presiding officer at the time is also aware of it and so that we allow that the motion can be mentioned and the House take notice of it. But in no way can you just allow an open-ended process for substantive motions to be read in the House. So, hon Chief Whip and Deputy Chief Whip we will deal with it in the way that I've said its being looked at anyway after it has been tabled.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MURDER OF WELL KNOWN AUTHOR WINNIE RUST

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that the Wellington community in the Boland has been left reeling after one of their most well-known citizens and authors, the 77-year old Ms Winnie Rust was found murdered at her home on Wednesday, 11 May 2016;

(2) further notes that Rust was also a community leader and a famous Afrikaans author of books such as *Martha, Countess of Stamford and Trek*, among others, which had been short-listed for at least one major South African award;

(3) acknowledges that two suspects connected to the murder have already appeared in court, one of which is an 18-year-old star athlete who was known and assisted by the Rust family;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(4) further acknowledges that there has been an increase in violent crime in Wellington, and in other communities across the country which is a national crisis;

(5) applauds the South African Police Services for speedily apprehending the two suspects;

(6) recognises the moving tribute of Rust's daughter at her funeral, in which she said "I do not just cry for you, but also for our country", saying that the family was shattered by the manner in which her mother had died; and

(7) finally conveys its deepest condolences to the Rust family and the Wellington community at large.

Agreed to.

LUMKO MTIMDE NEW UNIVERSAL SERVICE AND ACCESS AGENCY OF SOUTH AFRICA CEO

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H H MALGAS: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

That the House –

(1) congratulates Mr Lumko Mtimde on his appointment as CEO of the Universal Service and Access Agency of South Africa, USAASA, in April 2016;

(2) notes that the former head of the state-funded Media Development and Diversity Agency commenced his duties on Tuesday, 24 May 2016, following the approval by Cabinet;

(3) understands that he comes to USSASA with extensive knowledge and experience in the field of Information and Communication Technologies, ICT, having served on a number of regional regulatory bodies before;

(4) believes that his passion about community development, universal service and access to communication services, as well as his track record in the ICT sector and stakeholder management will assist in steering the agency towards the fulfilment of its mandate; and

(5) wishes Mr Mtimde a success in his new position of responsibility.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Agreed to.

CALL TO DECLARE SOUTH AFRICAN DROUGHT NATIONAL DISASTER

(Draft Resolution)

Ms A STEYN: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that South Africa is currently experiencing the worst drought ever in its recorded history, with the year 2015 that has seen the lowest rainfall ever recorded;

(2) also notes that the extreme heat experienced during January and February of this year, has exacerbated the problem of low rainfall at extremely dry conditions; and it has caused crop failure and it has also caused thousands of animals to die;

(3) further notes that the effects of this drought is impacting negatively on food prizes, and that we are already experiencing high inflation rates due to this;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(4) recognises that 16% of our population is already food insecure and that the cost of higher food prices will have a devastating effect on many more South Africans;

(5) acknowledges that the low water levels in many of South Africa's dams is causing millions of South Africans to live without water, and that this situation could deteriorate during the winter period;

(6) also acknowledges that NGOs and aid organisations are already delivering water to many communities without water;

(7) further acknowledges that the Southern African Development Community, SADC, region has declared this drought a regional disaster; and it has called on all governments, the private sector, and international aid organisations to assist the millions of people that could be displaced because of this; and

(8) calls on the South African government to declare the drought a national disaster, and to ensure that we do everything in our power to soften the impact of the drought on our citizens.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Agreed to.

TWO HUNDRED GRADE R LEARNERS TAUGHT IN ONE CLASSROOM

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C N MAJEKE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that Stellenbosch University's department of economics recently published a research report on behalf of the Zenex Foundation;

(2) further notes that according to the report, 200 Grade R pupils are taught in one classroom at Sinempumelelo Primary School in Beacon Bay, East London in the Eastern Cape;

(3) recognises that teaching young children to read is notoriously difficult in a crammed and overcrowded environment, and this undermines their fundamental rights;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(4) further recognises that this results in children missing out on the effective foundation phase learning which is critical for the child's emotional, intellectual and physical development; and

(5) calls on everyone to redouble their efforts in fighting for quality education for all. I thank you.

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I want to make a request that all members must carefully listen to these motions that are read because if there is no objection then it becomes a decision of the House that must be communicated.

CHELSEA FLOWER SHOW GOLD MEDAL FOR KIRSTENBOSCH NATIONAL BOTANICAL GARDEN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M W RABOTAPI: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

(1) notes that yesterday, 24 May 2016, the Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden's display of a proudly South African exhibit won a gold medal at the 2016 Royal Horticultural Society's flower show;

(2) acknowledges that the Chelsea Flower Show, as it is commonly referred to, is one of the world's largest and most prestigious flower shows;

(3) further acknowledges that this is South Africa's 34th gold medal in 41 years at the show;

(4) recalls that last year, Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden was announced as the best botanical garden in the world at the 2015 International Garden Tourism Awards;

(5) thanks Kirstenbosch for their commitment to conserving, protecting and proudly showcasing our nation's rich variety of plant life;

(6) also thanks them for once again flying our flag high on the international stage; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

(7) congratulates the members of the team on this extraordinary achievement. I thank you.

Agreed to.

JUSTICE BESS NKABINDE TO ACT IN DIKGANG MOSENEKE'S POSITION

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M P SIBANDE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) welcomes the appointment of Justice Bess Nkabinde to act as Deputy Chief Justice by President Jacob Zuma on Monday, 23 May 2016;

(2) notes that Nkabinde was appointed following Deputy Chief Justice Dikgang Moseneke's retirement from the Constitutional Court on Friday, 20 May 2016;

(3) understands that Nkabinde is one of the few female judges who sits on the Constitutional Court;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(4) further understands that she was an acting judge of the Supreme Court of Appeal in 2005;

(5) believes that Nkabinde will act in her new position until a permanent appointment is made; and

(6) congratulates her and wishes her well in the new position of responsibility. I so move.

Agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE AND NORTHERN CAPE COMPLY WITH FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE FRAMEWORK

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A J MARAIS: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that the Western Cape and the Northern Cape are the only two provinces that submitted 100% of their financial disclosure forms in the 2014-15 financial year;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(2) acknowledges that this is in compliance with the Financial Disclosure Framework; and

(3) congratulates the Western Cape and the Northern Cape for successfully complying with this framework and for submitting 100% of their forms before the due date. Thank you.

Agreed to.

ZULU LAND MUNICIPALITY INTRODUCES WORKPLACE SKILLS PLAN AND EMPLOYEE ASSISTANT PROGRAMME

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) Notes that the NFP which governs the Zulu Land District Municipality has introduced a workplace skills plan inline with the Integrated Development Planning, IDP;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(2) also notes that over 800 people have been trained and over R6 million has been allocated;

(3) further notes that the NFP's Zulu Land District further introduced an employee assistant programme to tackle the underlying problems experienced by employees to make them more productive;

(4) acknowledges that over R10 million has been spent for widows and orphans;

(5) also acknowledges that over 15 000 houses were built in a small municipality of eDumbe while there is only 62 in five years by the DA;

(6) further acknowledges that 1021 students have qualified in the arts, music, fashion, design and recording studio. Whilst challenges do exist in the area as a result of limited resources and most of Zulu Land being rural and deep, the Zulu Land District Municipality govern by the NFP has performed exceptionally well with every single household in eDumbe being provided with water and every 157 000 indigent households receive over 6000 litres of water per month;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(7) congratulate the NFP, the Zulu Land District and all those that work together in bringing services to the community of the Zulu Land District. We so move.

Not agreed to.

RUSHWAL SAMAAI BEAT AUSTRALIA'S 2015 IAAF WORLD CHAMPIONSHIP AND PREPARES FOR RIO OLYMPICS

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H H MALGAS: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that Rushwal Samaai from Paarl beat Australia's 2015 IAAF World Championship Beijing silver medalist, Fabrice Lapierre, on Saturday, 21 May 2016;

(2) further notes that Rushwal equaled the record set by Rabat of Morocco with a distance of 8,38m to be named champion of the long jump event;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(3) understands that Samaai, who grew up with his three siblings and a single mother in a shack in Magnolia flats in Paarl, is taking part in international events as he prepares to qualify for the Rio Olympics;

(4) further understands that this achievement adds to the numerous records achieved, and his bronze medal won at the 2014 Commonwealth Games;

(5) acknowledges that due to his athletic and academic achievements, Samaai received a scholarship to one of Paarl's premier high schools, Gimnasium;

(6) believes that this rough diamond from humble beginnings would qualify for the Olympics, and he could walk away with the gold medal; and

(7) congratulates Rushwal Samaai on his achievement and wishes him well in his effort to qualify for Rio Olympics.

Agreed to.

SOUTH AFRICANS ENCOURAGED TO REGISTER FOR ORGAN DONATION

UNREVISED HANSARD

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S V KALYAN: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That this House –

(1) notes that only 0,3% of the South African population are registered as organ donors;

(2) also notes that the 2013 statistics around organ donation paint a very bleak picture for the approximately 4300 people desperately waiting for organ or tissue transplants;

(3) further notes that the statistics for 2014 are not available, and it would appear that a mere 18 transplants took place in 2014;

(4) acknowledges that no heart or bi-lateral lung transplants were performed in 2012, 2013 or 2014 at state hospitals; and that many patients are simply sent home to die;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(5) also acknowledges that this is largely due to the lack of critical resources such as organ procurement officers, life support equipment and dialysis machines;

(6) requests the Minister of Health in conjunction with the Organ Donor Foundation to initiate a national dialogue on the concept of organ donations and to factor organ transplantation into the health budget as it is more cost effective to do, for example, a kidney transplant rather than long term dialysis;

(7) encourages all healthy South Africans to consider registering as organ donors for that people like Ayanda Nkosi and Matthew Legemaate who are waiting for organ donors to live a better and healthy life; and

(8) thanks the Organ Donor Foundation for the vital work they do despite the various challenges and constraints they face on a daily basis. I so move.

Agreed to.

MPUMALANGA SERIAL KILLER AND RAPIST SENTENCED TO 439 YEARS AND NINE MONTHS IMPRISONMENT

UNREVISED HANSARD

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that a serial killer and rapist, Sello Mkomazi, has been sentenced in Mpumalanga to 439 years and nine months imprisonment for raping nine women and a 13-year-old girl;

(2) further notes that all the rape incidents took place around KwaMhlanga and Vaalbank in Mpumalanga between 2009 and 2012;

(3) acknowledges that local communities assisted the investigating team with information which led to the eventual arrest of this serial killer;

(4) congratulates the police investigative team and the prosecuting team for thorough and successful investigation and prosecution; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

(5) encourages all communities to assist the police with information to ensure that criminals are apprehended and face the full might of the law. I so move.

Agreed to.

18 GIRLS KILLED IN FIRE AT SCHOOL DORM IN BANGKOK THAILAND

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M P SIBANDE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes with sadness the death of 18 girls in a fire at school dorm in Bangkok, Thailand on Monday, 23 May 2016;

(2) understands that 38 children, all girls between the ages of five and 12, were sleeping in the dorm when the fire broke out at the private school;

(3) further understands that the surviving 20 girls were rescued after fire fighters on ladders scaled the walls of the building;

UNREVISED HANSARD

(4) believes that the school has been operating for five years and teaches 142 students from pre-elementary to Grade 6;

(5) further believes that about 60% of the students were poorer children from surrounding villages, who had been receiving free education and accommodation from the Christian charity; and

(6) conveys its condolences to the government of Bangkok and families of the deceased. I so move.

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the next item on the Order Paper is Member Statements. Does any member of the ANC wish to make a statement?

Mr B A RADEBE: House Chairperson, I am sorry, I want to take you beck to the motions without notice. There is a motion which we are objecting to unless it is rephrased.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member let me continue with the statements and can you please consult with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

Table Staff and I will come back to that motion after I have dealt with the statements? I cannot do it from out of the chair.

LAUNCHING OF NEW TOYOTA ASSEMBLY PLANT IN ISIPINGO

(Member's Statement)

Mr A J WILLIAMS (ANC): House Chair, during the state of the nation address in February 2016, President Zuma announced that the support provided by government through the Department of Trade and Industry had attracted investment of over R25 billion in the automotive industry in the past five years and that the investment is beginning to bear fruits.

On Tuesday, 24 May, the President officially launched the new assembly plant built for the Toyota Hilux and Fortuner in Isipingo in Durban. The launch of this new model is part of the implementation of the nine-point plan that he announced in 2015 to grow our economy and create jobs. This R6,1 billion investment in the production of the new Hilux and Fortuner vehicles will support more than 4 000 jobs, whilst total employment in the plant already exceeds 8 000 jobs. This investment demonstrates global motor manufacturers' confidence in South Africa even during the difficult economic times.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The ANC welcomes this latest development by the company, which proves its commitment to South Africa by strategically investing in our people. I thank you.

INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION LOAN TO GUPTA FAMILY FOR PURCHASE OF SHIVA URANIUM MINE

(Member's Statement)

Dr M J CARDO (DA): House Chair, the claim by the chief executive officer of the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, that there were "no political considerations" associated with the restructuring of a R250 million loan to the Guptas needs to be taken with a large bucket of salt.

The IDC sacrificed commercial considerations on the altar of political expediency when it dished out favours for family and friends of President Jacob Zuma. That the IDC coughed up R250 million for Oakbay to buy Shiva Uranium mine made no commercial sense. The loan accounted for almost the entire R270 million purchase price, and when the mine was parcelled out, a company part owned by President Zuma's son Duduzane took 26%. Oakbay has valued Shiva at R10,7 billion on a net-asset basis, but the IDC loan has still not been repaid in full. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

fact, the IDC bent over backwards to renegotiate repayment on terms wholly favourable for the Guptas. This was a win for the Guptas but a loss for the South African people.

The DA believes the IDC should follow the lead of the commercial banks and give the President's pals a wide berth in future. Thank you. [Applause.]

REGISTRATION OF GOVERNMENT-SUBSIDISED SET-TOP BOXES IN MAKULEKE VILLAGE

(Member's Statement)

Ms M F NKADIMENG (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC commends the progress made in the registration of government-subsidised set-top boxes, STBs, in Makuleke village, Limpopo. The rise in the STB registration is as a result of the intervention of the Minister of Communications' request to the SABC to delink television licences as a requirement for the STB registration process.

STBs are the requirement necessary for viewers to keep on watching television, as South Africa makes the switch from analogue to digital broadcasting, a process which is key for

UNREVISED HANSARD

opening up more frequencies and faster mobile broadband services. With digital migration, viewers will be able to watch television and enjoy good picture quality and sound.

In this regard, the ANC government is committed to give free STBs to five million indigent households across the country. So far, hundreds of poor television-owning households have already registered to get their government-subsidised STBs.

The ANC believes moving to digital migration will create a new broadcasting landscape that will increase the role of free-to-air television to meet the needs and aspirations of all South Africans. We are moving forward; you are the only ones left.

CALL FOR PROPER NUTRITION IN SCHOOL FEEDING SCHEME PROGRAMMES

(Member's Statement)

Mr K P SITHOLE (IFP): House Chairperson, school feeding schemes have been implemented in various schools across the globe and the country to improve the nutritional welfare of learners.

However, recently studies and reports have shown that little nutritional benefit can be obtained from the foodstuff that is

UNREVISED HANSARD

being served in schools through the South African National School Nutrition Programme. The deficiencies in this food have a negative effect on learners in general and on their overall ability to function in class. The sad reality is that only those learners in the townships and rural schools that are already disadvantaged by so many other factors fall victim to the very food that is there to aid them but instead adds to their misfortunes.

Perhaps, another issue that should be addressed in connection with this is the issue of corruption in awarding contracts to certain providers for the government school feeding schemes. Recently, there were reports of schools being shut down for nearly three weeks due to disputes over these issues in Babazani in the Umkhanyakude District Municipality in KwaZulu-Natal. Unfortunately, there is the allocating of the feeding scheme contracts to contractors who are only out to gain financially instead of working towards the most important aim of this programme, which is to ensure that learners are fed sufficiently nutritious food. I thank you.

CALL ON MINISTER OF POLICE TO ACCOUNT FOR PURCHASING OF LUXURY VEHICLES FOR WIVES OF PRESIDENT ZUMA

UNREVISED HANSARD

(Member's Statement)

Dr P J GROENEWALD (VF Plus): Voorsitter, die agb Minister van Finansies en sy span doen alles in hul vermoë om te voorkom dat Suid-Afrika afgegradeer word na rommelstatus. Deel van daardie pogings is juis om omstandighede te skep waar buitelandse beleggers sal wil kom belê in Suid-Afrika om dan ook werksgeleenthede te skep.

Tans het ons besoek van Standard & Poor's in Suid-Afrika sodat hulle 'n ingeligte besluit kan neem, maar dan vra jy jouself die vraag af: Hoe is dit en hoe sal dit ontvang word as daar gelees en gehoor moet word dat daar minstens 11 voertuie aangekoop word teen 'n bedrag van R9 miljoen vir die vroue van die agb President? Daar word 'n beroep gedoen dat almal die gordel moet styf trek, maar as dit by die President kom, is dit asof die regering van die dag net eenvoudig blind is en net eenvoudig toelaat dat die President in luuksheid leef terwyl die volk arm is. Ons hoor nou pas daar word dekodeerders aangekoop vir die arm volk, maar die President se vroue kan in weelde en luuksheid vervoer word.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Dit is totaal onaanvaarbaar, en die VF Plus vra dat die Minister van Polisie behoorlik verantwoording moet doen daaroor. Ek dank u. *(Translation of member's statement follows.)*

[Dr P J GROENEWALD (FF Plus): Chair, the hon Minister of Finance and his team are doing everything in their power to avoid South Africa being downgraded to junk status. Part of those efforts is exactly the creation of conditions conducive to international investors to invest in South Africa which will then also create job opportunities.

Currently Standard & Poor's is in South Africa in order to enable them to make an informed decision, but then the question arises: How is it possible and how will it go down when people read and hear that at least 11 vehicles are being bought at a cost of R9 million for the wives of the hon President? A request is made that everyone tightens his or her belt, but in the case of the President, it seems as if the government of the day is simply blind and just naively allows the President to live in luxury while the nation remains poor. We have just received word that decoders are being bought for the poor amongst the nation, but the wives of the President are transported in opulence and luxuriousness.

UNREVISED HANSARD

This is totally unacceptable, and the FF Plus calls on the Minister of Police to account for this in an appropriate manner. I thank you.]

SUPPORT GIVEN TO KWAZULU-NATAL SUGARCANE CO-OPERATIVES

(Member's Statement)

Dr C Q MADLOPHA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC views the support system given to five community-based co-operatives that plant sugarcane in the area of Qoloqolo in the Umzumbe Local Municipality, KwaZulu-Natal, as a good step in the right direction in terms of ensuring that their dream to expand their plantation will be fulfilled, due to financial muscle of R14 million in assistance from the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Agriculture and Rural Development and South African Sugar Association. The funding will focus on the fencing of 70 km of communal land, ratoon management across 1 207 hectare, nine land reform projects, the planting of a further 102 hectare of land and the establishment of five small-scale grower co-operatives.

The ANC views agriculture as a business and believes that with government support, the expansion and development of a progressive value chain would be ensured. It is therefore moved

UNREVISED HANSARD

by the commitment of the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Agriculture and Rural Development to invest a further R55 million to grow this project in future. The ANC has confidence that the co-operatives will have a sweet sugarcane harvest this year; assistance to rural co-operatives for big business projects should be emulated by other provinces. [Applause.]

CONGRATULATIONS TO HAITI ON FULL AFRICAN UNION MEMBERSHIP

(Member's Statement)

Mr N T GODI (APC): House Chair, as a Pan-Africanist party, the APC congratulates Haiti on its accession to full membership of the African Union. The APC thanks the AU for this groundbreaking and revolutionary act.

The accession by Haiti to full membership of the AU takes the issue of our unity with the African diaspora from theory to reality. The APC urges the other children of Africa – Jamaica, the Dominican Republic, Trinidad and Tobago, the Bahamas, Barbados, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, Grenada, Antigua and Barbuda, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Martinique, Dominica, the Turks and Caicos Islands, Saint Martin, Montserrat, Aruba, etc – to follow the example of Haiti.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Come back home to mother Africa and expand the borders of our continent. Africa united – how good and pleasant it would be before God and men to see the unification of all Africans. As it has been said, let it be done, so sang Bob Marley. Thank you. [Applause.]

WELCOMING OF MOODY'S UNCHANGED SOVEREIGN CREDIT RATING

(Member's Statement)

Ms T V TOBIAS (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the confirmation by Moody's Investors Service of South Africa's sovereign ratings at Baa2 assigned with a negative outlook.

According to Moody's, although the negative outlook on the credit rating was left unchanged, the country is likely approaching a turning point after several years of falling growth, and the 2016-17 budget and medium-term fiscal plan will likely stabilise and eventually reduce the general government debt metrics. These ratings are a testament to our strong and maturing political system and the resilient and robust institutions that support it and our democracy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The ANC is confident that government will continue with its programme of aggressive fiscal consolidation whilst maintaining the delicate and very necessary balance between prioritising radical socioeconomic transformation, meeting basic needs and fiscal sustainability. We are mindful of the remaining challenges and existing concerns, but we believe the outcome of the review will go a long way in restoring investor confidence and attracting continued investment in our economy. I thank you.

EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES FOR YEAR 2016

(Member's Statements)

Mr D C ROSS (DA): Chairperson, since the tabling of medium term budget policy statement, government is reprioritised R31,8 billion to support new spending requirements, the money needs to be spent and finished on very important projects.

Of this amount R16,3 billion provides medium term extra support to the higher education system, R111 billion funds South Africa's contribution to the new developments bank, and R3 billion has been allocated to bolster the contingency reserve in 2016-17. Most of these reprioritised funds are supposed to

UNREVISED HANSARD

come from national government via cost containment measures across all departments.

The Minister of Finance Budget speech also indicated additional spending for higher education, small business and drought relief, but this needs to be accommodated through this cost containment measures across these departments. But here lies the problem; the 2014-15 ordered outcomes tells us a different story. It indicates a whooping R25,6 billion in irregular expenditure across all these departments.

The regular expenditure as we know is mostly of course of non-compliance and supply chain management at about the rate of 72%. Moreover the 2016 Budget Debates of which all the members have to place highlighted the inaction by government with regard to irregular fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

The reality is there for now that inefficient financial practices and corrupt activities now hinder efforts to address the new funding requirements that lie by the Minister of Finance. This poses a critical question that government ... [Time expired.]

MOBILE COMPUTER LAB FOR PRETORIA SCHOOLS

UNREVISED HANSARD

(Member's Statement)

Ms D MANANA (ANC): The ANC Government believes that investing in the future of our young people is important resource that will develop a nation through their innovations and energy. As such, we welcome the donation of a mobile computer lab to DA Mokoma High School, in Mabopane, which will be used to access educational content, provide connectivity to the internet, and assist with facilitating training for Information and Communications Technology skills.

This lab has been equipped with 21 laptops, an interactive white board, projector, a printer, speakers and four desktop workstations for educators. The computer lab was launched as part of Telkom's "Connected Schools" programme. The connectivity and tools Telkom has provided to this secondary school should enable the learners to explore study and become systems developers, engineers to design and manufacture affordable Information and Communications Technology, ICT, hardware such as tablets.

The ANC believes that the mobile ICT lab contributes directly to the vision of a connected South Africa where all citizens

UNREVISED HANSARD

participate in the vibrant knowledge economy and an inclusive information society. I thank you.

COMMUNITY VIOLENT PROTESTS AROUND COUNTRY

(Member's Statement)

Mr L R MBINDA (PAC): It is with great sadness and utter disgust to witness how valueless black lives have continued to be even under the government run by our fellow black men. Day in and out, we witness media reports reporting violent community protests. Councillors and Member of Executive Councils, MECs, wait for situations to extremely get out of hand before providing the required leadership.

In Hammanskraal, recently took until people had to loose their lives before the problems of the community could be attended to by relevant authorities. Our people deserve a proactive leadership as opposed to this reactionary approach our people are subjected to.

In Vuwani, it took about over 20 schools to be destroyed for the concerns of our people to heard. We must say this here now that the solution to any protest can never be heavy police presents

UNREVISED HANSARD

and interdicts, but rather constructive engagement concluded in good faith and provision of decisive leadership. As the PAC, we send our word of condolence to the families of those who lost their lives during this protest in Hammanskraal and we remain in solidarity with them.

Poverty is very violent and we keep subjecting our people to unbearable inhuman poverty stricken conditions. What we call in violent community protest is nothing compared with what would happen in the near future. Thank you.

MORE THAN 100 INFORMAL TRADERS HAVE BEEN EMPOWERED WITH SKILLS

(Member's Statement)

Ms H B KEKANA (ANC): Chair, the ANC government has established two instruments that are earmarked for the support and upliftment of informal and micro-businesses. As a consequences of that 136 informal traders from Soweto, received certificates from the Minister of Small Business Development after they completed entrepreneurship training through a partnership between the Department of Small Business Development, the Wholesale and Retail Sector Education and Training Authority, W&RSETA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

This is after the traders have attended a 10 module training course, which included financial management, merchandising, stock rotation, point of sale, marketing and selling skills, personal hygiene, and health and food safety.

So far, 992 informal traders and 45 informal trader organisations making a total of 1037 have been trained in business and retail related skills.

The ANC welcomes the R50 000 million that has been allocated for the roll out of the Shared Economic Infrastructure Facility and support for informal businesses generally. This will go a long way in building a support networks for small businesses and cooperatives. I thank you.

ANC REJECTS SOCIAL GRANT INCREASE

(Member's Statement)

Ms K DE KOCK (DA): Chairperson, South Africans must know that while the DA voted to increase social grants, the ANC voted this down. The ANC MPs believes it is more important to spend money on bling cars for Zuma ... [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members. Order!

Ms K DE KOCK (DA): ... than it is to allow the poorest of the poor sufficient money to buy bread for their children.

Because of the ANC's catastrophic economic policies our businesses are drowning in red tape and shrinking under the waves of a government generated recession. There is virtually no chance that the majority of our 17 million of recipients of social grant will be able to lift themselves out of this morass of poverty.

The disdain with which the ANC treats our grant recipients is a national shame and without an increase in this grants coupled with soaring inflation, how are these mothers going to feed their children? How are the elderly to survive? And how are the families with disabled child to cope.

The DA government will increase this grants to ensure that no family must live on oil, meal and sugar alone. [Applause.] for the irreversible damage to child development. That is the face of the grant system in South Africa today, where our poor people are kept on the verge of starvation while the ANC fat cats play.

UNREVISED HANSARD

R5 MILLION SUBSTANCE ABUSE CENTRE UNDER CONSTRUCTION

(Member's Statement)

Ms A TUCK (ANC): The ANC welcomes the Northern Cape provincial government's commitment to deal with the abuse of drugs and alcohol in that province by creating an Inpatient Treatment Facility.

The rise of drug abuse in South Africa is worrying, as the World Health Organisation says that 15% of South Africa's population has a drug problem. The statistics are a concern to South Africa and giving the country a bad reputation of being one of the drug capitals of the world.

This facility will be used by people suffering from addiction. It will be built at a value of R5 million and will create jobs for many local citizens. The engineers are in their second phase of the construction of the project and entailed a 40 bed facility including a detoxification centre.

The ANC calls upon all South Africans to be part of community actions geared at changing social values and norms and should

UNREVISED HANSARD

also take part in campaigns against drug and substance abuse I thank you.

SCHOOL OF SPECIALISATION OPENS IN SOWETO

(Member's Statement)

Mr B T BONGO (ANC): House Chair, the ANC notes with appreciation the opening of the first school of specialisation in Soweto. The new Curtis Nkondo School of Specialisation which will focus on Engineering, Maths and Science, ICT, Commerce and Entrepreneurship.

This is a distinct form of school which has strong technical and vocational content that will assist in addressing critical skills shortages in South Africa. Of important benefit from the school will be a definite positive impact of skills deficiency of the country's youth and work force and the tackling of poverty and unemployment whilst promoting the short and long term economic growth.

The ANC believes that this phenomenon signals a new era in basic education, as the school will play an important role in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

skills revolution as it is envisaged in the ANC policies and the National Development Plan.

Whilst, preparing the learners for the transition to work and pursue higher education, therefore the concept of this school should be expanded from Gauteng. It must go to Mpumalanga and other provinces. Thank you very much.

CALL FOR PROPER NUTRITION IN SCHOOL FEEDING SCHEME PROGRAMMES

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, I have to respond to three statements and I do wish that I have the time to do so. With regard to nutrition, I think this is an incredible and a remarkable story of service delivery. Everyday, more than 10 million children are fed at school. That has contributed directly to the improved attendance and the achievement of learners in our schools. That is not the only thing that happens. The department, working closely with the provinces, has decentralised the preparation of food where people are trained in terms of food handling, preparation, nutrition and nutritional content and the provision of utensils

UNREVISED HANSARD

is the norm in the Eastern Cape, parts of KwaZulu-Natal, in the North West and other provinces.

Beyond that, it has created wonderful opportunities for more than 60 000 rural women to be to provide for the children at school. In addition to that, more than 2 200 small and medium enterprises have received the benefit of this particular programme. Therefore, it has contributed directly to the creation of jobs but most importantly it has created positively to the well-being of our children. I repeat again, more than 10 million children are being fed every day.

With regard to the information and communications technology, ICT, we can celebrate that fact that 97,5% of our schools are connected for administration purposes, 52% of our schools countrywide are connected for teaching and learning. It is the intention of this government that within the next three years every single school, irrespective of whether it’s urban or rural, shall be connected.

With regards to the third statement, the Curtis Nkondo School in Soweto is a wonderful step forward; Gauteng is indeed leading the way. However, we can celebrate the fact that this year we are, for first time, offering technical mathematics, technical

UNREVISED HANSARD

science and vocational stream in our schools. Next year, we will have an academic stream, a vocational stream as well as an occupational stream. This goes well for the development of skills within the country. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

COMMUNITY VIOLENT PROTESTS AROUND COUNTRY

(Minister's Response)

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABASEBENZI: Sihlalo weNdlu, ngifisa ukuthi ilunga elihloniphekile uMnumzane Mbinda uma ekhuluma ngokuhlupheka kwabantu – anginaso isiqinisekiso sokuthi ukwazi kangakanani ukuhlupheka kwabantu ikakhulukazi abamnyama. Isizathu salokhu yingoba ngesikhathi eyi-CEO yakwa-CTC wathatha izimali zabantu ze-provident fund wangabakhokhela. Wayeyi-CEO wabayeka abantu banethwa yizimvula la ngaphandle kwesango. Wacasha azange ayokhuluma ngalolu daba. Uma ebazi abantu abamnyama ukuthi bayahlupheka ungowokuqala ukuba abahole futhi abalekelele ukuthi i-provident fund yabo bazoyithola kuphi. Ngiyabonga Sihlalo. [Ihlombe.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[The MINISTER OF LABOUR: House Chairperson, I would like to say, if the hon member Mbinda talks about people being poor – I am

UNREVISED HANSARD

not sure how much he understands the plight of the impoverished people, especially the black people. The reason being, when he was still CEO at CTC he took people's provident fund monies, and never paid them. He was the CEO and he left people in the rain outside the gates. He hid and never went to address this matter. If he knows that the black people are poor then he is the first one who should direct and assist them on where they are going to get their provident fund money from. I thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]]

SUPPORT GIVEN TO KWAZULU-NATAL SUGAR CANE CO-OPERATIVES

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: House Chair, I would like to comment on the statement regarding the sweet harvest which is sugar cane in KwaZulu-Natal. As the department, we are concerned about the development of small-scale farmers. Furthermore we spend money accordingly only in provinces where there is land made available for small-scale farmers, except in the Western Cape. Even as we speak, farmers around Phillipi are being threatened because their land has been sold to another private developer.

UNREVISED HANSARD

We believe that the leaders on the left will understand that we can only build a culture of small-scale farmers, provided that funds and land are made available. We are committed to making sure that land is made available for small-scale farmers and we are supporting them. We believe that together with the provinces we can make agriculture viable, but in areas where land is privately owned or is under the Department of Public Works it is not used to extend the fate of those farmers.

Today as we speak, farmers in Phillipi have no future. They have been told that by 4 December they should not only vacate their area, but even their animals and crops will be taken away. It is the trend that the DA is following. Meanwhile they come here and grandstand and pretend as if they are an organisation that cares for people. If you want to know what happens to small-scale farmers, ask them in the Western Cape. I invite those who deny it to come with me to Phillipi and see and hear it from the farmers themselves. They know they cannot go there because – [Interjections.] - you can shout and do all that but the fact is that the people of South Africa are watching the DA. I also want to say ... [Time expired.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Order hon members, order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: ... the people of South Africa are watching the DA and I want to say that ... [Time expired.]

ANC REJECTS SOCIAL GRANT INCREASE

(Minister's Response)

USEKELA MPHATHISWA WEZAMANZI NOGUTYULO LWELINDLE: Mhlalingaphambili, ngexesha ndandisebenza kwiSebe loPhuhliso loLuntu i-DA yayingufuni ukuba sinike imali abantwana abahluphekayo, abangenabazali nabakhulelweyo isithi siyabakhuthaza ukuba bazale yonke le mihla. Saphinda sathi xa sinyusa imali yabantu abadala ... (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows*.)

[The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chairperson, while I was working at the Department of Social Development, the DA did not want us to give grants to poor children, orphans and pregnant women saying that we are encouraging them to get pregnant now and again. And when we raise the old people's pension ...]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Ms S KOPANE: House Chairperson, on a point of order: [Interjections.] House Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Deputy Minister, will you just take your seat, please. [Interjections.] Why, wait, wait, why are you rising, hon member?

Ms S KOPANE: House Chairperson, the hon member here is misleading the House. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, if you do not agree with what the member says ... It is ... [Interjections.] Please conclude, hon Deputy Minister.

USEKELA MPHATHISWA WEZAMANZI NOGUTYULO LWELINDLE: Eyona nto ndiyiphakamelayo kukulahlekiswa kwabantu bethu yi-DA xa isithi thina asizange sivume ukuba abantu bethu banyuselwe imali. Siyayiqonda into yokuba lixesha lonyulo eli kwaye i-DA ifuna iivoti nasebumnyameni kodwa mayingaxokisa abantu ithi i-ANC ayivumi ukuba banyuselwe imali. Thina siyi-ANC sisebenza ngohlahlo-lwabiwo-mali esinalo. Ngalo lonke ixesha sisithi sinyusa imali, i-DA ayiluvoteli uhlahlo-lwabiwo mali. Andazi ke ukuba yeyiphi ngoku le nto bayifunayo. [Uwelewele] [Kwaqhwatywa.] (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows*.)

UNREVISED HANSARD

[The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: What I rise on is about the DA misleading our people when they say we didn't want our people's grants to be increased. We understand that it is the voting time and the DA wants votes against all odds, but they must not lie and say that the ANC doesn't want to increase the grant. We, as the ANC, work on the budget that we have. Whenever we say we want to increase the grants, the DA doesn't support the Budget Vote. I don't know what they want now. [Interjections.] [Applause.]]

MORE THAN 100 INFORMAL TRADERS HAVE BEEN EMPOWERED WITH SKILLS

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, I would like to thank the hon member who raised the issue of support for our informal business. As a Department of Small Business Development we focus on empowering those people who sit on the streets and sell one thing or the other just to make sure that they keep their families alive.

I would also like to respond to the issue of small-scale farmers and announce to this House that today the Department of Small Business Development together with SA Breweries have supported

UNREVISED HANSARD

small-scale farm workers who are having their first maize harvest. Their first maize harvest is gathered today. We would like to thank the SA Breweries for working with us in ensuring that we support women in maize, black women who have been out of the system. Others are celebrating 105 years of family farming and black farmers cannot talk about 105 years, they can only talk of 10 or 15 years. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members that concludes Ministerial responses. Before we proceed to the first order, I wish to return a point of order that was raised earlier by the hon Minister of Science and Technology and the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, dealing with the motion as read by the hon Mileham. The restated was a substantive motion.

Hon members the tabling of a substantive motion in any Houses of Parliament is a serious matter. It calls for certain processes and procedures to be followed and for a committee to be established to look at the allegations that are made against the member concerned. The *Guide to Procedure* in Chapter 11, page 158 also indicates that the substantive motion should have a clearly formulated and properly substantiate a charge and it should be technically correct.

UNREVISED HANSARD

What I have in front of me does not meet the criteria and the standard of being a substantive motion and consequently, the motion can thus not be attended to. I call on the hon member if he or the party still feel so strongly about the matter to take the matter up with the relevant table staff with the Secretary to the National Assembly and then to table the substantive motion. The secretary will read the First Order.

CONSIDERATION OF EXPROPRIATION BILL AND OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC WORKS THEREON

Mr B A D MARTINS: Hon House Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee on Public Works agreed with the amendments made by the National Council of Provinces in the Expropriation Bill [B 4D – 2015] – one, on page 17 in line 45, where the number of days have been increased from 20 days to 30 days; two, also on page 17 in line 54, where the number of days have been increased from 10 days to 20 days.

The Bill seeks to align the Expropriation Act of 1975 with the Constitution and to provide a common framework to guide the processes and procedures for the expropriation of property by organs of state.

UNREVISED HANSARD

In the portfolio committee, the ANC supported the passing of the Expropriation Bill. The Democratic Alliance and the United Democratic Movement did not support the passing of the Bill. I thank you.

Mr B A Radebe moved: That the Bill be passed.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Ms A M DREYER: Voorsitter, die Portefeuljekommittee oor Openbare Werke het klein wysigings wat die Nasionale Raad van Provinsies aan twee getalle in die Onteieningswetsontwerp aangebring het. Die DA gaan daarmee akkoord, maar omdat die Onteieningswetsontwerp in wese egter steeds dieselfde ou wetsontwerp is, kan die DA dit nie ondersteun nie. Die rede is, daar is minstens vier beginsels waaraan die wetsontwerp nie voldoen nie.

Eerstens, in sy staatsrede vroeër vanjaar, het die President belowe dat toekomstige wetgewing aan ’n sosio-ekonomiese impakstudie onderwerp sal word. Dit het glad nie met hierdie wetsontwerp gebeur nie. Net soos talle ander beloftes, is ook hierdie belofte gebreuk.

Tweedens, eiendom word nie duidelik omskryf nie. Dit strek tans aansienlik verder as nie-roerende bates. Dit sluit bates soos

UNREVISED HANSARD

pensioenfondse en beeste in, wat dus ook onteien kan word, tot groot nadeel van die gewone mense.

Derdens, die rykwydte van onteiening word nie omskryf nie. Dit beteken dat sogenaamde voogdyskap van eiendom deur die staat nie vir vergoeding kwalifiseer nie. Burgers kan dus die gebruik en benutting van hul eiendom verloor, sonder vergoeding.

Vierdens, daar is geen waarborg in die wetsontwerp dat vergoeding, wat vir onteiende eiendom aangebied word, enige uistaande banklenings sal dek nie. Dit is dus heel moontlik dat ’n onteiende eienaar sonder ’n huis of ’n plaas sal sit en steeds ’n uitstaande banklening sal moet afbetaal. Watter bank sal sulke lenings toestaan?

Die DA sal net vir ’n onteieningswetsontwerp stem, indien hierdie vier beginsels nagekom word. Dit gebeur egter nie tans nie. Die slotsom is dit: Die DA, net soos internasionale graderingsagentskappe, heg hoë waarde aan eiendomsreg, wat hierdie wetsontwerp wesenlik aantas. As die wetsontwerp vandag aanvaar word, sal dit sakevertroue skok, tot verdere werkloosheid lei en verder bydra dat Suid-Afrika tot rommelstatus afgradeer word. Die DA verwerp dit. [Applous.]

(Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.)

UNREVISED HANSARD

[Me A M DREYER: Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Public Works made minor amendments to two numbers which the National Council of Provinces introduced in the Expropriation Bill. The DA goes along with it but because Expropriation Bill is in essence still the same old Bill the DA cannot support it. The reason being, there are at least four principles which the Bill does not comply with.

Firstly, in his state of the nation address earlier this year, the President promised that future legislation will be subject to an impact study. It never happened in the case of this Bill. Just like many other promises, this promise was also not kept.

Secondly, property is not clearly defined. Currently it goes significantly further than fixed assets. It includes assets such as pension funds and cattle, which can therefore also be expropriated, to tremendous detriment of ordinary people.

Thirdly, the scope of expropriation is not defined. It implies that so-called guardianship of property by the state does not qualify for compensation. Therefore citizens may lose the use and utilization of their property, without compensation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Fourthly, there is no guarantee in the Bill that compensation, which will be offered for property expropriated, will cover any outstanding bank loans. Therefore it is quite possible that where expropriation took place an owner will be without a house or a farm and will still have to pay the outstanding bank loan. What type of bank will grant such loans?

The DA will only vote for an Expropriation Bill, if these four principles are met. Currently this is not the case. The conclusion is thus: the DA, as in the case of international grading agencies, attaches much value to property rights, which in essence this Bill infringes upon. If the Bill is passed today it will impact on business confidence, lead to further joblessness and further contributes to South Africa being downgraded to junk status. The DA rejects it. [Applause.]]

Mnu K P SITHOLE: Sihlalo, Inkatha Yenkululeko, IFP, iyaweseka loMthethosivivinyo ngoba loMthethosivivinywa njengamanje ususuka e-NCOP bese kuzokwenziwa izichibiyelo ezimbili, okushiyiwe nezethulo la kufanele kulungiswe khona. Ngaleyondlela saweseka ekuqaleni loMthethosivivinywa. Ngicabanga ukuthi namanje ngoba ukhuluma ngabantu bakithi abahluphekayo kufanele ukuthi bakwazi ukunxeshezelwa lapho okufanele banxeshezelwe khona uma kufanele

UNREVISED HANSARD

basizwe uHulumeni. Ngaleyondlela sithi ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Mr K P SITHOLE: Chairperson, Inkatha Yenkululeko, IFP, support this Bill because this Bill is now from the NCOP and then it will have two amendments, amendments on omissions and submissions where necessary. We supported this Bill from the beginning. I think even today, since it is addressing issues of our poor people who must be compensated where they are supposed to be compensated and being assisted where they need government's intervention. So we are saying that ...]

... the IFP supported the Bill and we support this amendment, even today. I thank you.

Mnu M W L FILTANE: Sihlalo, lo Mthetho uyacalucalula. Wonke umhlaba owathathwa phambi kowe-1913 awusokuze uchukunyiswe phantsi kwalo Mthetho. Yiyo ke le nto i-UDM imile ngelithi ayinakuze iwuxhase nanini na ngaphandleni kokuba kungalungiswa ukuba uMthetho ungawuchukumisa umhlaba owathathwa phambi kowe-1913. Bayala ke aba baphetheyo, ukuba bawuchukumise umhlaba owathathwa phambi kowe-1913. Simile ke siyi-UDM sisithi asinakuwuxhasa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Khange sibe nangxaki xa kusandiswa iintsuku zokuba abantu banikwe isaziso, ukusuka kwiintsuku ezi-10 ukuya kuma-20, okanye ukusuka kuma-20 ukuya kuma-30 eentsuku, asinangxaki ngaloo nto. Nezinye izigaba zawo lo Mthetho asizilwi siyi-UDM sisebenze kakhulu phaya kwikomiti ukuba lo Mthetho mawulungele uluntu lonke ukuze akwazi urhulumente ukuba angawusebenzisa.

Asimanga phambi kophuhliso. Kufuneka siyicacise loo ndawo kuba lo Mthetho ujongene nokuthatha umhlaba xa kusithiwa kuza kuphuhliswa. Asiyali loo nto siyi-UDM, konke konke. Sonke sifuna uphuhliso kwaye siyavuma ukuba mawuthathwe umhlaba xa kufuneka ukuba uphuhliswe. Into esingayifuniyo; yile yocalucalulo yokuba kuthiwe la mihlaba yathathwa kwiminyaka enga-300 yeminyaka eyadlulayo ayinakuze ichukunyiswe.

Imile ke i-ANC ukuba ayiyi kulo mba. Asizazi ke ukuba ezi zigqibo zazithathwe phi na. Kodwa imile, ikho le nto iyigushileyo ebangela ukuba ithi mawungachukunyiswa la mhlaba wangaphambi kowe-1913. Yiyo loo nto ebangela ukuba sime nkqo siyi-UDM sithi awunakuvunywa. Ukuba nje uvunyiwe, nakuyibona into. Enkosi. (*Translation of isiXhosa speech follows*.)

[Mr M W L FILTANE: Chairperson, this Act is discriminating. All the land that was taken before 1913 will never be affected under

UNREVISED HANSARD

this Act. That is why the UDM stands firm and says that they will never support it at any time, unless the Act can affect the land that was appropriated before 1913. Those in government opposed it; they don't want to touch the land that was taken before 1913. We stand firm as the UDM and we are saying that we won't support this Act.

That is why we didn't have a problem when the days were extended for the people to be given notices - from 10 days to 20 days, or from 20 days to 30 days. We are not against other sections of that Act; we worked very hard in the committee on this Act for it to be ready for all communities so that the government could use it.

We are not against development. We need to clarify this because when we talk of development, this Act deals with the appropriation of land. We do not disagree with that as the UDM, at all. All of us want development and we agree that the land must be appropriated when there is a need for it to be developed. What we do not want is the discrimination and saying that the land that was taken 300 years ago cannot be touched.

The ANC is resolute in saying that they are not addressing that issue. We don't know where these decisions were taken. But they

UNREVISED HANSARD

are resolute; there is something that they are hiding that makes them say that the land which was taken before 1913 must not be touched. That is the reason we stand firm as the UDM and say we cannot support this. If the Act is promulgated, you will see what will happen. Thank you.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chair, the National Freedom Party supports this. The National Freedom Party supports the recommendations contained in the Portfolio Committee on Public Works tabled here today. As is evident from the amendments, these are technical in nature, dealing largely with the expanded timeframes.

The first amendment increased the number of days in which the municipal manager must inform the expropriating authority in writing of changes, from 20 to 30 days, if land which has been expropriated is subject to municipal rates.

The second amendment that was adopted by the committee increases the number of days from 10 to 20 days, whereby the expropriating authority may utilise as much of the compensation money in question as is necessary for the payment, if the said amount is not disputed in writing by the expropriated owner or expropriated holder. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Neither of these two amendments distract from the intent and purpose of the Expropriation Bill as a whole, which the National Freedom Party has supported. We accordingly support the recommendations of the portfolio committee and hope that this august House adopts the amendments to the Expropriated Bill. I thank you.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Voorsitter, die Vryheidsfront Plus sal beslis teen hierdie wetsontwerp stem. Ons het alreeds in die komitteestadium gesê dat ons gekant is teen die wenslikheid van hierdie wetsontwerp. Die beginsel van onteiening is nie ’n vreemde beginsel nie. Dit word wêreldwyd toegepas, in terme van noodsaaklike ontwikkeling wat moet plaasvind, byvoorbeeld as ’n brug of paaie gebou moet word.

Maar die ANC in Suid-Afrika maak dit ’n politieke aangeleentheid. Die ANC wil hierdie wetsontwerp misbruik in terme van die politieke speelbal en die emosionele politieke speelbal van grond.

Die agb President val in by die koor van die EFF wat sê dat die grond gesteel is. Daardeur wek hulle emosies op. Hierdie wetsontwerp sê ek weer ’n keer is net weer ’n stap om

UNREVISED HANSARD

grondhervorming toe te pas, maar eintlik is dit maar net ’n verdere stap om wetlik grondgrype in Suid-Afrika toe te pas.

Ek weet dat die aanhef van hierdie wetsontwerp, artikel 25 van die Grondwet is. Ek wil asseblief vir die instellings wat beswaar gemaak het en gesê het dat hulle hierdie saak tot in die Grondwethof sal veg, vra om dit te doen. Ek wil dit ook op rekord plaas dat die Vryheidsfront Plus bekommerd is dat dit dalk wel in lyn kan wees met artikel 25 van die Grondwet en dan sal diegene wat artikel 25 in die Grondwet ingeskryf het en dit ondersteun het, saam met die ANC pa moet staan, as daar grondgrype in Suid-Afrika plaasvind.

Die President het ook gesê dat hy ’n nuwe wetsontwerp het, wat tans by die Kabinet is, wat na vore gaan tree om ook ’n beperking te plaas op grondbesit. Daardeur wil hy plase beperk tot 5 000 hektaar in terme van groot plase, en in die geval van plantasies ensovoorts, tot 12 000 hektaar. Daar word duidelik gesê dat die res onteien sal word.

Dit sal hierdie Onteieningswet wees wat gebruik gaan word, soos ons reeds gehoor het, om toe te sien dat ’n grondeienaar sy grond verloor en dalk niks daarvoor gaan kry nie. Dan sal diegene vir artikel 25 pa moet staan. Ons verwerp hierdie

UNREVISED HANSARD

wetsontwerp. Ek dank u. *(Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.)*

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, the Freedom Front Plus will definitely vote against this Bill. We already said at the committee stage that we are against the desirability of this Bill. The principle of expropriation is not a foreign principle. It is implemented worldwide, in terms of essential development that has to take place, for example, when a bridge or roads have to be build.

But the ANC in South Africa makes it a political matter. The ANC wants to misuse the Bill as a political football or emotional political football with regard to land.

The hon President joins the choir of the EFF who says that the land was stolen. By doing that, they stir up emotions. I repeat, this Bill is just another step to apply land reform, but ultimately it is actually just a further step to legally have land grab in South Africa.

I know that the preamble of this Bill is section 25 of the Constitution. I want to ask the institutions that objected to it, and said that they will fight the matter in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

Constitutional Court, to please, do just that. I also want to put it on record that the Freedom Front Plus is worried that it might be in line with section 25 in the Constitution and then those who included section 25 in the Constitution and supported it, will have to, along with the ANC, take responsibility if cases of land grab were to take place in South Africa.

The President also said that he has a new Bill, currently with Cabinet, that will come to the fore in order to put a limit on land ownership. Thus reducing the size of farms to 5 000 hectares in terms of big farms, and in the case of plantations, etcetera, to 12 000 hectares. It is clearly stated that the rest will be expropriated.

It will be this Expropriation Act that will be used, as we have already heard, to see to it that a landowner loses his land and might not get paid for it. Then those people will have to accept responsibility for section 25. We reject this Bill. We thank you.]

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, the ACDP notes the improvement to this Bill from the NCOP; however, our stand point is still as we indicated that we are opposed to the Bill. Our Constitution makes provision for expropriation, and this is an instrument

UNREVISED HANSARD

that is used throughout the centuries by countries worldwide. It is, however, accepted that expropriation is never done lightly - it is the exception rather than the rule and under the common law, the state cannot simply seize property without obtaining a court order, the Constitution strengthened those common law protections. Section 25 lays down a number of conditions, which must be met before any expropriation can be valid; section 34 makes further provision for a fair public process. Section 26 prohibits the state from evicting a person from his home without a court order expressly allowing this. These are provision of the Constitution.

Now with the passing of this Bill today - expropriation without reasonable legal protection against abuse - is no longer just a threat to those in the agricultural sector, but also to those churches, banks, commercial businesses, food producers, miners and ordinary people with no guarantee of compensation. We believe the Expropriation Bill creates insecurity and whilst there have been improvement to hon Minister; it has in our view still got a long way to go. Therefore, we are regrettably not supporting it. I thank you.

Dr C MADLOPHA: House Chair, the ANC support the amendment made by the NCOP as well as the Bill. The oppositions always

UNREVISED HANSARD

grandstand here. I think what they are doing; they are not supporting development of small-scale farmers, as the Minister said that they need to be assisted.

Bavimba intuthuko yabantu bakithi abahlwempu ngokuthi bangawuphasisi lo Mthethosivivinywa. Okunye abakwenzayo bavimba ukuthi singakwazi ukwakhela abantu bakithi izindlu. Thina njenge-ANC, ngenxa yokuthi lo Mthethosivivinywa ukwazile ukuthi ubuke zonke izingxenye nezigaba zoMthethosisekelo, wakwazi ukwenza ukuba abe yingxenye. SinguKhongolose siyazethemba ukuthi noma lo Mthethosivivinywa uya ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[They are hindering the development of our poor people by not passing this Bill. They are also preventing us from building houses for our people. We, as the ANC, because this Bill considered every part and section of the Constitution, and it is in line with it. As the ANC, we are confident that even if this Bill can be ...]

... in the Constitutional Court, it is going to pass because we have taken property clause from the Constitution and included it so that it can protect even the minorities. But what is

UNREVISED HANSARD

important for us is the development of the poorest of the poor ...

... abahlala ngale ngakithi eNtambanana. [... who stays in my area at Ntambanana.]

Let us fast-track this Bill, so that we can fast-track the development. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member.

Hon members, are there any objections to the Bill be passed? I now put the Question, those in favour will say ayes, those against will say, noes. I think the Ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the DA calls for a division.

Question Put: That the Bill be passed.

Division demanded.

The Houses divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply ... [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES (Mr J H Jeffery): Chairperson, just a point of clarity, how many members have to call for a division? Is it five?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): It's four, hon member. Order, hon member! We are in the middle of the voting session. Order! When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button, below the yes, no or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may, thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member's vote when the voting session is closed by the Chairperson.

The question before the House is that the Expropriation Bill be passed. Are all members in their allocated seats? Voting will now commence. Those in favour of the Bill be passed should press the "yes" button; those against should pressed the "no" button and those wishing to abstain should press the "abstain" button. Have all members voted? There is a hand of a member at the back. Order, hon members! Thank you, the voting session is now closed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

AYES -208: Abrahams, B L; Adams, P E; Adams, F; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Beukman, F; Bhengu, N R; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Hlengwa, M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlobo, M D; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M;

UNREVISED HANSARD

Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbete, B; Mbinda, L R; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Scheepers, M A; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NOES - 7: Dreyer, A M; Filtane, M L W; Kwankwa, N L S; Majeke, C N; Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Waters, M.

Motion agreed to.

Bill accordingly passed.

Mr S LUZIPO: Chairperson, on the point of order, no, I've got no intention to delay the House, I'm a rural boy. I want to request members from the opposition, they have got a right to count us, but to use fingers, it's like they are counting their sheep and cattle. I just want to make that request. [Interjections.] Let us not be pointed at when they are counting how many are we in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Your point is noted, hon member. Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

CONSIDERATION OF FIRST REPORT OF RULES COMMITTEE OF NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The SPEAKER: Hon members, before we start with the debate, I wish to make a few remarks. The Constitution empowers the National Assembly to make rules and orders concerning its

UNREVISED HANSARD

business in section 57. Rules are essential for human interactions in the context of Parliament. They create a framework for conduct of business and set the boundaries within which we are to perform our functions as Members of Parliament. By creating Rules, we are making a commitment to do things in a particular way as we carry out our functions as required by the Constitution.

When we arrived here in 1994, some ad hoc adjustments of the Rules were effected, but it is actually for the first time that we have embarked on this comprehensive review of the Rules that we are today bringing before the House. After 21 years, we can now say that we have been able to do a comprehensive review and this is a milestone we should all be proud of.

As we know, hon members, over the years we have commissioned different studies on parliamentary processes to assist ourselves to understand deeper the processes that are involved in our work. This was to demonstrate our willingness to be persuaded. We had a study in 1999 on oversight by Professor Corder, this contributed to the development of the oversight model of Parliament which we have today. The oversight model, the report of the independent panel assessment of Parliament and an indebts

UNREVISED HANSARD

study of the legislative process have all been taken into account in this review.

The report on institution supporting democracy, Chapter 9 institutions that as we normally call it, is currently receiving attention as well. In fact, in that regard, as I said in my Budget Vote speech, we have already had the first workshop, but we are continuing to interact with the Chapter 9 Chairs themselves.

The final Rule proposals before the House today include new approaches after lengthy deliberations involving all stakeholders. These approaches are aimed at addressing procedural challenges that have been experienced over time. The revised Rules appreciably strengthen the National Assembly's ability to exercise its constitutional mandate to best effect. In this respect, the introduction of mini-plenaries to create more platforms for debate, oral questions to the executive lasting three hours instead of two and improve procedures to facilitate order, decorum and discipline must be mentioned as some of the issues we have addressed in the amendment of the Rules.

UNREVISED HANSARD

As we start the debate, I must express my appreciation to all the political parties represented in Parliament for the hard work introducing these Rules. We did not always agree, but we worked hard and we worked earnestly to try and improve the work of Parliament. The subcommittee on review of Rules assisted by Mr Handik and the Table staff worked hard to get us here. I have to specifically mention the name of the Chair of the subcommittee, the hon Mdakane, who really steered the work of the subcommittee. [Applause.]

I must also point out that all caucuses of political parties represented in Parliament were also involved because issues were always taken back to them, they applied their own minds as caucuses and they always came back through their members who were either in the subcommittee or in the Rules committee and therefore have made valuable contributions in this process.

Hon members, like the Constitution, the Rules are a living document. In other words, we never close the process of engaging of issues that continuously arise and emerge as we practice everything that we do according to the agreed framework in Parliament. Therefore, any imperfections that we may identify as we implement will always be able to be addressed. On that note, I would now like to call upon the Chairperson of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

Subcommittee on Rules to be the first speaker in the debate on the Report of the Rules, but I must now recognise the hon the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker, I move:

> That the Report be adopted and that the new Rules take effect from tomorrow, Friday, 27 May 2016.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party, I think I must have also added that we are supposed to have only called you after the debate. Therefore, I now call upon hon Mdakane.

Mr M R MDAKANE: Hon Speaker, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers and hon members of the National Assembly, thank you hon Speaker for giving us time to participate in this Report of the Rules committee. I rise on behalf of the ANC to support the revised Rules of the National Assembly because these Rules will unleash the full potential of all Members of Parliament to do what they are elected to do. They are going to assist us to deepen parliamentary democracy in our country then we expect all Members of Parliament to ensure that they respect these Rules of the National Assembly because without rules it will be difficult to engage in any meaningful political debate in this Chamber.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Therefore, respect of the Rules will assist us to ensure that we hold the executive accountable, scrutinise the legislation and report and that we scrutinise even report of portfolio committees and Chapter 9 institutions when they are presented here for our consideration. It is our view as an ANC that many members of this Chamber were allowed enough time to participate in a drafting of these Rules and we hope that because they participated in the drafting of the Rules, they will learn to respect them, precisely because without rules, without conventions and without practices, the House will not be able to function.

These Rules will help us as Members of Parliament to facilitate resolutions of the problems of all South Africans. It is our view that we are here as members of the National Assembly because we are representing communities. It is very rare to find any institutions all over the world that does not have the rules. Therefore, Members of Parliament because they are honourable members, they must always bear in mind that the Rules assist all members to be heard in the House when they are participating fully in this debate.

The process of reviewing of our Rules was a credible and democratic process, all parties were allowed to participate

UNREVISED HANSARD

fully and engage in the process. Surprisingly, some parties failed to make meaningful contributions in this process of drafting the new Rules of the National Assembly. Instead, they decided to walk out from meetings when they were supposed to engage us and persuade us as Members of Parliament to agree with their point of view.

The DA started with us in 2013, in the subcommittee of review of the Rules, participated fully in this process until the EFF joins us. Immediately after the EFF joined us, there was then a competition between the EFF and the DA. These competitions has led the DA to walk out from the meeting of the Rules committee on Tuesday, this week, precisely because they would not get involved and organised themselves to make a meaningful contribution for the Rules of this National Assembly. In fact, all the Rules that we have discussed since 2012, 2013, 2014 and 2015, we all hope that the DA was with us until later they decided to raise some of the issues that we thought were already resolved in the subcommittee even in the Rules committee.

It is our view as members of the ANC that we will continue to engage with all parties that will be interested to work with us on these Rules even after the Rules have been adopted or approved by this important Chamber because the Rules, as we are

UNREVISED HANSARD

saying, are the living document. We cannot conclude the engagement on developing of the Rules of the National Assembly, but it is our view at the same time that the Rules should not be amended on a willy-nilly basis and that failure to plan should not allow us to emend the Rules of the National Assembly because if you amend the Rules because poor planning will be unable to have rules that are respected, that have credibility in terms of the members of the National Assembly.

The ANC is fully in support of the whole process that we engaged on in drafting these Rules. It is the ANC view that the parties that have walked out from our meeting will go back to the Rules committee and try to persuade us to agree with them, unless they present very formidable points of argument we would not agree with them. In fact, we think that it is very wrong for Members of Parliament who have been part and parcel of this process for so long, almost two and half years, at the end they simply stay away and run away from responsibility of convincing their colleagues from other parties to agree with them.

If you can do so ... [Interjections.] ... well we are always open. The ANC is the leader of a society. When yourself you are unable to engage us you get worried that you are not prepared and you are not organised sufficiently to address the issues

UNREVISED HANSARD

that you are facing here. You are the one who have been complaining everyday that we not are giving you sufficient time to hold members of the executive accountable and sufficient time to present matters for debate. When we are doing so, you run away. [Applause.] What do you want us to do? [Interjections.]

No, what do you want to do because we are giving you a platform, hon members of the House, this is the platform please come; make your points, and you run away. What you expect us to do is to invite you again. Our view is that the DA has failed to play its meaningful role in this Chamber as a result of that ... [Interjections.] ... Of course, really, the competition with the EFF for airtime we know that, but we have thought you are little bit better than the EFF, but it seems you are the same. You are not assisting us to address these challenges in the Chamber.

Our view is that these Rules should be approved by the Chamber and have a discussion with members and hopefully at the time when we look at these Rules even in five years time the DA will be well organised to make meaningful contributions because failure to do so it makes it very difficult anyway to engage with you because recently, you are very angry party. It is very strange that victims of apartheid, we are prepared to respect you, but you do not just respect members of the ANC. The manner

UNREVISED HANSARD

in which you should behave is a very strange way that we have forgiven all those who have persecuted us. We meet with them and we drink tea with them, but despite all that you still take a very arrogant approach on matters that you are supposed to address. [Applause.]

It is a bigger problem that we are facing. Therefore, we hope that these Rules will assist the hon Steenhuisen to understand parliamentary democracy and work in a manner that is appropriate for an hon member of this House to ensure that we work on that. Our view as an ANC is that the Rules that we are presenting today for the approval of the Chamber are sufficient. They are very important and then they will assist us to work in a manner that is appropriate. We are deep in democracy and it cannot be right that we have agreed with all the Rules, you are just running away for one Rule - the proceeding one. You are running away from that Rule only and then all other Rules you have been part and parcel of this discussion; suddenly you become wiser when you are supposed to adopt the Rules of the National Assembly. Therefore, in our view that cannot be right because we gave you at the time that present alternative views. You failed to do so. What do you want us to do? You want us to present it for you. We did it exactly present it for you, that is why you have accepted it now. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Therefore, though I am not being arrogant, you must accept the fact that we are privileged to be led by an organisation called the ANC, because without this organisation, in fact, we would not be here. We are here because of the ANC, and then we must respect that and work in the manner that assists us to address the challenges of our country. Hon Speaker, the ANC supports the approval of these new Rules and we think that they are going to assist us to address many issues of our people. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms N W A MAZZONE: Speaker, those of you who know me will know that it's not often that I find myself gobsmacked. I normally have something to say about everything but what the hon Mdakane just did has truly left me ... [Interjections.] ... speechless.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order!

Ms N W A MAZZONE: I find it truly, unbelievably insulting, after spending hours and hours and hours in a Rules Committee, where I thought – and I'm sure members that sat with me, like the hon Kilian and the hon Narend Singh – that we had a sort of unity in that committee, after I worked out this morning that, just since 2014, we had spent almost 186 hours together, negotiating, going

UNREVISED HANSARD

through best practices, looking at what would strengthen our Parliament.

To then come to this House and grandstand! In actual fact, colleagues, if that wasn't the weakest attempt at a re-election speech that I have ever heard, I don't know what is. [Interjections.] Hon Mdakane, I am sure the message has got to Luthuli House and they have been told to re-elect you. Your position is safe, even though it shouldn't be. [Interjections.]

I must, at this point, make special thanks to members. It is actually strange that I will say this, but I must say "Thank you" to the members of the committee, because we worked well together. In that time that we sat together, we went through hardships, we went through rough debate, but, in the end, we had respect for each other – or so one would have thought. Negotiations were long. They were hard. We sat through recesses. We sat on Fridays. We sat at times that were inconvenient, but we were there and we did the job.

I'd like to point out a few things. Never in my life, and certainly with my history as a Member of Parliament, did I ever think that we would be writing Rules for a violent Parliament. I think we can all agree that the violence that has taken over our

UNREVISED HANSARD

Parliament degrades not only what we stand for, but certainly, the hard-won democracy that we all enjoy today.

That is why Rule 53 was probably one of the most difficult pieces of legislation that we, as legislators, had to work out – because how does one curtail constitutional rights and still make it a fair, open and democratic Parliament? I must say, I think we did well with Rule 53. It needed a few amendments, and we did well in the amendments that we came up with.

I maintain it is a very sad situation that we have to even contemplate fellow Members of Parliament causing harm to one another, but that is the reality in which we live. One thing, though, that we must never forget is that the floor of Parliament is sacrosanct. That is why we made sure that Protection Services that come onto the floor of Parliament will not be armed unless actual violence breaks out on the floor. That ensures that although our rights are limited, we still have the constitutional right that we enjoy, as Members of Parliament, to privilege in this House and to be the voice of the people of South Africa that voted us into office.

Some interesting developments have come up in these Rules. One of the things that I was most pleased with is the fact that,

UNREVISED HANSARD

finally, the Deputy President will have his own day to answer questions. He will have a chance to answer the questions and give due consideration to his answers. This means that the next cluster will not have its time curtailed. That is very important, when we look at holding the executive to account - that the Deputy President has a specific time for answering questions, and I think we did well there.

I think we did well in that extended public committees, EPCs, will now be known as miniplenaries and I think other such debates, going forward as miniplenaries is also a good move. It is quite disappointing that we didn't get snap debates put into our Rules of Parliament, and I'll tell you why.

We are a People's Parliament and we are here to discuss people's issues. What we see, continuously, is this over-preparedness. It's so structured and so staged that things don't seem to come up originally in our Parliament. A snap debate would have allowed for Ministers to have the opportunity to show that they understand and know their portfolios, as well as for members of the House to have an opportunity to really engage with Ministers and their Deputies, and have a fundamental, at times, disagreement, and sometimes, to find each other. This kind of curtailing ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

It's one of the things, as the hon Mdakane said, this is a living document, and as we go ahead with our document, so things will change and the document will change, in time, too. We are a developing democracy and we must never forget that – although, after the speech I have just heard, I do wonder sometimes if we are developing at all, because that was nothing more than a militant insult on everyone that participated in this process.

I think it's safe to say that no one wants a military operation on the campus of Parliament, but what happened last week shocked not only us sitting here in Parliament, but shocked the country, as a whole, and rightly so. We saw gross acts of violence. We saw grievous bodily harm and harm to property. That should never be allowed. I think, in this, Parliament has been remiss in making sure that we have adequate controls, so that people coming into Parliament are unarmed and may not harm anyone that's in Parliament.

In addition, our Protection Services, themselves, were infiltrated, as we saw. Once again, the hon Steenhuisen had requested, over and over, ad nauseum, that our Protection Services be adequately marked and identifiable. They weren't, and we saw what happened.

UNREVISED HANSARD

This is the fundamental problem I have and I have mentioned this throughout the Rules process. This Parliament waits until the proverbial has hit the fan, and then we take action. It took people getting hurt. It took property being destroyed for us to finally say, "Oh wait, perhaps somebody actually had a point". That is something that I hope, as we go forward and as we look not only at the NA Rules but the Joint Rules, we look at ways we can curb this kind of thing and fill in our weaknesses. This document is 21 years old. Let's hope that we don't have to wait another 21 years for changes.

In conclusion, I must say I was going to thank everyone concerned and say what a good time I had on it. I have an incredibly sour taste left in my mouth now, which I didn't think would happen. I do maintain that it is our united job to restore the dignity of Parliament, and my party and I will certainly do our bit.

We must be profoundly proud of our Parliament and we must jealously protect our Constitution, at all costs. May we, as Parliament, be reminded that we are the servants of the people, and in all our duties executed, may we make sure that we benefit only South Africa. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, in considering these Rules this afternoon, I think we must be careful that we do not throw the baby out with the bathwater. Listening to the hon Mazzone, I reflected on a number of the elements contained in these newly-drafted Rules that will have a positive effect on the way that we, as Members of Parliament, function in this House. It will also enable us to ensure that our main responsibility, which is oversight of the executive, is carried out in that manner.

It has taken a long time to come of age – 21 years – but at least we have arrived somewhere. I agree with the hon Speaker, that these Rules are a living document. It is dynamic. It can be changed for particular circumstances as we move along. In fact, a number of the amendments that have been proposed in the last three years are as a result of particular circumstances in which we found ourselves in this House. Otherwise, we would not have amended some of these Rules.

Having said that, I noted that Cabinet had issued a statement saying they were very concerned – hon Minister Radebe – at the goings-on in Parliament, and I agree with you. I think we have all said we are very concerned about what happens here. By the same token, however, the executive needs to know that we, as Members of Parliament, are also very concerned about the way

UNREVISED HANSARD

members of the executive sometimes react to questions that have been put to them, the nonchalant and flippant responses and the incomplete responses. These are things that we need to tighten. As Parliament, we have a responsibility, as leaders of parties or as Whips, to engage with the Leader of Government Business so that we can find a way.

There have been proposals for unscripted questions, and I think the reason for that is because of the way that we sometimes get a response from the executive. Today is a classic example. We found that 15 members' statements were made by members of this House. It took some prodding to get members of the executive to respond to those members' statements, and we still didn't even get six Ministers to respond.

There is a concept of parliamentary officers. Now, I've been here long enough to know the duties of parliamentary officers. We need to make provision in our Rules for what parliamentary officers should be doing. They should be a liaison between a Ministry and Members of Parliament. Very few of them, however, if any, conduct that responsibility in that manner. That is lacking, because we can get the kind of answers that we require from departments if, hon Ministers, your parliamentary officers are on the ball and interact with us, as Members of Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Having said that, we will support the Rules because we believe that there is an opportunity for us to have further discussions. Let's not dismiss good suggestions, however.

The last thing I want to say is this. When you get this card here on a field of play, it means you are cautioned. When you get this card here – the EFF colour – I mean, the red card, it means you must leave the field of play. This is something we need to learn. When you get this card from the presiding officers you leave the field of play.

However, we must put in place some sort of review mechanism to review some of the decisions of the presiding officers, and we need to have a multi-party committee to do that, because even referees, in a game of soccer or rugby, are also called to order. Even after you have left the field, the referee is cautioned by Fifa, or whoever else.

So, we need to find mechanisms where we can find each other and work together. As I said, we will support these Rules as a way forward after 21 years of having the Rules that we had in 1994. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Speaker, hon members, from the onset the NFP acknowledges that there is a need for all of us to agree that the decorum and the dignity of Parliament is paramount. The non-negotiable starting point should inform any rules that we develop, agree to and adopt. The Rules of Parliament must necessarily be rooted in the Constitution of our country augmented by the selected legislation and conventions that govern processes and proceedings.

The image and dignity of our Parliament has been badly tarnished nationally and internationally and it is incumbent upon all of us to restore the image of this august House. The responsibility to correct the mistakes of the past and pave the way for the future is one that we have to shoulder collectively. We are representatives of people who voted for us and we embodied the full spectrum of South African society. It cannot be that through our conduct we deny the voice of any part of our people represented here from being heard. Such conduct would amount to fascist tactics, to stifle, muzzle debate and shut down avenues of expression and legislative innovations.

The NFP is ready to be part of reclaiming the dignity of Parliament and we would strife to ensure that the importance of order is acknowledged in the final analysis. We are ready to

UNREVISED HANSARD

participate in the new order of a fair and equitable Rules will guide our behaivour and where dignity in our interaction and conduct will be set as a norm.

Frivolous motions, spurious points of order, insults and such should not be part of the lexicon of Parliament. We are here to fulfil the important function and that is to express the will of the people and we simply cannot justify the use of taxpayers' money to sow division and chaos in this august House. Parliament cannot and should not be the playground of individuals who have big egos. It is a collective institution where we should strife to work for the benefit of our people not only represented any single party here.

The NFP firmly believes that if we have a first set of ambiguous Rules and if we stick to the Rules there will be order. The single question remains, Madam Speaker, what do we do when a member of this august House or members of this House do not submit to the Rules? While the NFP believes that a mere slap on the wrist is insufficient deterrent, we are also sceptical on abridged use of the Parliamentary Protection Services.

The ugly scenes splashed across the national and international media screens of the hon members being ejected from Parliament

UNREVISED HANSARD

are not palatable. We believe that stricter Rules governing the powers and discretion of the Presiding Officers to call on the Parliamentary Protection Services must be considered and we should all insists that all members of the Parliamentary Protection Services must wear a distinctive and identifiable uniform before they are ever called to come into the Chamber again.

Finally, individual hon Members of Parliament were engaged in an unparliamentarily conduct, in particular, conduct aimed at disrupting the proceedings of this House need to be addressed. If we are here to ensure compliance with the Rules, we need to develop appropriate sanctions and long-term consequences for such transgressions. The NFP supports these Rules. [Applause.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Speaker and hon members, the UDM supports the Report of the NA Rules Committee primarily because we want to work and focus on tasks of serving the people of South Africa. However, I think it is important for us to note that our Parliament is a different kind and a special kind of a problem. When you have Rules, you have Rules so that you do not have chaos but here we have chaos even though we have Rules. This means we have a bigger problem. It is a bigger problem because

UNREVISED HANSARD

we even said that in 2012 that this is a bigger problem which needs a political solution.

We welcome this step, obviously, because the tightening of Rules was very necessary. The EFF who are not here today, as a stakeholder they also have an important part to play. If they keep on saying they want a political solution or find problems with some of the things that are happening here then they must tell us what is it that they want, from us as the collective to do. They need to tell us exactly what we need to do in order to meet them halfway.

Kungenjalo, siya kucula sodwa apha babe bona besenza owabo unothanda. [If not so, we will sing alone here while they are busy doing whatever they want.]

The other issue which is also very important here is a vicious fight between the ANC and the EFF, whether you like it or not. We said in the past that maybe a bilateral meeting between the ANC and EFF and later on, the meeting with us would solve the problem. [Interjections.] Frankly, we are stewing in your soup and we are not familiar with most of the fundamental issues that you are fighting about. That is a fact. When you fight is that you turn all of us into *strooimeisies* and ball boys ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

... ezihamba nje nani ingathi siyanikhapha. [... that just walk with you as if we are accompanying you.]

Having said all of that, there is just no justification for the violence that we saw in the House, last weekend. I would be failing in my duties, as a young leader, if I did not condemn it. I also want to say to the EFF that they might be upset or angry about certain issues but we all have a responsibility to build the winning nation. At the same time I also want to say that they have a good thing going. Politically, they do but they must not soil it with violence because it undermines even the victories that they have scored, so far. We support it, thank you so much. [Applause.]

Ms J D KILLIAN: Madame Speaker, the ANC is very grateful that we have finally reached this stage after four years of toil to present to the National Assembly a set of revised Rules. Now hon Speaker, we all know where it emanates from. First of all, all Houses of Parliament all over the world function in terms of Rules of order and conduct. Rules are meant to guide members as to what the Rules of political engagement are during all deliberations in the House — be it question sessions, plenaries and even in committees.

UNREVISED HANSARD

In some jurisdictions, such as the United Kingdom, the House of Commons for instance, operates on a very minimal set of Rules. Why is that the case? That is so hon Speaker, because the conduct of members are actually guided by parliamentary practice and convention, more so than by strict Rules. It is just not acceptable for members to participate in a manner that does not build the democratic culture of some countries.

In general, they have respect for their countries, the democratic institutions and the electorate, who gave the parties their respective mandates. They accept it. If one party wins an election, they have the right to set up the governing executive.

Given our divisive of past, we are acutely aware that in 1994 when this Parliament was established, it was necessary to send a delegation - I think the hon Minister Radebe, was part of that delegation to come and engage here in Parliament to see how certain Rules could be developed so that once the new Parliament is inaugurated and members have been sworn in, they could actually have documents to guide the conduct of members in the House.

Now, we have been told during this very lengthy process that they used the interim Constitution as a point of departure and

UNREVISED HANSARD

then also used the previous Parliament Assembly Rules as well as the Senate Rules to draft the first NCOP and National Assembly Rules for this House.

Now, during that process, several Rules were in fact elaborated after 1994. And I think the hon Chaw its mention here because there was a task team that in fact worked on the Chapter on legislation. And because the Constitution is very extensive on how Parliament should process legislation, it was necessary for them to align that section with the Constitution.

Some other ad hoc arrangements and changes were made. But somehow, certain Rules escaped scrutiny and as we stand here currently, we still have a Rule, Rule 45(1), which reads; every member is to be uncovered when he or she enters or leaves the Chamber, or moves to any other part of the Chamber during the debate, which is rather at odds with parliamentary practice where we know people from different religions; we have traditional headgear and all of that. So, that one escaped.

The Speaker of the 4th Parliament then recommended that we should go through the Rules extensively. And I think it’s just very important because when the first House team was established, we met for the first time in July-August 2012. And

UNREVISED HANSARD

the task team was in fact expanded by the participation of the previous member Ms Sybil Seaton, who was a Member of Parliament for the IFP, as well as Mr Mike Ellis, who participated very extensively. Hon Kalyan is not here today, but she was part of that initial task team that was set up.

The task team agreed on the following guiding principles: firstly, the Rules had to be aligned with the Constitution and should stand the test of time; irrespective of who wins an election, it must be a set of Rules that allows the governing alliance or party to govern and the opposition to fulfill their role of scrutiny together with the other members of the National Assembly; secondly, the Rules should not regulate politics, but instead create an enabling environment to conduct politics; thirdly, it should capture the best conventions and practices that we have established. And let us be honest, we have established good practices and conventions and there is a lot written up on that score; and then lastly, we said the Rules should promote the public image of Parliament. Little did we know then that we would find ourselves in the situation where people don’t respect the Rules. And even if we pass the Rules today, we have a challenge on hand because if people that not respect the previous set of Rules, which was in fact a good document for a period of more than 20 years, and we could

UNREVISED HANSARD

operates somehow, we have no guarantee that the EFF will in fact conduct themselves in accordance with a new set of Rules, not withstanding the fact that we have multiparty agreement on those.

Just before the 2014 elections task team concluded their work. At that stage, there was just not enough time to present to the Rules Committee and to the House. And therefore a new subcommittee was established.

Now hon Speaker, I think what is important is that we have worked extensively. All together, we presented 10 draft sets of revised Rules. And we want you to bring everybody on board. We really wanted to make sure that it was a multiparty document and that we in fact give effect to the tenets of and the values of the Constitution because we are all aware the powers and obligations of this National Assembly.

Now, what is important is that we have developed specific very good improved sections and I just want to mention a few in passing. The hon Speaker also referred to more regular and longer questions sessions with the executive. If members are dissatisfied, we have very clear Rules on how long members of the executive have an opportunity to answer, but there will be a

UNREVISED HANSARD

record to be kept and there will be regular liaison between the office of the Speaker and the Leader of government business to see whether the members of the executive are in fact taking this Parliament seriously, are they replying in due time etc.

Secondly, as far as members are concerned, we have brought on board the declaration of private interests. We have created clarity about procedure to raise a question of privilege. We have worked extensively on points of order because it has become a practice, other members hop up and down on the basis of a point of order which is completely not a point of order. Alternatively they use a point of privilege. And a point of privilege is something completely different. And hon Speaker, I think we will have to workshop our members to make sure that they understand what the difference is. Then, we have also ... unfortunately hon Natasha Mazeni, referred to that ... had to bring on board Rule 53(8) for the forceful removal of members. Now that was a pity that we all had to agree to that.

Now Speaker, I just want to say that the hon Mdakane referred to the issues raised by the DA. Firstly is the sequence of proceedings. One of the breaking points in our Rules Committee on Tuesday was the sequence of proceedings. But I fail to understand hon Speaker, is the sequence proceedings that we have

UNREVISED HANSARD

now introduce no different from what we see in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. What they have there is exactly what we have. The only matter that we brought in was swearing in of members. Here they have opportunity for prayers. You can check on your documentation, announcement from the Chair, we have that, then motions; we have motions by the Chief Whip, then orders of the day and notices of motion on the Order Paper, which shall be dealt with in sequence. Now that's exactly what we have in the new version of the sequence of proceedings. Why the DA is now securing the toys out of the cot? On that one we don't understand. [Applause.]

Secondly, is the Programming Committee. Hon Speaker, the DA should be aware that in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature, they have the so-called programming group. But that body is constituted on the basis of proportionality. Here, we have created a consensus decision making body as far as programming is concerned, with a deadlock breaking mechanism if no consensus is reached. And we all know about the case that was revisited in court. So, clearly as far as that is concerned, we are also far more democratic.

And then lastly, hon Speaker, questions without notice to the executive; those are the unscripted questions. Now, what we

UNREVISED HANSARD

wanted to ascertain is how does it work in the provincial Parliament of the Western Cape?

The fact is, there is a session of 20 minutes. Members are putting in their names in a hat and if you are lucky your name is drawn and if you happen to be at the member of the opposition and you come in at the tail end, what they do is push the reply by the premier out for longer than 20 minutes. So, you just simply don't get your opportunity to pose a question, which is unscripted. Secondly, there is no provision for any executive member to be asked an unscripted question.

So now our recommendation from the ANC to the DA is, first get your own house in order in the Western Cape. Show us what you do and how you improve democratic participation there, only then.

Now, we have a very serious concern about the conduct of the DA here in the House. And let us be honest, even Tony Leon, expressed his concern. And I want to just quote this hon Speaker: "the forces of opposition are at once familiar and very different. The Democratic Party, DP, successor, the DA, holds the position of official opposition in an amalgam of the DP and NP," and then he moves on to say, "Van Zyl Slabbert once warned that you can't out miaau miaau the miaau miaau."

UNREVISED HANSARD

Now, that is the first lesson which the DA needs to adapt to. Yet, you can't out EFF the EFF. Find your soul as a constructive opposition party as one which is patriotic, loyal to South Africa, help us build institutions that will live and thrive long after this generation.

Even the youngsters have passed through the doors of this House. So that is what we ask them. First get your house in order and then you can come and tell us what to do. Here, we rule with a 62%. In the Western Cape you barely have 54% of the votes in the Western Cape. The ANC has 38% ... Please don't dictate to us. Thank you. [Time expired] [Applause.]

Mr S N SWART: Madam Speaker, the ACDP will support these Rules. My colleague, Cheryllyn Dudley, participated at length in the deliberations but, regrettably, she is not feeling well today.

Let me raise few issues. Of course, the issue which is pertinent to all of us is the unruliness that has been taking place, so we welcome the amendments that have been inserted in the Rules to deal with the removal of Members of Parliament that are impacting upon the decorum and the legitimacy of the House in the eyes of the public. Many of us have here for many years and we have seen unprecedented sights. It has been very disturbing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

There are members of the EFF who are very amicable in the passages, but it seems when they come together, they, as they have admitted, bring a revolution into the House. It is time that we as 94% of the House say so far and no further. [Applause.]

While we appreciate that the EFF might have certain sentiments about President Zuma, and while it is their view that he may never again speak in this House, I think it is incorrect for them to then say that we, as other opposition members, may not put questions as we intended the other day. That led ... there was a huge ... [Inaudible.] ... so why can't we put questions as opposition members? So I think it is incorrect and I also think the voters out there need to be aware that the majority of Members of Parliament want to see Parliament exercising oversight correctly and want President Zuma and the executive held accountable in this Parliament.

I would urge the presiding officers to make use of the button that silences. When we sit at the back and we continually hear these ... on and on and on, please just stop it! We have that. Let's use that. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Another issue which was of great concern to me last week is that we had a lot of children in the gallery. If it seen that the situation is getting out of hand, maybe we should consider first taking the children, or having a quiet moment before we have those scenes, because it was very disturbing. We saw a number of the children crying out in dismay at what was happening. But, let us hope that this does not happen again and that these Rules ... Obviously, when you pass Rules, you are hoping for self-governance and that people will govern themselves and that you won't have to implement the Rules. But, up till now, we have seen a specific agenda specifically from the EFF. While I am very fond of them individually, collectively we cannot allow this to continue.

So, let us stand together and let us also possibly implement the Leader of Government Business ... When we had the discussion at the end of last year, there were eight points that my leader, Reverend Meshoe, raised. Let us discuss these politically, but we need to draw that line in the sand. I thank you very much.

Mr L R MBINDA: Hon Speaker, as the PAC we support the revised Rules. However, we wish to reiterate our position that the problem with our Parliament is not necessarily the Rules, but rather the premise on which those Rules was established.

UNREVISED HANSARD

It is common knowledge that you cannot use western rules to govern African people. African value systems and western value systems contradict each other fundamentally. Our people on the ground are struggling to practice their African morals, culture and norms due to the constraints imposed on their everyday lives against their will by Roman-Dutch law. There is a challenge of the African jurisprudence compared to the European jurisprudence.

If this is a Parliament of the people, for the people, by the people, and our people are African in their overwhelming majority, then we must Africanise our Parliament. As per our African norms and customs, respect and discipline are at the centre of that. How we relate as African people and how we communicate as African people, differs completely from how others from other parts of the world do things. Our children now have rights in their own parent's household. This is a recipe for social disorder that is why you see young people calling elderly people by their first or last name.

We are saying it here again that the problem of this Parliament is not Rules, but the officiating and the foundation on which it was formed. Our presiding officers are allowed to remain office bearers and senior leaders of political parties. This

UNREVISED HANSARD

compromises their impartiality and the smooth running of the business of Parliament. They should rather be given a security of tenure like judges in order to maintain their independence.

The problem in this House is not its Rules or some individuals. Africans are being guided by European rules of engagement, our nation is losing its moral fibre, and western ways of living are imposed to the detriment of African norms, values and culture. We are Africans and we will forever remain on the African continent and in this Parliament. Also, South Africa is an integral part of Africa and thus we ought to refer to African ways to redress African challenges and circumstances.

Although we support these amendments, changing the Rules for each and every eventuality is, I think, reactive than proactive.

Mr N T GODI: Hon Speaker, comrades and hon members, the APC supports this long-awaited report. The process to review the Rules has been a long and thorough one. We may not agree with every line in the report, but no one can say that this does not represent a substantive and progressive enhancement of this House’s constitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Rules are dynamic and so it was necessary to engage in a process of review. This is indeed a milestone, taking into account how long ago since the Rules were last substantively changed. These Rules assist to ensure order and discipline in the work of Parliament.

The state of conduct in this Fifth Parliament highlighted the need to enhance our Rules and procedures. Where common human decency doesn't exist, rules become necessary lest there be anarchy.

But comrades, rules alone cannot resolve entrenched and deliberate political posturing. There is a need for all to respect these Rules, after all, we are elected representatives of the people and must set, by force of example, the best conduct.

The APC would like to extend its warm congratulations to the chairperson of the subcommittee, Comrade Mdakane, and to his team for a job well done. [Applause.] Well, the Rules are now agreed upon. Let us have order and discipline. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, let's be very clear. As the DA, we reject and distance ourselves from the behaviour of the EFF in this House.

We don't believe it advances parliamentary democracy. We don't believe that it advances the cause of the people who've sent us to this House to represent them. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: You just walk out!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Like you walked out to the City of Cape Town yesterday. You call it barbaric. This is double standards, hon Cronin. We've come to expect it from you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Let me just say that to say these Rules are a reflection of the Corder Report is a stretch too far. They are not in line with some of the recommendations made by Prof Corder. Chief amongst those is that he said that accountability is not good enough. You need to have amendatory accountability at the core of our parliamentary oversight role. So, what that means is that when Ministers come here to account, they must not only tell us what they have done wrong; they must tell South Africans how they are going to fix that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

I think that what we are seeing here today is a classic case of the ostrich putting its head in the sand. The elephant in the room is the Constitutional Court judgment that was handed down earlier this month. [Interjections.] You see, you are already dismissing it. You are already dismissing it because it is an uncomfortable skewer for the ANC and because it showed and exposed – for everybody to see – how the ANC has plucked the teeth out of Parliament over the last 20 years and left it in a situation where it is simply unable to do its job. That was pointed out by the Constitution.

Now, the hon Kilian came up here. Being lectured by a retreaded National Party apparatchik about democracy is the ultimate insult. [Interjections.] She has crossed the floor more times than she crosses the street. She is the classic ...

Mrs J D KILIAN: Hon Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Steenhuisen! Please take your seat.

Mrs J D KILIAN: Will the hon Steenhuisen take a question, or will he be too scared? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: See how she is living by the Rules.

The SPEAKER: Will you take a question, hon Steenhuisen?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I don’t take questions from National ...

Mrs J D KILIAN: He cannot respond! You have more members of the National Party ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I don’t take questions ...

Mrs J D KILIAN: You have more members from the National Party in your caucus than are here. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I don’t ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Kilian, he won’t take a question. Proceed, hon Steenhuisen.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I don’t take questions from retreaded apartheid-era apparatchiks like the hon Kilian. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

She is a classic case of somebody who says ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members! Allow him to finish his speech.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: She is a classic case of somebody who says the following: These are my principles. If you don't like them, I have others. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

There are unscripted questions to the premier. We know why the ANC doesn't want to have unscripted questions to their Ministers. It is because they know that most of their Ministers, with a few notable exceptions, couldn't answer a decent question in this House if they tried.

I would be very careful about quoting former leaders of the organisation. Denis Goldberg, Ahmed Kathrada, and a whole host of other leaders have had some very interesting things to say about where the ANC finds itself.

Now, the hon Mdakane says we are an angry party. We know why he's angry today. [Interjections.] Luthuli House doesn't get it right very often, but when they made you the Chief Whip, hon Mthembu, they did get it right. You are a much better choice

UNREVISED HANSARD

than the hon Mdakane, and that's why he is so upset. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

He also then goes on to say that, perhaps, I need a lecture in parliamentary accountability and democracy. Let me tell you – let me just tell you this: You guys are getting a hiding every single day in court. You haven't won a single case that's been taken on review over the conduct of this Parliament and how the ANC and its presiding officers are trampling, on a daily basis, on the rights of members of this House to hold the executive accountable. [Interjections.] That is a reflection on you and your party, hon Mdakane. Go and win a few cases. Go and win a few cases first before you come back here and lecture us on parliamentary accountability and democracy. [Applause.] Who can forget Adv Nkosi-Thomas stuttering and mumbling her way through your pathetic case in the Constitutional Court?

Let me tell you something. The ANC in this House wants to have its cake and eat it. So, when a party stands up for the Rules and has supported various Rules in this House that have been proposed around conduct, etc and sits for hours in committees, you say we are not constructive. You compare us to the party of the EFF. You moan about the EFF. You birthed them, you raised them badly, and now you are wondering why these children are

UNREVISED HANSARD

behaving in this manner? [Applause.] [Interjections.] They were birthed out of your organisation. Their behaviour is a reflection of you. The EFF and the ANC are different sides of exactly the same coin in South Africa! [Applause.]

We want unscripted questions because it is a way to hold the executive accountable, an important way. We believe that the order of business is a sticking point because what it does is it places the business of the executive ahead of the business of the people of South Africa. The Constitution is clear. It says that one of our responsibilities is providing a national forum for public consideration of issues. Members of Parliament are elected here to represent members of the public. If their business is dumped to the end of a programme, it shows the contempt that the ANC has for elected representatives and your subservience to an overbearing executive. We won't support that. [Applause.]

Mr M S BOOI: Good afternoon, Madam Speaker, members of Parliament, and people in the gallery. There are things that are important, that we must do as Members of Parliament. It is important to read the Rules, so that we don't come here and howl most of the time and make no sense.

UNREVISED HANSARD

You see, what is important is that we go along with what you are saying, hon Natasha. We have great regard for your contribution, but on the day in question which is Tuesday, it's what we have been observing as the ANC and is very despicable.

If you are not able begin to go along with the role that women are playing within the institution and their leadership, you become a little bit unacceptable. Keep quite; I will give you a lecture now. So what happen ...? Keep quite. So, I am saying to you, here is hon Natasha, making a contribution for two and a half years with us. Come Tuesday, we are seated in the Rules Committee, come the man along and kick her aside and they took over the Rules and start running the institution. Now, how do you look at that?

I grew up in the ANC understanding that patriarchy is wrong. It is so wrong when men think that it is them and only them that could make sense. She was so correct that we respected her and we worked with for two years. But when the men came suddenly everything is wrong. We don't know what they are complaining about, we have been working her everyday she makes sure she goes back to her party, she engages her party, but she came back ... You know it was so bad when a woman is being treated in the manner I have seen on Tuesday in front of the institution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Because we couldn't understand how they could treat this hon member in the manner as if she was nothing in the committee even to learn from her how you did arrive in what is being constituted within the Rules itself. That is the part that we are complaining about, that is unacceptable. We can't treat women in that particular way and it is a growing attitude. We are saying that how do you treat the Speaker in the House. You show no respect to her. You don't understand what does she represent, that is why it is easy for them to say she must go this way, vote of no confidence and so on. Because they have no respect for women and I will never support somebody who goes on like that. I don't patronise her.

What you must understand hon Kwankwa, if I can be able to reflect on you. You see, within the Rules, we have gone back to the EFF. We have told the EFF to make submission. You are making it our problem. They have made a submission that what they would want us to be able to do for them is to chair the House. To come and sit here and take over, these are political solutions. It is not easy like that, because it is not about the ANC.

We have got 14 parties here. I mean you are here, you are different opposition parties and there is an opposition party. There is the EFF. There are other parties. What do you expect us

UNREVISED HANSARD

to do? What do you expect the ANC to do? To jump all other parties and go to the EFF? On which basis? And this is what we have been explaining to them. When the new Chief Whip got into his position, he called the EFF in room V16 and we were in that meeting. We took them through and we said to them make a commitment of working with us, so that together we could be able to improve the image of Parliament. We met them in the morning. What did they do that afternoon? The same afternoon, they are here disrupting the President. What do you expect us to do, as an organisation? Should we sit here and watch as our President is being humiliated? But people are asking us to open up positions for them here to do what?

We are not children. We know what is going on. So, at no stage have we ever ignored them. We have been engaging them politically, even at the worst it. Even at the detriment of our own organisation, but they show no respect us and even here. And we have been going after them ensuring that they even participate in the subcommittee. We have gone out of our way to make sure that they come and participate. Definitely sure they have made so many contributions, but they are the first ones to violate those contributions. What do you expect the ANC to do? Should we sit back? That is why I am saying that, we are being pushed around because we got this majority as if we have not

UNREVISED HANSARD

been voted in. As if we came here to plead with people to come along with us. We have done that for quite a long time. I am one and I will never compromise on that one, because I worked very hard to win the voters to be on my side. I don't plead with you. I work and I spend nights and nights to be able to persuade voters to understand the views of the ANC, because if there is a manifesto I go and preach it. So, we don't really have to sit here and be seen as if we are begging, but we go out of our way to make sure that people have an understanding.

The Speaker herself, which is what people don't understand and acknowledge ... I can really ask how many times did the Speaker got into multiparty meetings and sit together with different parties and make commitments. She comes here and everybody looks like she has never been able to engage. What type of an engagement do you want from us? What type of respect do you want form us? Because you have to respect us as an organisation, so that you could in return be respected back.

And this is what we are saying in many of this issues, definitely sure. We have been able to walk along again into improving the Rules. Definitely the incident of last week had been very disturbing to all of us, but we are saying that on 10 and 11 when we look at how we make sure that this remains

UNREVISED HANSARD

sacrosanct but as we go out of the door we are saying the security services must take over and they must be able to make sure that their own work is done and not be prohibited by anything because we accommodate everybody. We have been able to make sure that there is an understanding of the role of the protection services which has been the agreement with the DA. When the DA said to us, no, we want a multiparty system so that whenever these problems are being reviewed, we even withdrew and waited patiently for them to come with a suggestion. They couldn't, but we did it.

And we are seated here, no I am a participant. You are not a participant in the committee. So, I am saying at the end of the day the ANC at every step that it takes, has been able to make sure that it engages different parties. The ANC talks to different parties. We have not drafted this document. That is why it took us two years to be able to resolve some of the matters, because you have been very sure that some of us have been here for a longer time and some of the members of the EFF and other parties have just come into the Parliament. But the ANC didn't want to run up. It had to make sure that it accommodates everybody to understand what is it that it wants to do to improve the environment of Parliament. It never happens. Now we are being blamed as if we are the ones that have wronged

UNREVISED HANSARD

people here, while we do our best as an organisation, because we have a tradition. It is part of our values that is why everything in the Constitution that we have been able to make sure that everybody and we are the ones that are practising the multiparty systems. We don't make anybody to feel bad. We will never make hon Kilian feel bad in our organisation; because we do know for a matter of fact that number of people that have come into the DA that belongs to the National Party. We know those things, but we are not here to say any Member of Parliament must be disrespected. We live above that, because you always treat human beings as [Inaudible.] of important. That is why in the Constitution of this country, we ensured that there is human rights and Bill of Rights, so that we can always protect the rights of each and every individual. It is not an easy issue.

People have moved over from different parties to come to the ANC because it respects human beings and South Africans and it does see that everybody can add value to society. It gives them the opportunity to participate and she is doing a very good work in our organisation.

The fact that she is being hated by different parties is because she is making a positive contribution within our organisation on

UNREVISED HANSARD

how to improve society and that is what we like and we will never walk away from that. We know how many people would love to work with the ANC, even though that they left ANC. We will continuously engage them, but that engagement must not come at the [Inaudible.] where the ANC is being destroyed. We will never destroy the ANC. We have worked very hard. We have sacrificed our time with the ANC to be what it is. But what we are saying even for our young people, we continuously say to them that this is an organisation that we value, because we are putting our lives into this organisation.

Even before 1990 many of them can't tell me, the type of sacrifices different comrades have made for this organisation. They have made it on the basis that we value human life and we will always protect human life, because it is very important for our society and the society that we want to build, so that we should be able to feel that we are accommodating each other.

Hon Mdakane, chaired the meetings very well, but he couldn't believe when I went to him as the Chairperson of the committee to tell him that you can't treat women in the manner that you are treating them. Give them respect, because is in their interest.

UNREVISED HANSARD

You see, this is the problem of some of the things when you don't understand them, because at the end of the day the levels of racialism within the DA ... We do know this and it's not even being said by me, it has been said by the *Business Day* on Tuesday. Hon Steenhuizen was redoing an analysis and quite clearly I can deal with that quite frankly that the level of how hon Steenhuizen gets the clapping of hands and how Maimane gets clapping of hands shows the difference of understanding within the DA. And these are the things we don't create. We sit here and we say here is leader of the party, doesn't get the necessary respect. When hon Steenhuizen come here, there are good shouts and good ...

SPEAKER: Is hon Steenhuizen.

Mr M S BOOI: Oh, hon Steenhuizen.

Mr N Singh: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr M S BOOI: Okay, thank you very much. Thank you my good friend. So, I am just saying that ... hon Mbinda, if we wanted to promote violence, we wouldn't have abandoned the armed struggle. We would have never abandoned armed struggle. We have abandoned armed struggle because we respect human life. That's

UNREVISED HANSARD

why we were engaged on guerrilla warfare, we were not engaged in full combat, because with guerrilla warfare we knew that we had to protect the lives of our people. We had even protected those that were our own enemies. We did all these things because it is in our culture, it is in the fact that ubuntu is with us. We are Africans and we respect human life, even at the worst times when people sold us out. We always knew that, we will give you a second chance to be able to repent and work with us and that is the ANC I know.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker I would like to give an amendment in terms of the Rules, if I may.

The SPEAKER: What is the amendment, hon member?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That the House —

(1) amends the National Assembly Revised Rule 29(8) to read as follows: Subject to the Constitution and these Rules, and unless altered by a resolution of the House, the business

UNREVISED HANSARD

on each sitting here in the House must follow the following sequence of events:

(a) opportunity for silent prayer or meditation;

(b) announcements from the Chair;

(c) swearing in of new members;

(d) notices of motion;

(e) opportunity for statements by members and responses to statements by Cabinet members;

(f) statements by Cabinet members and orders of the day and notices of motion on the Order Paper which must be dealt with in sequence provided that precedence must be given to Questions on Questions Days.

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuizen, can we have a copy of the proposed amendment. We will have to put the amendment to the House so that we get the agreement of the House on the amendment that has been tabled by the DA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Question put: ...

Division demanded.

Mr M WATERS: Speaker.

The SPEAKER: So hon members, in actual fact the question has been carried. [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Carried or killed?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we won.

Question put: That the amendment as moved by the Chief Whip of the Opposition be agreed to.

Division demanded.

House divided.

AYES - 61: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hill-

UNREVISED HANSARD

Lewis, G G; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Ross, D C; Schmidt, H C; Selfe, J; Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Terblanche, J F; Topham, B R; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

NOES - 210: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Beukman, F; Bhengu, N R; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Hlengwa, M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B;

UNREVISED HANSARD

Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlobo, M D; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mbinda, L R; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M;

UNREVISED HANSARD

Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Swart, S N; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mnguni, P J.

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negatived.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

AYES - 211: Abrahams, B L; Adams, P E; Adams, F; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Beukman, F; Bhengu, N R; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Hlengwa, M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlobo, M D; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L

UNREVISED HANSARD

M; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mbinda, L R; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Swart, S N; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NOES - 61: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Ross, D C; Schmidt, H C; Selfe, J; Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Terblanche, J F; Topham, B R; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, may I request that by the time we get back after the elections we have new Rule books printed for all of us?

UNREVISED HANSARD

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Singh. I think that is a matter that we will make sure that the Table staffs ensures that it happens while we are in recess. The Secretary will now read the Third Order ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, we just dealt with the first report of Rules committee. There were a number of other matters that were contained in that meeting, most notably a ruling as a result of deliberations in the subcommittee around the quotation from court judgements. Are you going to be delivering a considered ruling on that before we rise, or it is going to be done at a later stage because there are implications if it is going to be delayed?

The SPEAKER: We will arrange that we have an update on that report and we will talk about it before we rise. The Secretary will read the Third Order.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, I have my hand up.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Zulu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, I would also request that the new Rules be printed on a much more durable cover and preferably the company that does it must be a small business company.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I do not know about that advert, but the Secretary will note that. The Secretary, please, read the Third Order.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRADE AND INDUSTRY ON REMOTE GAMBLING BILL

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party, National Freedom Party and African National Congress.

Mr M B MKONGI: Hon Speaker, the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry considered a Bill proposed by the DA on Remote Gambling. In doing so, we have managed to discuss the matter, the pros and cons, but we resolved that the committee rejects the Bill. The committee rejects the Bill on these grounds: Firstly, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa is intended to build a nation with dignity; secondly, to build a responsible citizenry; and lastly, to build a cohesive society.

UNREVISED HANSARD

If you take the Gambling Bill and the gambling policy of the Republic of South Africa it notes that gambling in South Africa have been perpetuated by apartheid government into Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Venda and Ciskei, TBVC, states in order to build a nation of gamblers, not a nation of workers and productive individuals. Therefore, the Remote Gambling Bill is trying to perpetuate the very same wrong to our own society.

We are saying as the committee that the Gambling Bill is clear enough and it also rejects all other Bills. It rejects the dicing. It rejects the gambling on dog fighting. It rejects cock fighting and other related matters. Therefore, the issue of remote gambling is not going to assist South Africa, but it is going to take South Africa and make it a nation of gamblers. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, I move that the Report of the committee be adopted.

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, the DA would like to make a declaration, please. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Declarations of vote:

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Deputy Speaker, There is a very long history of confusion in the regulation of interactive gambling in South Africa. When the National Gambling Act of 2004, was passed it included the transitional provision which required that online gambling be legislated within a two-year period. However, the Department of Trade and Industry did not meet that deadline and only in 2007 introduced the Amendment Act to regulate interactive gambling. The Amendment Bill was passed by Parliament including the ANC, Mr Mkongi, so the comments that you just made apply to you as well, but it was in fact never enacted

Since then there has been a formal inquiry, the Gambling Review Commission which also recommended that interactive, or what this Bill calls, Remote Gambling might be legalise and regulated. Also the National Responsible Gambling Foundation confirms on the basis of international and local research that the regulation of the industry is the best way to protect the public in their words. That is why they supported the Bill in principle.

Over the last 10 years, the South African public has been exposed to and has participated in remote gambling. By

UNREVISED HANSARD

attempting to outlaw it, we are encouraging criminal activities, the erosion of the rule of law and are not effectively protecting the public. We are also losing revenue and jobs to other jurisdictions.

The Bill that I introduced aims to do two things, namely: Protect the vulnerable from accessing online gambling sites through Financial Intelligence Centre Act requirements and software which allows regulators to track and sport problem gamblers in real time; secondly, aimed more than a decade at long confusion in the regulation of gambling in South Africa by providing a clear predictable and constitutionally acceptable regulatory regime.

The erroneous and specious argument is made and repeated again here today that it is safer for the public to ban it altogether than regulate it. However, in truth the real world effect of an outright ban is that the state will have absolutely no control over the industry and there will be no statutory protection of vulnerable gamblers. The ban is actually a defector open season on remote gambling. The simple fact is that the policy decision taken by the department and by the ANC in opposing this Bill is wrong, and will be proven wrong in the passage of time. I have no doubt that in the years ahead we will be back here passing a

UNREVISED HANSARD

Bill similar to this one because it is simply the common sense thing to do.

Frankly, it is embarrassing for the ANC and for you, Mr Mkongi, to have become, in the committee and here today, the opposition to say no, no, to everything simply because you have no better ideas and did not border to do the hard work to come up with the plan. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Deputy Chair, unfortunately most of the evils of society affect the young and the vulnerable more than the rest, which is also true in most gambling operations but more so in remote gambling. In really giving those serious thought and considering interventions and actions against them all in 2000 illegal operators, it make sense to legalise would be the most effective controlling mechanism. In the broader spectrum, the benefits and very importantly, the cost of legalising remote gambling, far outweighs the challenges of not doing so.

Once regulated it can be better controlled and restricted with appropriate safety measure to protect the vulnerable. Currently, in its unregulated form, it only contributes to the social ills of this country and its people. The need for illegal gambling

UNREVISED HANSARD

control is urgent as it errand the revenue of the regulate site of gambling. It is estimated at more R1 million per annum lost to tax returns alone. Through technology, it is possible to control and manage the remote gambling even more or less activities. Most importantly, control to the needy being talked into loosing their money and that of their families to the evil of gambling. The IFP support the legalising of gambling. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker and hon members, the NFP would not support this. The NFP fully support the recommendation of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry tabled here today. In light of the conclusion of the department's policy on gambling which states clearly that, no new forms of gambling is to be allowed, proceeding with the Remote Gambling Bill will be out ravenous – outside of the law – Even if the gambling policy did favour allowing new forms of gambling, the NFP would still have opposed the Remote Gambling Bill. We believe that gambling is a social evil that causes untold miseries for the poorest of the poor.

You will not understand that because you live of the poorest, you suck the blood of the poorest of the poor. You will not understand that, you take the blood out of the bone of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

poorest of the poor. You have been exposed for these things. The harm done by gambling in our opinion far outweighs any possible benefits of employment and revenue accrued to the state. Gambling is causing children to go to sleep hungry every night in South Africa and people's careers are destroyed daily as they succumb to addiction squandering all their money and often resorting to white collar crimes to fill the addiction and try to cover their losses.

The argument is that online gambling on the internet is going to take place anyway, therefore, we might as well try to regulate it, is in our view, insufficient motivation and justification for the green light to support this. The NFP cannot and would not agree to any proposal that will allow social ills to become acceptable and regulated in cyber space simply for the economic benefit which might be associated with it. The NFP will not support any bill that will destroy our people especially the poorest of the poor. We will not support the opportunist and imperialist policies of profit making at the expense of our people who will even drink the blood of the poorest of the poor. It is quite evident in the Western Cape anyway. The NFP will reject this Remote Gambling Bill with the contempt it deserves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Dr W JAMES: Would this hon example of wasteful and fruitless expenditure take a question?

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: I will not take a question. Hon Deputy Speaker ...

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Emam, I was going to say that the new name that the hon James was giving you is not appropriate, but proceed.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am not surprised because the DA operates on the principle of divide and rule. That is why some of these opportunists were supposed to be protecting the poorest of the poor and the blacks that have been oppressed for 300 years, would support the democrats and be there just for meaningful financial gain. That is all they get from them. I thank you.

Mr B M MASUKU: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, the committee began processing the desirability of the Bill from 26 May till 24 June 2015. The process included public hearings and engagements on the Draft National Gambling Policy. The committee decided to suspend the

UNREVISED HANSARD

process to await the final gambling policy. Final gambling policy was adopted by Cabinet in February 2016.

The policy on interactive gambling was reviewed and the regulations of online or interactive gambling were not supported due to capacity constraints to enforce it and the anticipated socio-economic impacts of online gambling. The very member who was standing here for DA, he could not come with any answers when he was asked how the remote gambling will address these problems. We cannot guarantee that remote gambling activities are conducted responsibly, fairly and honestly whether minors and other vulnerable persons will not be exposed to negative effects of gambling.

Further, we cannot guarantee that this remote gambling will not be used to clean elicit funds which are coming into the country or used for fraud. Based on these reasons, we supported the department when it recommended that due to constrains on its capacity to monitor all this, it will not be able to make sure that remote gambling is checked. At the moment, even just this week, the financial intelligence services told us that at the same time they have a problem when it comes to remote gambling. They cannot control and monitor it. They are still dealing with

UNREVISED HANSARD

the problem of making sure that it is not used fraudulently in the country.

So, based on all these considerations, the bill of the DA was rejected by the committee. Of course DA itself, despite all the protestations, was satisfied that this bill was rejected on fair grounds. I thank you.

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the motion is that the Report be adopted. Are there any objections? I now put the question, those in favour say "I". Hon members, the motion as introduced by the Chairperson of the committee is that, that Report be adopted. Are there any objections? There have been objections, let me put the question again. Those in favour will say "ay" those against will say "no". I think the "ayes" has it.

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, the DA calls for division.

DEPUTY SPEAKER: A division having been called, the bells will be rung for two minutes.

Question put: That the Report of Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on Remote Gambling Bill be agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 198: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Beukman, F; Bhengu, N R; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M;

UNREVISED HANSARD

Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mbinda, L R; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Steyn, A; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v

UNREVISED HANSARD

R Koornhof, N J J; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 60: America, D; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Breytenbach, G; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Esterhuizen, J A; Gana, S M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hlengwa, M; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A R; Mileham, K J; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Msimang, C T; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Ross, D C; Schmidt, H C; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Terblanche, J F; Topham, B R; Van Der Walt, D; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF RECOMMENDATION OF PERSONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO

UNREVISED HANSARD

INFORMATION REGULATOR - REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party, United Democratic Movement, National Freedom Party, Pan Africanist Congress, African Peoples Convention and African National Congress.

Question put: That Adv P Tlakula (Chairperson), Adv L C Stroom (full- time), Mr J C Weapond (full-time), Prof T Pistorius (full-time) and Mr S L S kaMtuze (part-time) be recommended for appointment as members of the Information Regulator.

There was no debate.

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, the DA would like to make a declaration.

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, let us proceed. Go ahead madam.

Declarations of vote:

Mrs G BREYTENBACH: Hon Deputy Speaker, the shortlisting process for the positions on the now to be established Office of the Information Regulator left much to be desired and was typical of

UNREVISED HANSARD

the recent approach of the majority party in the committee of putting everything to the vote and in so doing imposing their will regardless of cogent argument to the contrary.

The candidates were comprised of purely ANC choices and no consideration was given to anything proffered by any of the opposition parties. At the interviewing process it became clear precisely what was envisioned by the majority party, and the chairperson, true to form, did not hesitate to deliver several monologues prior to and during certain interviews. While several good-quality candidates were interviewed, the majority were sadly only available on a part-time basis, which limited the choices and made the process even more challenging.

Regardless, from the outset it was clear that the majority party had only one candidate in mind for the position of the head of the Information Regulator. While the candidate in question undoubtedly has an impressive CV, is very likeable and had a relatively good interview, the committee was somewhat reluctant to confront the rather obvious difficulty of a recent Electoral Court finding of misconduct against her.

The issue was traversed with a measure of discomfort, and responses demonstrated a rather disappointing lack of insight

UNREVISED HANSARD

into the process and a definite reluctance to accept any responsibility for the negative findings. This is important as the Act specifically requires that those appointed to the Information Regulator must be fit and proper persons. Our courts have found that the term "fit and proper" alludes to the personal qualities of a person, and more specifically, whether one can be deemed to be honest and reliable.

Needless to say, the other positions, particularly the permanent positions, were going to be filled by loyal cadre deployment, regardless of merit. This is an important piece of legislation and an important office. It is disappointing that the real opportunity to set up a new office with the best available persons has been allowed to deteriorate into settling for 2nd or 3rd best, simply because the best candidate did not necessarily carry the approval of the majority party

While the DA remains skeptical regarding the suitability of some of the appointees now being foisted upon us due to a process of putting everything to the vote, we cannot in good conscience support the recommendation in its totality. I thank you.

Mr C T MSIMANG: Hon Deputy Speaker, the process to set up this important unit, the Information Regulator was set in motion on

UNREVISED HANSARD

22 May 2015. On this day, the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services wrote to the National Assembly requesting it to recommend five candidates for appointment as the members of the Information Regulator. An advertisement issued by the Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services, in July 2015, yielded good harvest since no less than 39 candidates were nominated by members of the public. Out of the 10 that were shortlisted, the names that are before us now are recommended for appointment.

The IFP notes, this selection to displace recognition of both gender and race. Although the IFP has no reservations about nominees' two to five, it cannot support the appointment of Adv Tlakula. It feels that this is another case of rotation of offending officials from one department to the next. Not so long ago, Adv Tlakula resigned her post as the Chief Electoral Officer of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, under a cloud having been accused of corruption. It is not advisable that she should carry this baggage to a newly established Information Regulator. I thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hawu, phela sawubona, Sekela Somlomo. [Ah, greetings, Deputy Speaker.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Naku ukwenzeka, ndiyanibona mama torwana ukuba nibambe umoya aniyazi noba liza kuthini iTshawe namhlanje. [Uwelewele.] Ngelishwa lomhluzi wamanqina wona uyakusoloko ukrakra kodwa ungafakwanga tyuwa.

Siyi-UDM sithi hayi torwana khaniyekeni uMama uTlakula akhe asebenze. Nithi makasebenze phi? Wayenza impazamo, kwaye siyavuma ukuba simleqile kuba wayegqwidiza, sasingajolisanga kuye ubuqu. Ngoku sithi makaphangele phi yena? Ingaba sithi makahambe ashiye uMzantsi Afrika abheke ngaphandle, uza kufika athini? Into ebalulekileyo yeyokuba uye wajongana nazo iziqhamo zezenzo zakhe. (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows*.)

[This is what is happening - I see that mama you are holding your breath because you don’t know what the Tshawe [clan name] is going to say today. [Interjections.] Unfortunately the hoof in the broth will always be bitter because no salt is added.

As the UDM we are saying that you should please leave Mrs Tlakula alone so that she can do her work. Where must she work? She made a mistake, and we agreed that we pursued her because she was making mistakes; we were not after her personally. Now we are saying where must she work? Are we saying she must leave South Africa and go abroad, and what must she do there? The

UNREVISED HANSARD

important thing is she has faced the consequences of her actions.]

She has faced the consequences of her actions. Now we should give people an opportunity to redeem themselves. [Applause.] As the UDM, we are saying let us give her an opportunity to redeem herself, because up until she made that mistake, though none of us here accused her of incompetence. Actually, we believed in her as the chairperson at the time of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, until the UDM ...

... yafumanisa ukuba zikhona izinto awayezigusha, sazilungisa. Sizilungisile kwaye nangoku ke siza kumjonga noxa simxhasa. Khaniqhube ke! Nakhe isizwe. [Kwaqhwatywa.] [... found out that there were things she was hiding, and we fixed them. We fixed them and even now we will watch her while we support her. Continue then! And build the nation. [Applause.]]

Mr N M KHUBISA: Deputy Speaker, we have seen the names of the candidates and we believe that the process that was followed was fine. However, it is suffice to say that the NFP has some reservation with regard to the person who should be the chair of this body because of the cloud that still hanging over her,

UNREVISED HANSARD

while she was still the chairperson of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC. We have reservation. Thank you.

Mr L R MBINDA: Hon Chair, in this country we have forgiven quite a lot of people. Some of them have committed very serious atrocities and then I do not understand why she should not be given a second chance. As the PAC, we really support Mama Tlakula to be appointed. [Applause.]

Mr N T GODI: Deputy Speaker: I have looked at the list submitted; I must admit that I am not very familiar with the number of the names on that list, except the person proposed to be the chairperson of the Information Regulator. I am standing here on behalf of the APC to say that because of her we support the entire list and support that she must be the chairperson. [Applause.]

Adv Tlakula has served this country very well and we can allude to a number of instances where she has done well for the country but can only allude to one instance where perhaps there was a mistake. Now, some of these people are so unyielding and so unforgiving that if we were to follow their doctrine and logic, we will not be able to get anywhere as country. So, we want to say as the APC that we support the list and that it must be

UNREVISED HANSARD

supported by everyone who is reasonable in this House. [Applause.]

Mr B T BONGO: Deputy Speaker, hon members, good evening. In terms of the Protection of the Personal Information Act, the purpose of which is to promote and protect personal information processed by public and private bodies against others. This legislation that is before us is given in terms of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, section 14, which says that everyone has a right to privacy. The right to privacy include protection against unlawful collection, retention, dissemination and the use of personal information. Once this regulator is put into place, the South African public will be now sure that there won't be any unsolicited emails, text messages and calls that they will get from people that they don't know, requesting them to buy or sell products and so forth.

As the ANC we have participated in this process very fairly and we have came to a recommendation as a committee that we need to get the public regulator in the person of hon Pansy Tlakula. Hon Pansy has a *Baccureus Procurationis*, B.Proc degree and LLM that she got from Harvard University; other than that, she has served as the first contingent of the SA Human Rights Commission in

UNREVISED HANSARD

South Africa in 1994, she is participating in the African Union, AU, Human Rights Commission as we speak.

Hon members, once this Act come to effect, any person who uses any cellular phone or any communication with anyone and encroaching into one's privacy, if found to be in the wrong side of the law you will have to pay an amount of R10 million fine.

As the ANC we support that this institution must be set and it must start to work because it would be in the interest of all ordinary South Africans who are prejudiced and affected by people who just get to call them and want them to buy products that are at the end of the day not properly accredited by the institution of SA Institutions.

Thank you. [Applause.]

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, in terms of section 412(a) and (b)(ii) of the Protection of Personal Information Act 2013, persons nominated for appointment to serve on the information regulator must be approved by majority of Members of the Assembly. Although a division has not been demanded, members are required to record their support for the nominations. The bells will be rung for five minutes. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members! I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the yes, no or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member's vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

Question Put

AYES - 198: Abrahams, B L; Adams, P E; Adams, F; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Beukman, F; Bhengu, N R; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian,

UNREVISED HANSARD

J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mbinda, L R; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nobanda, G N; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A;

UNREVISED HANSARD

Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 59: America, D; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Breytenbach, G; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Esterhuizen, J A; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hlengwa, M; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J; Mbhele, Z N; Mokgalapa, S; Motau, S C; Msimang, C T; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Ross, D C; Schmidt, H C; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Terblanche, J F; Topham, B R; Van Der Walt, D; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

UNREVISED HANSARD

As the result of the division showed that there was not a majority of the members of the National Assembly in support of the recommended nominations as required in terms of section 41(2)(b)(ii) of the Protection of Personal Information Act, 2013, the decision of question was postponed. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Deputy Speaker, we respectfully want to raise whether our understanding will not be shared with you that a quorum in the House if we need 201, it should be 201 and we do have that quorum of more than 201 in the House.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before that hon Steenhuisen, just give me a second. Hon members, can I just read to you what I read earlier on and please listen carefully.

In terms of section 4(2)(a) and b(2) of the Protection of Personal Information Act of 2013, persons nominated to serve on

UNREVISED HANSARD

the information regulator must be approved by a majority of members of the Assembly. [Interjections.] The Assembly's members are 400 so you need 201.

Approved! Majority of members of the Assembly!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Deputy Speaker, we do concur with your ruling. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mrs J D KILLIAN: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

Mrs J D KILLIAN: Hon Deputy, I want to ask a question on that matter because if we look at the quorum provision in our current rules, it states that the majority of the members of the National Assembly must be present before a vote may be taken on a Bill or an Amendment of the Bill or etc, at least one third of the members must be present before a vote may be taken on any other question before the Assembly. Does it mean that it must be

UNREVISED HANSARD

a majority voting in favour or does it mean it must be a majority present in this space?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It says approved by the majority of members of the Assembly. [Applause.]

Mrs J D KILIAN: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, go ahead hon member.

Mrs J D KILIAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am sorry and I really apologise to just question this when it says a majority, then it is a majority because we cannot lift the quorum requirements beyond that except in the case of special legislation, where there is provision for a higher quorum. So, just clarity on that matter.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, can I just say this. Hon member, do you want to speak, go ahead. I thought I am responding to the issue so that you can address it as well when I have said it so that you can also respond to what I am saying.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am not sure why anybody will want to address you because the rule and the legislation that this House passed and I am sure the hon Kilian was part of this House when it was passed, says that the majority of members of Assembly. You have clarified that it is 201. It has got nothing to do with quorums; it is the majority of votes cast. So we are not dealing with the quorum matter here, the hon Kilian should know better.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I have given my ruling and so, I will come back to the House now. We will have this checked, confirmed and so on, but otherwise that is the ruling as I have stated. Okay. So, let us proceed.

BUILDING COLLECTIVE ACTION FOR INCLUSIVE GROWTH

(Debate)

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker and hon members, today we debate a matter of national interest. We have agreed on a vision for faster growth, employment creation particularly for our youth and the elimination of poverty. We have a National Development Plan with implementation programmes set out in considerable detail. The President has rightly identified the

UNREVISED HANSARD

priorities for immediate action in our nine-point plan. Our challenge is that confidence in our economy and even in the rest of the world is weak. Investment is depressed, unemployment is rising, sluggish growth is a feature, volatility in financial markets is extreme, and there is a disconnection between the financial markets and the real economy.

This is both caused and aggravated by a volatile and uncertain global environment; depressed trade; limited trade finance; lower global foreign direct investment, FDI; growing inequality contrast with huge ambitions for lifting the bottom 40% of the world's population out of poverty; and implementing the Sustainable Development Goals and searching for a more inclusive growth path. This cycle of lack of confidence plays out through fear and risk aversion in financial markets and wide spread uncertainty.

We have no choice as South Africans to nonetheless seize the nettle, use our resilience and dig deep to find the reservoirs of goodwill and common national interest to map out a common road forward step by step building unity in action among government, business and labour. Using our total resources to build sufficient trust and using our common concern about a further decline in our economic fortunes to defend our economy

UNREVISED HANSARD

and build hope both amongst ourselves and our people. This is what we have been trying to do over the past few months, building on previous initiatives but with a greater sense of collective urgency.

On 9 February 2016, the President mandated Mr Jabu Mabuza, the president of the Business Unity South Africa, Busa, and the Minister of Finance to continue to work with business and labour and find areas of collective action.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Point of order. Deputy Speaker, I'm not sure if the ANC members are staging a walkout, but could you please ask them not to disrupt the Minister while he is speaking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. Go ahead, hon Minister.

Mr M M WATERS: I'm sorry to interrupt the Minister. The hon Minister of Small Business Development has told the members over here to shut up, and previously the word shut up has been ruled to be unparliamentarily. I am asking you to ask her to withdraw the word shut up.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, did you say that?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I did.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: May you please withdraw!

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I withdraw, but they are not our principals. White supremacy is not in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, don’t put conditions on it. Hon members, let us proceed. We should not put conditions on withdrawals.

Mr M M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, the hon Minister withdrew conditionally, and not unconditionally, and when members do that you normally ask them to withdraw unconditionally. Could you please do so to the hon Minister? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please proceed. I will deal with this matter later.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There are many sceptics and doomsayers ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Mr M M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Speaker!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Can I appeal to all sides.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Waters, please, give me a chance; give me a chance I will come back to this matter. Minister, please proceed. I will come back now, please take your seat.

Mr M M WATERS: With all due respect, ask the Minister to withdraw unconditionally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, take your seat. No, take your seat I will come back now don't instruct me.

Mr M M WATERS: Are there different laws for the opposition and the ANC?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, please, take it easy I'm coming back to this matter. Please, go ahead, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There are many sceptics and doomsayers. But we can't let them determine our collective fate. Regenerating confidence through concrete actions by all however small at this stage, to avoid an immediate ratings downgrade and

UNREVISED HANSARD

establishing common projects with concrete outcomes which benefit all sections of our people, is the key to future success. We have begun this conversation amongst all of us. In the past few months, the growth challenge and our transformation agenda have brought government, business and labour leaders together. We have begun to create a new narrative of support for new enterprises, of revitalising agriculture and other sectors of the economy, of investing in our cities and of private sector participation and collaboration in our state-owned companies.

But the conversations are just a beginning. There is still hard work to come and to be done. The work and the struggle to get things done will require strong leadership and a collaborative spirit both in this House and out there in our society.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the reality is that the economy is not generating enough jobs. Without employment creation, it is very hard to reduce poverty. In the National Development Plan we set ourselves an inspirational growth target of 5,4 % a year. We set ourselves an ambitious target because we appreciate the primacy of inclusive growth in helping us to expand work opportunities for the millions of our citizens. For growth to be inclusive, it must create jobs. It must generate hundreds of thousands of small and medium enterprises. This has very practical

UNREVISED HANSARD

implications. But our growth also has to be sustainable taking account of, for example, climate change.

There are very basic economic trends and vulnerabilities that we have to attend to. The need for greater investment, employment creation, a sustainable budget deficit, building plans being completed and processed by municipalities, industrial productivity and competitiveness are but some of the measures which the Interministerial Committee, IMC, on investment chaired by the President is monitoring.

Our responses cannot be business as usual. Since the beginning of the year as tasked by the President, government, business and labour have been working together intensively to help strengthen short-term confidence and reinforce long-term growth. We have been focusing on three key areas, namely, restoring confidence and boosting investment by local and international investors; unblocking obstacles to faster employment growth in key sectors of our economy; and identifying fiscal and regulatory reforms and strengthening state-owned companies.

The results of this partnership already in these past few months include the following. We have adopted a clear fiscal consolidation path in our budget to avoid the burden of debt

UNREVISED HANSARD

that might cripple investment flows and government spending capacity. Together with business and labour, the government, after the Budget in February, embarked on a foreign investor road show to present a united message to the world that South Africa is embarking on necessary economic reforms and, as we say, is open for business. The team met the rating agencies as part of these road shows. Moodys' subsequently visited the country in March for a rating review. We had further discussions with the rating agencies in April on the sidelines of the spring meetings of the International Monetary Fund, IMF, and the World Bank in Washington. Since then Moody's decided to leave our rating level unchanged which is a major success at this point in time. In their statement they indicated that South Africa is likely approaching a turning point after several years of falling growth, as supply side shocks recede. They have also said that the 2016-17 Budget and medium term fiscal plan, will likely stabilise and eventually reduce the general government debt metrics. It further said that the recent political developments, while disruptive, testify to the underlying strengths of South Africa's institutions

Two other rating agencies, Standard and Poors and Fitch, engaged us and many others over the past week with Standard and Poors, S&P, also visiting businesses and other stakeholders. We will

UNREVISED HANSARD

receive feedback from these two agencies sometimes in the next 10 days. Beyond the June date, the next round of reviews will be in December this year. We will have to work harder to demonstrate even more concrete outcomes by the time of the December reviews of our rating position.

We can also report that as a result of our collective efforts, a small and medium enterprise fund is being established by the private sector with over R1 billion already committed and complemented by mentoring by seasoned business leaders for start ups business people. The task team has looked at various sectors that carry potential for faster economic growth and employment, and amongst these are tourism and agriculture that have been identified as potential quick wins which my colleague, Minister Henekom will address.

With regards to infrastructure and state-owned companies, options for coinvestment are being explored to leverage the strengths of the private sector both in terms of their expertise and balance sheets. This is a process that is working under our Deputy President.

Hon members, this work cannot stand on its own. These efforts by the private sector leverage and complement ongoing reforms that

UNREVISED HANSARD

we are undertaking as part of the National Development Plan and the nine-point plan of government. As I indicated the Deputy President is leading the work to reform state-owned companies. The IMC, under his leadership, is progressing development of a framework for private sector participation and principles for the disposal of nonstrategic assets, but also for good governance and financial management.

Under the leadership of the Minister of Environmental Affairs, which Minister Nkwinti will address, great initiatives are in progress in growing the oceans economy and expanding employment associated with environmental sustainability. The Ministry of Trade and Industry is broadening its efforts to support and grow the local manufacturing base. Recent announcement of expansions by Toyota build on similar investments by BMW, Mercedez Benz, Ford and other manufacturers. The Ministry of Science and Technology is leading in development of fuel cells, bioeconomy, fluorochemicals and titanium powder which the Minister will address later in this debate. The Ministry of Energy is also not only resolving our current energy crisis, but has made South Africa a global leader in renewable energy in partnership with the private sector. The Ministry of Agriculture is also doing similar work. Under the leadership of the Minister of Rural

UNREVISED HANSARD

Development and Land Reform and Economic Development, we are preparing a further infrastructure package to boost growth.

In essence, our message is that it is absolutely important for government, business and labour to collaborate. It is through this kind of collaboration that we will undertake the economic transformation that we need in our country and society; transformation that will create sustainable economic growth and create decent work for all South Africa; encourage black economic advancement and overcoming the racial divisions in our society; eliminate poverty and create dignity for all; and broaden participation and democratising ownership and control of the economy. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Maynier, before you proceed, [Applause.] [Interjections.] Please take your seat hon Maynier, please take your seat. Hon Minister of Small Business, [Development] please withdraw unconditionally as I had requested you to do. Please do so, unconditionally.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Deputy Speaker, what is unconditionally?

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just withdraw.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: But what is unconditionally?

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just withdraw without making any additional remarks about your withdrawal that is all we are asking for.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: I withdraw.

DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, proceed hon member.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Deputy Speaker, we are in an economic death zone: economic growth has been revised down to 0.6%; unemployment has been revised up to 8,9 million and we are hurtling – as the Minister said – towards a ratings downgrade in South Africa. We have a staggering 8,9 million people, many of them young people, who do not have jobs, or have given up looking for jobs and who live without dignity, without independence and without freedom in South Africa. And a ratings downgrade will, according to one leading economist, trigger a recession; put 200 000 more jobs at risk and put 600 000 dependants at risk in South Africa.

So let's be clear, a ratings downgrade will be a disaster for South Africa. It will affect everybody and it will spare nobody

UNREVISED HANSARD

in South Africa and that is why all of us - including government and opposition, business and labour - want to avoid a ratings downgrade in South Africa. Now, the Minister of Finance has done his best to build a common narrative – as he has pointed out - and to bring government, business and labour together so there is collective action to avoid a ratings downgrade in South Africa. But, of course the Minister's efforts have been derailed, not by business and not by labour but by government itself and by the ruling party. What President Jacob Zuma and the rent seekers, who support him, have done is make a ratings downgrade more likely by launching an all-out political assault on the Finance Minister, deliberately aimed at generating newspaper headlines screaming for example: *Pravin arrest shock*. And assurances from Hawks boss, Berning Ntlemeza, and National Prosecuting [Authority], NPA, boss, Shaun Abrahams, that the Finance Minister will not be arrested, are in fact not assurances at all.

Listen carefully what Berning Ntlemeza actually said was that the Finance Minister had nothing to fear, "at this stage" and what Shaun Abrahams actually said was that the Finance Minister would not be charged with espionage. What Shaun Abrahams is actually saying is that an ongoing investigation is being conducted into the SA Revenue Service, SARS, rogue unit and if

UNREVISED HANSARD

charges are preferred— including charges against the Finance Minister — he will make the final decision. What President Jacob Zuma and the rent seekers who support him have done is make a ratings downgrade more likely by launching an all-out political assault on the National Treasury. First, you have the leaks of so—called intelligence dossiers, including the intelligence dossier, bizarrely named: “Project Spider Web". And then, for example, you have the Minister of Small Business Development, who first attacked big business for plotting a coup against President Jacob Zuma and then attacks the National Treasury for “being like like England” whatever that means. So, now that the Defence Minister is evidently in the business of smuggling people into South Africa, perhaps she will consider smuggling the hon Lindiwe Zulu out of South Africa. [Applause.]

What President Jacob Zuma and the rent seekers, who support him, have done is to make a ratings downgrade more likely by suggesting that Brian Molefe is the Minister of Finance designate and that the hon Sfiso Buthelezi is the Deputy Minister of Finance designate. And, of course, it comes as no surprise to us that yesterday Brian Molefe described the Guptas as “friendly and likable people" and claimed there was “no evidence of wrongdoing" arose against them and that, despite the Deputy Minister of Finance making a public statement revealing

UNREVISED HANSARD

that the Guptas were peddling Cabinet posts. What President Jacob Zuma, and the rent seekers, who support him have done is to make a ratings downgrade more likely by containing and strangling and grinding down and apparently eventually replacing the Finance Minister, so that they can get their hands on the "cookie jar" at National Treasury. And they have done so because even President Jacob Zuma, and the rent seekers, who support him know they cannot fire the Minister of Finance because they risk another 9-12, wiping billions of rands of savings from South Africa. The fact is that there has been very little collective about the collective action to avoid a ratings downgrade of South Africa and no wonder investor confidence is so low.

So, when we look back we know who is making a ratings downgrade more likely in South Africa. It is not the result of an economic slowdown in China, collapsing commodity prices or volatile international markets. And it is not the result of a destabilisation campaign by external forces, acting in concert with the International Monetary Fund, IMF, and the World Bank, to serve the interests of the West, as the spooks would have us believe. It is the result of President Jacob Zuma and the rent seekers, who support him.

UNREVISED HANSARD

One man, who will stop at nothing to gain control of National Treasury, even if it means making a downgrade more likely in South Africa. One man, who will stop at nothing to gain control of National Treasury, even if it means triggering a recession; putting 200 000 more jobs at risk; and putting 600 000 more dependants at risk in South Africa. In the end, we have to be careful, South Africa's politics is inspired by Russia and South Africa's economics is inspired by China and so if we continue like this we may just end up like Venezuela. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Ngithokoza kakhulu, Sekela Somlomo. [Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.]

We are holding this debate against a background of very difficult times for our country with the economy struggling on one hand and there is here political bullying of a special kind on the other hand. That has been said in the build up to this debate Mister Minister and a lot is in the media about what is happening and so on and so forth. The principle is Mister Minister, you are not above the law and where there should be an investigation that investigation must be done, we must uphold that principle. But what we cannot allow is that your prosecution is one of a political nature, driven to further the

UNREVISED HANSARD

political agenda and so you have our support in doing that which is right and a wise man once said you can never be wrong for doing the right thing. So, continue that but lets us not lose sight of the fact that we must separate that which is about South Africa. The law must remain the law and if there is misconduct on your part, you must be investigated for that. You must not cloud issues but it is evident here that there is a campaign – it is clear for anybody to see – because you are not the desired candidate any way to be a Minister in December.

You came in to rescue the situation which had gone horribly wrong and therefore what is going on now is a continuation of the fact that, that agenda has not been completed to ensure that certain people must be in Treasury. So, all of us here, in this House, are concerned about what is going on. Nine million people are out of jobs, the economy is not going to grow anything more 1% and it requires all of us to be politically sober and to put the country first.

IsiZulu sithi: "Ake uhambe uhambe uzinuke amakhwapha." [There is a Zulu saying that goes like: "You must do introspection now and again."]

UNREVISED HANSARD

We are quick at pointing fingers at everybody out there in the world, ...

... kodwa inkinga ila eNdlini.

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Batshele ... batshele.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Inkinga nje ila eNdlini, inkinga inathi la eNdlini. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[... but the problem is here in the House.

AN HON MEMBER: Tell them ... tell them.

Mr N HLENGWA: The problem is here in the House, the problem is with us in the House.]

We cannot inspire hope and confidence even when this Parliament is chaotic. What is the world saying, the rating agencies? – Even this House which is supposed to carry on its shoulders that which is correct for our people, that which is right. So before ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

... siphume la sihamba sikhomba abantu asiqale silunge thina la eNdlini. [... we go out there and start pointing fingers at others, let us get our House in order first.]

Let us get our House in order, all of us on both sides of the House so that at the very list our people can enjoy the confidence that the lawmakers and legislators are putting their interests first. This is about the people it is not about anybody else. All of you here – including me – have got comfortable jobs. On the 15th you get paid but there are people who just don't have that luxury and they require us here to be disciplined. So, let that discipline begins with all of us in ensuring that we get things right for the sake of our people whose lives on a daily basis is a virtual struggle. Let us take them out of that struggle; surely, they did not struggle so that they could struggle in a democratic and free South Africa. [Time expired.] Let us go back to basics and those basics are asked here in this House behaving.

Ubofaka uchatha Sihlalo, isikhathi uyasazi sihlale sisincane, Ngiyabonga. [You must add more time, Chairperson, you know that the time is never enough. Thank you.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Mr N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson and hon members, our view is that this topic is very wide ranging and should perhaps have been trimmed and more defined.

But, there are issues of national importance upon which we can agree. We can talk politics, but I believe we should make a concerted effort as a country and as a government to ensure that we fight united as civil society and as the private sector to ensure that our country does not run to a downgrade. We should make sure that there is economic development in our country, and ensure that we fight landlessness, acute poverty, soaring unemployment and squalid living conditions. These things, together with rampant crime, corruption and violent service delivery protests should be the focus of our deliberations.

While the NFP acknowledges that industrial action is at some times legal, we are against any destruction of property. We need infrastructure. While that infrastructure was there before 1994, after 1994 we don’t believe that we need to destroy the infrastructure that we dearly need.

The National Freedom Party declares itself boldly in support of any proactive programs or processes which will ensure inclusive

UNREVISED HANSARD

growth for all our people, be it social, economic or political, and we urge all other parties represented here to do the same.

However, if we want to declare ourselves willing to participate in any collective action of such a nature, we have to start in this august House, for we are here as leaders and representatives of the people. If we cannot convey a united front here on matters of public importance that could give rise to inclusive growth, then how can expect people at grassroots level to buy into the concept? We should do more than pay mere lip-service to noble ideas while indulging in the luxury of sweetheart debates. We must be seen to lead from the front because, ultimately, actions speak louder than words.

Inclusive growth is a very wide-ranging term that needs to be defined more clearly. We assume that the major thrust of the debate is that of economic growth. Unemployment has risen. More than 8,9 million people are unemployed in our country, and unemployment affects most of our youth. The majority of our people languishing in the daily grind of poverty today are previously disadvantaged black people who had historically been dispossessed of their land and relegated to second-class citizenship to live in the so-called bantustans.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Today, our political power has been restored and we are masters of our destiny. Yet, the cycle of poverty has not been broken but is instead accelerating. The rate of our economic growth is slowing down, and our youth are fast losing hope of the brighter future which had been promised to them in 1994. The need for collective action is here and now; that much is evident. The question is what form it should take.

It must begin at local government level and the NFP is prepared to lead as we set an example in the municipalities that we lead at local and district level. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Chairperson, the question that confronts us all is whether we can, as the Parliament of South Africa, act together in order to address the challenges that confront our country. The question is not whether we can jig at the podium and point fingers at the ANC. It is, are we ready? Are we as Member of Parliament prepared for the necessary collective action which will allow us to present a picture to the world of the unity and cohesion in our country that is able to advance common goals? That is what confronts us today. That is the issue that the Minister of Finance has asked us to attend to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

We do work very closely together as members of government in co-ordinated responses to the programmes that have been adopted by our Cabinet and our government. We also work very closely together on the priorities that Minister Gordhan referred to which have been set out in various state of the nation addresses by President Jacob Zuma.

Government has recognised that research-led innovation has immense potential to support job creation, new company formation and economic growth. We are strengthening our efforts in this regard. We are working with science councils, universities and the private sector to ensure effective implementation of our research, development and innovation strategy and its contribution to South Africa's growth. In fact, during their visit to South Africa, this was one of the areas to which Moody's paid particular attention.

I set out a few examples that contribute to government's 9-point plan and to the vision of the National Development Plan, NDP, that innovation would proliferate economic and development activity in South Africa.

Over the past four years, the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR's, R300 million Technology

UNREVISED HANSARD

Localisation Programme has assisted over 140 manufacturing companies. An example of the success of this programme is the R6,3 million Casting Simulation Network that was launched last year at the Vaal University of Technology. The majority of South African foundries are small and medium-sized enterprises, which are often family-owned businesses that cannot afford simulation software.

The CSIR's R500 million Industry Innovation Partnerhip, which is part of Treasury's economic competitiveness programme, supports the private sector in investing more in research and development. This includes investment in satellite manufacturing, titanium powder development, information communication technology innovation, and nanotechnology development.

The new Nanomaterials Industrial Development Facility provides the capabilities for the industrial-scale production of nanostructures and nano-applications required for industrial testing.

Recently, through the Industry Innovation Partnership we also ensured that we strengthen strategic partnerships with small, medium and micro enterprises for biotechnology SMMEs to benefit

UNREVISED HANSARD

from the recently launched R90 million bio-manufacturing facilities at the CSIR.

Scientists and engineers from CSIR ensure that the products meet the needs of the market. Examples of products developed thus far are cosmetics incorporating natural extracts, magnetic microsphere technology used in life science applications, extracts from olives that are used in cosmetics and nutraceuticals, and various nutritional products that are now on the commercial shelves in South Africa and supermarkets throughout the world.

We also have the Square Kilometer Array, SKA, which is a sterling example of the value of global science partnerships. The SKA is a €1 billion collaboration between South Africa and Australia to build the world's largest radio telescope.

Ten member countries are the cornerstone of the SKA, but we have over 100 organisations across about 20 countries participating in the design and development of the SKA. Leading scientists and engineers throughout the world are designing and developing a system that will ensure that we have supercomputers faster than any in existence today.

UNREVISED HANSARD

We are also very thrilled that the R630 million tender for the manufacture of the 64-dish MeerKAT antennae which was awarded in 2014 went to Stratosat Datacom, a South African company, in a joint venture with US firm General Dynamics SATCOM Technologies. Seventy-five per cent of the contract value will be spent in South Africa, including qualification testing, tooling design, and virtually all of the manufacturing, resulting in benefits and opportunities for our local technology industry.

In 2015, we were thrilled when the Max Planck Institute for Radio Astronomy in Bonn, Germany, invested €11 million in building new sets of radio receivers in South Africa, which will be deployed on the MeerKAT antennae.

SKA SA and NMC Civils announced last month that they have partnered with Absa in a R34,6 million enterprise and supply-chain initiative to develop and support SMMEs in the Northern Cape through the SKA programme. This involves building the road between Carnarvon and the SKA Losberg construction site.

We believe that international investment in science and technology is an important area for us to pursue, and that it will have immense benefits for job creation in our country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

We are doing a lot of work to encourage international companies to establish their research and development facilities in South Africa. We are seeing positive results through such investment. Thank you. We will support the Minister of Finance in insuring that we are not downgraded. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, there is a clear verifiable evidence that poor policy choices, mismanagement, corruption and lack of visionary and imaginative and interventions have negatively affected our economic inclusive growth. As a direct consequence, massive poverty, sky rocketing unemployment, especially among black youth, widening inequality as well as shrinking economic productivity have become defining features of our economy.

The reality is that this country is fast becoming more of a welfare state than a developmental state with the swelling number of dependents on state provided socials security with no growing entrepreneurship. All this happens against the backdrop of an escalating cost of living which puts greater squeeze of economic hardship on the average citizen.

The ruling party is really an enemy of inclusive growth and quality service delivery because financial incompetence,

UNREVISED HANSARD

mismanagement, year in and year out, as well as unauthorised and wasteful expenditure are common place. On top of it, last year the Department of Water and Sanitation under spent by a whopping R2 billion. This means the right to water was never enjoyed by many citizens. Many national and provincial departments are still failing to pay their dues to municipalities. This figure stands at over R3 billion now. How can municipalities develop anyone with no money in their pockets?

The right to have access to adequate housing is blocked by insufficient provision of land for integrated human settlement. In many instances, decisions on matters such as demarcations are forced down the throats of the people with no consultation thus resulting in lawlessness. There can be no progress in such an environment. This House is the regular uninvited guests of the courts of this land because it has been turned into a caucus of a clique within the ruling party with absolutely no regard for the rule of law which is a pinnacle of our constitutional democracy. The UDM came up with solutions for inclusive growth to place.

I-UDM ithi malulawulwe kakuhle uhlahlo-lwabiwo-mali ukwenzela ukuba abantu bayifumane imisebenzi. Makubekho uhlolo (checks and balances) ukwenzela ukuba umntu akhawuleze abhaqwe xa onile.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Uphuhliso lweziseko ezingundoqo mazicwangciswe kakuhle, kungenziwa nje uphela sonwabe. Amashishini asakhasaya mawanikwe inkxaso emandla nophuhliso lwawo lukhawuleziswe ukwenzela ukuba oosomashishini abasakhasayo ibe ngabo abanceda abantu ukuba baqesheke. Zonke izinto ezinqanda ukuba abantu bangaphumeleli mazisuswe endleleni, ingakumbi kweli cala loomama. Yonke imiqobo esendleleni (red tape) kuphuhliso lokushishina kolutsha mayisuswe endleleni. Masibeke umnwe kwicala lezolimo ukuba urhulumente ancedise. Ewe siyavuma ukuba isebe liyazama kulo mba njengokuba sithetha.

Okokugqibela, siyi-UDM sicebisa ukuba abantu abakhubazekileyo emzimbeni mabancediswe. Mhla i-UDM yalawula kuloo masipala uthile kuya kubakho uxolo. Enkosi. (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows*.)

[The UDM says that the Budget Vote must be properly maintained so that people can get employment. There must be checks and balances in place so that a person can be quickly discovered when he or she breaks the law. The development of the infrastructure must be planned accordingly, it must not just be a by the way. Small businesses must be given a lot of support and their development must be done speedily so that small business owners are able to employ people. Things that causes

UNREVISED HANSARD

people to be unsuccessful must be removed, especially in respect of women. All the red tape in respect of the development of youth businesses must be removed. Let us concentrate on agriculture, so that the government can help. Yes we agree that the department is trying in respect of this matter.

Lastly, as the UDM we advise that disabled people should be assisted. The day the UDM governs a certain municipality, there will be peace. Thank you.]

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Chairperson, Hon members, I don't need to repeat what has already been said in this debate - our economy is not growing the way it should and the way we know it can. We are painfully aware of this, and we are collectively determined to turn this situation around. We are working hard with all our social partners to get back on to a healthy and sustainable growth path and we will succeed.

In the tourism sector we are working closely with the industry to recover from last year’s decline in tourist arrivals, and to improve tourism’s contribution to the economy, and to help tackle the triple challenge of poverty, inequality and unemployment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

This year has started extremely well for tourism in our country. We experienced an unprecedented surge in international tourist arrivals in the first quarter of 2016. Year-on-year growth was a staggering 18,7%, compared to the first three months of last year.

Tourism across its extensive value chain contributed no less than R375 billion to our economy last year, representing about 9,4% of GDP. If we include indirect and induced jobs, over 1,5 million people are employed in the sector, representing almost 10% of all employment.

Globally, travel and tourism have proved to be far more resilient than other sectors in times of economic turbulence. Internationally, tourism grew by 4,4% in 2015, reaching a record level of 1,2 billion tourists travelling abroad. That is what was recorded in 2015.

Right now, in our country, tourism is one of the best performing sectors in our economy. We have strong competitive advantage in tourism, the exchange rate is in our favour and the global growth in outbound tourism that I have just referred to, present us with a magnificent window of opportunity.

UNREVISED HANSARD

However, the realization of this growth potential does not just happen because conditions are favourable – we have to work together to make it happen. The Department of Tourism, together with SA Tourism is pursuing several initiatives to strengthen our international marketing drive, to enhance our destination, and improve the visitor experience by developing the skills of our people. We are also determined to achieve meaningful transformation in the sector. We are working closely with industry to achieve these goals.

SA Tourism is developing a counter-seasonal marketing strategy with industry to promote tourism throughout the year. They are also jointly working on strategies to more effectively target untapped segments in key source markets, while exploring new investments in emerging markets with high potential, like China and India.

Hon members, we are not paying lip service to working with our industry partners. We have had two very productive meetings recently, with senior Chief Executive Officers of industry together with Treasury officials. This is not a public relations exercise - joint working groups have been established to find new and innovative ways to capitalise on the immense

UNREVISED HANSARD

opportunities to grow our sector and create more jobs and life-changing opportunities for our people.

This engagement has already resulted in the creation of a collaborative fund to support our bids for international conferences, meetings and events. This is an immensely important component of tourism and we are becoming increasingly competitive in this area.

The success of tourism depends on collaboration and co-operation. A whole of government approach is key to maintaining South Africa's status as a competitive and attractive tourism destination. The main player in the tourism and hospitality sector remains the private sector. That is common knowledge. Less known though, is that the largest single provider of bed nights in South Africa is actually SanParks.

Wildlife and our natural heritage remains a huge attractor to our country. The successful management and conservation of our natural resources is critically important to sustainable tourism growth. Our collaboration with the Department of Environmental Affairs is therefore very important to us.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Cultural and heritage experiences feature increasingly prominently in tourism packages. Our unique world heritage sites further make up the tourism offering which differentiates South Africa from other tourism destinations. We are working closely with the Department of Arts and Culture to find creative ways of enhancing this important component of our diverse tourism offer.

To get more people to visit South Africa, we have to work with our sister departments to remove all unnecessary barriers that could discourage travel to our country. We are working with the Department of Home Affairs to facilitate ease of travel to our country. All international evidence points to the immediate positive effects of the relaxation of visa requirements and the streamlining of visa issuance.

The work of the Department of Transport in improving air connectivity is immensely important to tourism growth. Improved air connectivity, especially with countries on our continent, means greater competitiveness and will certainly translate into more tourism arrivals.

We have devised a program to support, Minister Zulu, emerging tourism businesses, in collaboration with the Department of Small Business Development, to help them achieve success.

UNREVISED HANSARD

These are just a few examples of collaboration with our sister departments. Of course, every department plays a role in maintaining conditions under which tourism thrives. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs has a special role. Tourism happens on the ground, in local communities, and alignment between all three spheres of government is essential for success.

Developing our domestic tourism market offers additional potential for growth on a massive scale. We want South Africans to experience our amazing country and all that it offers. A thriving domestic tourism sector will help to extend tourism activities throughout the year, and spread the benefits to all regions of our country.

SA Tourism has been allocated R110 million to promote domestic tourism this year. We must make domestic tourism more affordable and more accessible for all our people, and we are working with industry to achieve this goal. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr L R MBINDA: The PAC appreciates this opportunity to tackle such a critical matter. This matter of vital importance is an

UNREVISED HANSARD

opportunity to dispel the distorted truth about the economic solutions.

Let us be forthright, the PAC does not see the stagnation of economic growth as a national crisis. We see it as a crisis of capitalism and its Ponzi scheme structure. The growth with value addition is nothing but a Ponzi scheme. Growth that only results in dividends for foreign investors is nothing but a glorified Ponzi scheme. Growth that is concentrated and consolidates higher interest for banks is nothing but a Ponzi scheme.

The PAC has no interest to build a collective action for any Ponzi scheme. The PAC is not interested in the kind of growth that we witnessed during the era of the Growth, Employment and Redistribution, GEAR, policy.

Without fear of contradiction, the PAC is interested in being part of building collective action for inclusive growth. Inclusive growth can only come from changing the relationship between citizens and means of production. The spread of ownership and control of production vehicles the more inclusive our economy will become.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Chair, the more workers having controlling shares in companies the more inclusive is this economy will be. Hence, the PAC calls for 26% ownership of all private companies with a turnover of more than R10 million for more than 50 employees to have a worker share scheme. Furthermore, all companies should cede a further 25% to communities where it operates.

These actions will guarantee inclusiveness of the economy. This inclusiveness will guarantee growth as well as wealth and income being distributed. The great economic distribution and fewer monopolies will result in greater circulation of money and economic growth. Monopolies stifle growth and artificially generate inflation through price manipulation and Ponzi scheme.

Thanks for coming hon Oliphant. CTC is Ciskei Transport Corporation which was under the Ciskei government. Mbinda never worked for CTC, he worked for Mercedes Benz during that time. Ciskei government was taken over by your government and your government must pay the employees the money that is due to them.

Mbinda was the CEO for Mayibuye Transport Corporation, he could have not taken the pensions of the MTC employees and give them to CTC [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

I give you benefit of doubt; you were misled by hon [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Hon chair, I'm going to deal with two things: infrastructure and oceans economy.

South Africa's potential in terms of the oceans economy ranges between R129 billion to R177 billion. With potential jobs of between 800 000 and 1 million by 2030 as compared to the current contribution of R54 billion and 316 000 jobs, that's by the baseline of 2010.

In terms of our envisaged economic growth by 2019, in other words our aspirations, we look at increasing the contribution of the oceans economy to the GDP of our country by R26 billion; to create 65 000 jobs by 2019 and ensure sustainability to ocean management and development.

There are three main sectors in this regard: marine transport and manufacturing, offshore oil and gas exploration, and aquaculture.

UNREVISED HANSARD

In terms of these economic sectors, in marine transport and manufacturing, we envisage that the contribution to grow to GDP will increase from R7 billion to between R14 billion and R23 billion by 2019; creating between 40 000 and 50 000 jobs, jumping off 6 000 at present; and with the contribution of market share of 30% to South African companies

With regard to offshore oil and gas exploration - through this ocean economy - we will promote exploration in order to drill 30 exploration wells in the next 10 years.

With regard to aquaculture - which is a very important subsector of this oceans economy, particularly between the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, DAFF, and the Department of Environmental Affairs – we envisage that the GDP contribution will jump from R0,7 billion to R3 billion; and jobs created will increase from 2 227 to about 15 000. That speaks to inclusive growth.

The enablers in this regard are the following: Marine Protection Services – you heard from Minister Zokwana talking about some boats which were fishing in the ocean along the eastern seaboard of our country recently – and Ocean Governance, Skills and Capacity Development, Research, Technology and Innovation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

The opportunities which will be created here, particularly for the SMMEs, Cooperatives, Township and Rural Enterprises, are very, very important for us.

With regard to infrastructure, in February this year, Cabinet Lekgotla identified the following sectors to build infrastructure: water, energy, transport logistics, health and education. This is very important because Cabinet looked at that and decided to add telecommunications, innovations and technology.

Currently, the Presidential Infrastructure Coordinating Commission and the National Treasury are developing a mechanism to boost the implementation capacity of the state and they're designing a public-private funding model. These processes should be concluded during the next Cabinet cycle.

Hon Chair, I'm done with those two. I just want to make few comments about the general statement which has been made by the Minister of Finance. I've been sitting there wondering, are we all South Africans? I understand that opposition parties are there and are there to come up with alternative policies, not to just oppose, come up with alternatives.

UNREVISED HANSARD

What is the alternative policy perspective of the DA? They come here; they attack President Zuma, that's all they know. President Zuma must go. President Zuma is the President of the ANC and through the ANC he's the President of the Republic of South Africa. Until the electorate of South Africa change that, it's going to remain.

Secondly, Chair, the DA hardly speaks about – and tell South Africans – what is the alternative economic policy, except telling us about equal opportunities etc?

Hon Chair, let me give you an example, you remember there is Malamala Game Reserve? ... [Interjection.]

Exactly, that's the point. You don't want it because the reason it's taking billion rands it's because it bought land for Africans. Yesterday, by the way, last Friday the first board of the new company ... [Interjection.] ... he's worried

Mr G G HILL—LEWIS: Will the Minister take a question on the billion rand?

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: No. On Friday, the first board meeting took place at Malamala. You know

UNREVISED HANSARD

what, when you talk about Malamala you are talking about 969 households, eight villages, 5 630 beneficiaries and the rent has meant much to those communities, R400 000 per month not per year. That is growth through redistribution. They don't like it. They want growth which is a trickledown methodology, that's what they want. So that forever ... For many, many years, this generation has always wished that when they die ...

... abantwana babo basale befumana uthontsi thontsi. NgoMgqibele besiseKruger National Park, iintsapho zaphaya ngoku ngabanini-zabelo bakwaKruger National Park. *(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)*

[... their children should receive small amounts of money monthly. Last Saturday we were at the Kruger National Park; the families there are now shareholders of the Kruger National Park.]

That has never been done in this country. Sorry for that and it is dependent on foreign tourism. Sorry for you guys, come back to reality. [Interjections.] Welcome to South Africa. [Interjections.] I wish you gave them t-shirts yesterday [Interjections.] so that we see if they're Africans [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

Hon Mulder said, he speaks Afrikaans [Interjections.] the only language in the world [Interjections.] I wish I was given a t-shirt. [Time expired.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: House Chairperson, it is truly incredible that the ANC would choose to close this term just before an election on what is surely their weakest card. What an own goal! Typified perfectly by Minister Nkwinti who is now feeling very pleased with himself getting handshakes from all of his colleagues. But what he doesn't tell you is let's talk about the ocean economy, Minister Nkwinti. It is your government under Operation Phakisa that has delayed the Durban dug-out ports from this year to 2020! How is that for speeding up the ocean economies, quick fast results?

Let us talk about land reform, Minister Nkwinti, [Interjections.] I will wait for you to listen – no problem. In every single province that you run, Minister Nkwinti, 80% to 90% of land reform projects are failures, just like the billion rand that you paid to Mr Rattray, who will still manage that farm for the next 30 years, how is that for empowerment? Compared to where the DA governs where 60% to 80% of projects are successful [Interjections.] ... exactly the mood image of your track-record, Minister.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Now, our economy has shed 350 000 jobs in the first three months of this year alone. And one thing is certain. These trends will get much worse if our economy gets downgraded to junk status next Friday. It will take years to regain our investment grade.

The quickest ever has been South Korea, which took 2 years; the worse was India, which took 16 years and we don't want to ever get to that.

That is why we must do everything possible in the days ahead to prove to the ratings agencies that we are serious about reform. And it will not be sufficient, Minister to merely trumpet an improved working relationship between business and government and a nice venture capital fund. Those are both good things, but they cannot possibly replace the need for meaningful, deep-rooted reform in our economy.

You have had more than enough time to prepare for this, Minister Gordhan. We received our first rating downgrade in 2012, when we were still A3 rated. Now we are BBB- rated, and on the cusp of junk status.

Everyone has seen this coming, like watching a train wreck in slow motion, and yet the ANC has done precious little to change

UNREVISED HANSARD

course. Even now, days before we may receive our harshest rebuke yet, you present us with nothing but sophistry - a 'PR' play, nothing substantial, no real reform.

The truth is that in the fight to save our economy, Minister Gordhan, the ANC and you have been AWOL. Worse than that, the only war the ANC seems to be involved in is an all out war against you. Evidence today by the walkout of your own caucus during your speech; and evidence by Minister Zulu's comment last week that you were behaving like England - whatever that means.

Once again, we have heard the excuse from you today that none of this is our fault; it can all be blamed on global headwinds. Well, that is a lie, nothing but a lie, and we will not let it go unchallenged. If we are downgraded next week, and I sincerely hope we will not, then it will be because of the decisions you have made. [Interjections.]

It is no one else's fault that you have continued to prop up expensive, corrupt, loss-making state enterprises. That is on you. It is not the global economy that has frightened off investment with crippling policy uncertainty – that was you! It was you who allowed us to fall from 32nd to 75th in global

UNREVISED HANSARD

competitiveness rankings. It was you who destroyed tourism with visa regulations.

Load shedding was you. You have given safe haven to a corrupt President. You have cancelled manufacturing incentives. You have let the President and the state to be captured by parasitic rent-seekers – all you.

All of these things are on you, and it is an insult to argue otherwise, everyone saw this coming, and you've been AWOL. And all this while, we've been the ones leading the fight to avoid a downgrade.

Wherever the DA governs, the economy is growing faster and unemployment is much, much lower. [Applause.] In 2015, while the economy grew at just 1,3%, where the DA governed, the economy grew at 2,3%. [Applause.] That difference translates into unemployment numbers: the lowest unemployment in the country is where we govern. And most importantly, the lowest proportion of people who have given up looking for work.

Every person knows even if they are unemployed in the DA government, they can be hopeful that they will find work in a growing economy with a clean government that doesn't steal their

UNREVISED HANSARD

money. In fact, this is amazing even as unemployment has skyrocketed in the past three months; it is still going down where the DA governs. That Minister Nkwinti is the alternative; you just need to look at the results. [Applause.]

In Gauteng, 160 000 people have been unemployed for three months. Shame on you! That terrible reality captures the choice in this election. Our message to those people is; don’t stay at home on Election Day. In Tshwane, in Johannesburg, even at Ekurhuleni, vote for the only party that is actually fighting to save this economy. And actually fighting to save your job! Vote for the DA. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: House Chairperson, hon members, we asked for this debate today so that South Africans can actually judge for themselves where the new substantial ideas are for the future coming from; where are the tactical progresses being made; where are people ... [Interjections.] ... this side did not even talk about the local government elections. We know where we will go with the local government elections. The only pre-occupation on this side is local government elections.

So, let me reiterate what I said earlier on, that 2016 and maybe even 2017 will be tough both globally and internally. Unlike hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

Hill Lewis we never deny the fact that we have our own structural difficulties in South Africa but, at the same time, we constantly grapple with solutions not the rhetoric that we have been hearing for the past - I don't know for how long.

Secondly, we are aware that our future depends upon building common purpose amongst all South Africans, and what we see today, ladies and gentlemen, is the inability of the other side to find the maturity and good sense, and perhaps, even the intellect to actually find common purpose on a national interest issue. They don't know what the national interest means. [Applause.] They only know what party interest means. South Africans will see that and will judge them on that basis. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: What we have been working on for the past five months and beyond – that is what they constantly howl rather than listen and debate. They have minutes at this podium they produce no substantial ideas. Nothing! Nothing that South Africans can take back and say they have hope in the future. But we will continue build common purpose. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Don’t scream hon members! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chair, are we going to carry on like this?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Hon members, I think yesterday the Deputy Speaker made a ruling towards this issue of screaming at the member. So, please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Let me comeback, we are interested in building a commonness of purpose in the national interest so that we in fact don’t get downgraded and we have evidence to show that we have broad diverse opinion makers together and worked in the national interest.

What Minister Naledi Pandor was unable to complete was the following numbers that might still also be interesting: that general electric has invested R500 million in a customer in Aviation Centre Gauteng; that R200 million of that will be supporting South African SMMEs in technology transfer. The International Business Machines, IBM, is investing R700 million over the next 10 years in ICT research and development; Systems Integration Specialists Company, Sisco, R66 million, in R&D activities in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

These are just some examples of what we can do as South Africans if we actually work together and demonstrate that we are indeed open for business notwithstanding the difficulties that we have as South Africa, given the structural legacies that we have inherited. Minister Nkwinti reminds us that the company that was referred to in MalaMala is 30% owned by the local people and that in time they will own 100% of that company.

So, hon members, I need to arrange tea between hon Hill Lewis and hon Nkwinti so that they can, at least, get the facts right before we get into the debate. But, in summing up, let us say that all three of my colleagues from Cabinet have given a wonderful exposition of concrete projects producing concrete results that can actually measured and be seen by anybody who would be interested.

Secondly we have demonstrated that we have a forward-looking approach to inclusive growth and plans that we can begin to deliver if we bring and as we are bringing labour and business together. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Hon members, I don’t expect a leader in the name of the Chief Whip of the Opposition to be the one screaming, instead of making sure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

the members listen. Please we need assistance from you. Continue hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So, let me continue. What we require and we will continue to invest in as government and as the ANC is building common consensus among all South Africans not just to avoid a downgrade but to ensure that we grow adequately in order that we can upgrade South Africans job creation, etc. The key to all of this is the question of collaboration and to have the kind of mindset that will enable us to begin to challenge some of the trends that are actually developing.

So, hon Maynier, we are certainly not wrecking towards the downgrade. We are trying to turn that around and we hope that you will be bringing some good sense on your side of this Parliament so that they will also, at least, for a limited period of time say what are they going to do and say in the public domain to ensure that we can avoid the downgrade and instead turn our economic fortunes around. None of us wants to support rent-seekers let us make that absolutely clear. And we must do everything possible concretely because they also exist in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.] ... and they exist in your municipalities. So, let us find a way [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No! We will get back to your land deals, and so on in due course. And let me assure South Africans that scaremongering that we will end up like Venezuela is precisely that. It is scaremongering. We are miles away from Venezuela, we are a well-managed economy, a well-managed fiscus, and we are a resourceful organisation. [Applause.] And we will indeed ensure that we take South Africa forward to much better prospects than anyone else in this House can. Thank you very much Chair. [Applause.]

SIHLALO WENDLU (Kkz M G Boroto): Malunga ahloniphekileko, sifike ekugcineni ngomsebenzi wanamhlanje. Alo-ke ngithi kini, ngamakoro ngamakoro. iNdlu ayiphadlhalale. *(Translation of isiNdebele paragraph follows.)*

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, we have come to the end of today's business. Therefore, I am saying to you go home well. The House is adjourned.]

Debate Concluded.

The House adjourned at 19:07.

UNREVISED HANSARD

_____

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

ANNOUNCEMENTS

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

The Speaker and the Chairperson

1. Bills passed by Houses – to be submitted to President for assent

(1) Bill passed by National Council of Provinces on 26 May 2016:

(a) **Appropriation Bill** [B 3 – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 77).

(2) Bill passed by National Assembly on 26 May 2016:

(a) **Expropriation Bill** [B 4D – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 76).

National Assembly

The Speaker

UNREVISED HANSARD

1. Introduction of Bills

(1) **The Minister of Home Affairs**

(a) **Border Management Authority Bill** [B 9 - 2016] (National Assembly – proposed sec 75) [Explanatory summary of Bill and prior notice of its introduction published in ***Government Gazette*** No 39262 of 6 October 2015.]

Introduction and referral to the **Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs** of the National Assembly, as well as referral to the Joint Tagging Mechanism (JTM) for classification in terms of Joint Rule 160.

In terms of Joint Rule 154 written views on the classification of the Bill may be submitted to the JTM. The Bill may only be classified after the expiry of at least three parliamentary working days since introduction.

1. Membership of Committees

(a) The following members have been nominated by their parties to serve on the ***Ad Hoc Committee to nominate a person for appointment of Public Protector.***

<u>African National Congress</u>

UNREVISED HANSARD

Khoza, Ms M

Bongo, Mr BT

Masondo, Mr NA

Koornhof, Mr NJJ

Tseke, Ms GK

Mothapo, Mrs MRM

Maesela, Dr P [Alternate]

Democratic Alliance

Breytenbach, Adv G

Van Damme, Ms PT

Selfe, Mr J [Alternate]

Horn, Mr W [Alternate]

Economic Freedom Fighters

Malema, Mr JS

Inkatha Freedom Party

Msimang, Prof CT

UNREVISED HANSARD

African Christian Democratic Party

Swart, Mr SN

National Freedom Party

Mncwabe, Mr SC [Alternate]

(b) The following members have been nominated by their parties to serve on the ***Ad Hoc Committee on the Review of the Powers and Privileges Act***

African National Congress

Booi, Mr MS

Motshekga, Dr MS

Mokoto, Ms NR

Ntombela, Mr MLD

Kilian, Mrs JD

Tseli, Mr RM

Semenya, Ms MR [Alternate]

Democratic Alliance

UNREVISED HANSARD

Lotriet, Prof A

Mazzone, Ms N

Steenhuisen, Mr J [Alternate]

Waters, Mr M [Alternate]

Inkatha Freedom Party

Van der Merwe, Ms LL

Agang SA

Mahumapelo, Mr JMK

African Christian Democratic Party

Meshoe, Mr KRJ [Alternate]

National Freedom Party

Shelembe, Mr ML [Alternate]

UNREVISED HANSARD

TABLINGS

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

1. The Minister of Arts and Culture

(a) Revised Annual Performance Plan of the Ditsong Museums of South Africa for 2016 – 2017.

(b) Revised Annual Performance Plan of the Performing Arts Centre of the Free State for 2016/2017.

National Assembly

1. The Speaker

(a) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries*, as adopted by the House on 5 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries.**

UNREVISED HANSARD

(b) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Arts and Culture on Performance of Department of Arts and Culture for 2014-15 financial year*, as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Arts and Culture.**

(c) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Basic Education on Performance of Department of Basic Education for 2014-15 financial year*, as adopted by the House on 28 October 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Basic Education.**

(d) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs*, as adopted by the House on 29 October 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs.**

UNREVISED HANSARD

(e) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Defence and Military Veterans,* as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Defence and Military Veterans.**

(f) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Energy,* as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Energy.**

(g) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Health,* as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Health.**

(h) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Human Settlements on Performance of the Department of Human Settlements and its entities,* as adopted by the House on 28 October 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Human Settlements.**

UNREVISED HANSARD

(i) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services on Department of Correctional Services and related entities,* as adopted by the House on 3 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services.**

(j) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Labour,* as adopted by the House on 3 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Labour.**

(k) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Mineral Resources,* as adopted by the House on 29 October 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Mineral Resources.**

(l) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Police on South African Police Service, Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Police on Civilian Secretariat for Police* and *Budgetary Review and*

UNREVISED HANSARD

Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Police on Independent Police Investigative Directorate, as adopted by the House on 29 October 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Police.**

(m) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises*, as adopted by the House on 18 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises.**

(n) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration on Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation, Public Service Commission, National School of Government and Centre for Public Service Innovation* and *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration on Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation and National Youth Development Agency*, as adopted by the House on 5 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration.**

UNREVISED HANSARD

(o) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Rural Development and Land Reform*, as adopted by the House on 5 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Rural Development and Land Reform.**

(p) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Science and Technology on Performance of Department of Science and Technology for 2014-15 financial year*, as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Science and Technology.**

(q) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Small Business Development*, as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Small Business Development.**

(r) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Social Development on Performance of Department of Social Development and Entities for 2014-15 financial year*, as adopted by the House on 28 October 2015.

UNREVISED HANSARD

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Social Development.**

(s) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Sport and Recreation on Performance of Department of Sport and Recreation, Boxing South Africa and SA Institute for Drug-Free Sport for 2014-15 financial year,* as adopted by the House on 3 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Sport and Recreation.**

(t) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Telecommunications and Postal Services,* as adopted by the House on 17 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Telecommunications and Postal Services.**

(u) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Tourism,* as adopted by the House on 5 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Tourism.**

UNREVISED HANSARD

(v) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Transport*, as adopted by the House on 5 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Transport.**

(w) Reply from the Minister of Finance to recommendations in *Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation*, as adopted by the House on 18 November 2015.

Referred to **Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation.**

COMMITTEE REPORTS

National Assembly

Please see pages 9-205 of the ATCs.

UNREVISED HANSARD